Advances in English and American Studies: current developments, future trends

Editors:
Pilar Guerrero Medina
Macarena Palma Gutiérrez
María Valero Redondo
Advances in English and American Studies: current developments, future trends

Editors:
Pilar Guerrero Medina
Macarena Palma Gutiérrez
María Valero Redondo
16 x 23, 220 pp., il. color

Edit: UCOPress. Cordoba University Press, 2020
Campus Universitario de Rabanales
Ctra. Nacional IV, Km. 396. 14071 Córdoba
Tel.: 957 212165
www.uco.es/ucopress • ucopress@uco.es

Editors: Pilar Guerrero Medina
Macarena Palma Gutiérrez
María Valero Redondo

ISBN: 978-84-9927-546-8

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reproduced, translated, stored in any retrieval system, nor transmitted in any form without written permission from the publisher
## Table of Contents

Preface

### Part I. Literature and Cultural Studies

**Álvarez Sánchez, Patricia**  
Coetzee en Español y *Siete Cuentos Morales*  
9

**Jiménez-Beato, Marta**  
Spanish Comic Types in Restoration Drama: The Character of Don Bertran in John Corye’s *The Generous Enemies* (1672)  
13

**Jurado Bonilla, Mario**  
Pylon Pastoral: Nature without Secrets  
23

**Parrondo Carretero, Concepción**  
James Dickey’s *Deliverance* (1970): The Scary Side of Poor Whites  
31

**Ponciano, Regina M.**  
Loveable Monsters, Redeemable Men: The Lonely Voice of Oscar Wilde  
39

**Raigón-Hidalgo, M. Dolores**  
African Feminism in Ayesha Harruna Attah’s *Saturday’s Shadows*’ Female Characters  
49

**Richardson, Bill**  
Tradition as Freedom: Jorge Luis Borges and the Identity of Irish Writing  
57

**Serón Navas, Ariadna**  
“Mad People in the Attic?”: African Queer Bodies in the Short Stories of Chinelo Okparanta, Arinze Ifeakandu and Troy Onyango  
65
Zambrana Ramírez, Alberto
Bremón’s The Double Cuckold (1678) and Marmion’s A Fine Companion (1633): A Revision of the Literary Sources of Durfey’s Sir Barnaby Whigg (1681) ................................................. 83

Part II. Language and Linguistics

De-Dios-Flores, Iria
Interference in Sentence Processing: The Case of Negation ................................. 93

Diego-Rodríguez, Irene
Assigned Gender in Astrological Vocabulary: The Case of be planettes .................................................. 105

Fernández-Pena, Yolanda
Complex Collective Subjects in Inner-Circle World Englishes: Verb Number Variation and Quantifying Usage .......... 117

Lindade, Carlos
A Concise Analysis on How ELT Course Books Promote Teaching Pronunciation in Portuguese Public Schools .......... 131

López-Cousso, María José and Belén Méndez-Naya
Chances Are: Enlarging the Catalogue of Epistemic Adverbial Expressions in English .................................................. 137

Pettersson-Traba, Daniella
Modeling the Choice of Near-Synonyms in the Recent History of American English: The Case of Fragrant, Perfumed and Scented ................................. 149

Serrano-Losada, Mario
Analogization at Work: Evidential and Mirative as-Parentheticals with Raising Verbs in Late Modern English ................. 163

Tamaredo, Iván
Structural and System Complexity in Indian English, Singapore English and British English: The Case of Subject Pronoun Deletion .................................................. 175
Part III. Round Tables

Fresno Calleja, Paloma, Eva M. Pérez Rodríguez, Pilar Villar Argáiz and Miquel Pomar Amer
The Romantic Tourist Novel and the Commodification of the Exotic ................................................................. 191

Gallego Mar, Silvia Castro Borrego, Rocío Cobo Piñero, María Frías Rudolphi and María Platas Alonso
African and African American Women Writers: Between Violence and Healing ...................................................... 197

Guijarro González, Juan Ignacio, Amaia Ibarraran Bigalondo, Ángel Chaparro Sainz and Monika Madinabeitia Medrano
‘Go West, Young Prof!’: Teaching the ‘American West’ in Spanish Universities Today ........................................... 203

Lázaro Lafuente, Alberto, Montserrat Martínez Vázquez, Ignacio Palacios Martínez and Marian Amengual Pizarro
Up for Debate: English Tests in the Spanish University Entrance Exams .............................................................. 209

Monterrey, Tomás, Sonia Villegas-López and María José Coperías-Aguilar
A Comprehensive Approach to Restoration Prose Fiction ..................................................................................... 215
Preface

*Advances in English and American Studies: current developments, future trends* puts together twenty-two contributions which were originally delivered as papers and round tables at the 42nd conference of the *Spanish Association of Anglo-American Studies*, organized by the Department of English and German Studies at the University of Córdoba from 7 to 9 November, 2018.

Twenty-five years after the celebration of the 17th AEDEAN conference, the University of Córdoba had the opportunity of playing host to the annual conference of the Association for a second time. Organizing the 42nd AEDEAN conference in Córdoba, with more than three hundred participants, was a challenging but rewarding experience. We should like to acknowledge the invaluable assistance of the Executive Board of AEDEAN in the organization of the conference. We should also wish to express our sincere gratitude to the dean of the Faculty of Arts at the University of Córdoba and to our fellow organizers in the department. Our special thanks go to all the volunteer graduate and undergraduate students for their enthusiasm and hard work.

As in previous editions, the contents of this conference ebook reflect the wide variety of interests and areas of expertise which have made up the intellectual fabric of our annual meetings over the years. The volume is divided in three parts. Parts I and II constitute the main body of this ebook, gathering seventeen scholarly papers on the macroareas of *Literature and Cultural Studies* and *Language and Linguistics*. Part I brings together nine contributions focusing on literature, cultural studies and feminist studies. As a whole, these papers broach different themes and genres, ranging from the Restoration to the Postmodern period. More importantly, we would like to emphasize that these short academic papers not only put forward illuminating and fresh ideas, but also exemplify the most recent advances and current trends in academia.

The eight papers in Part II offer a variety of theoretical and applied approaches to the study of lexical, semantic, morphosyntactic, phonetic and sociolinguistic phenomena in English, incorporating insights from a
synchronic and/or diachronic perspective and offering in-depth analysis of some of the main varieties of English in so-called “inner-” and “outer-circle” World Englishes.

Finally, Part III endeavours to summarize the contents of five of the round tables presented at the AEDEAN conference in Córdoba, bringing to the fore some of the main trends and developments in the linguistic, cultural and literary fields of Anglo-American Studies in our country.

All in all, we believe that the contributions in this conference ebook are a representative sample of some of the most stimulating papers and round tables presented at the 42nd AEDEAN annual meeting in Córdoba.

We would like to take this opportunity to acknowledge the support and assistance of the panel coordinators and of the anonymous reviewers who evaluated the submitted proposals. Our special gratitude also goes to all the contributors to this volume. This project would have not been possible without their patience and expertise.

The editors
Part I

Literature and Cultural Studies
Coetzee en Español y Siete Cuentos Morales

PATRICIA ÁLVAREZ SÁNCHEZ
Universidad de Málaga
patriciaalvarezsanchez@gmail.com

Resumen
En los últimos años, Coetzee ha declarado desear alejarse de la visión anglosajona del mundo y ha publicado su última obra, Siete Cuentos Morales (2018), en español primero. Además, casi simultáneamente, nos ha permitido visitar una exposición de fotografías que tomó cuando era un adolescente. A pesar de los más de 60 años de diferencia entre la exposición y Siete Cuentos Morales, ambas muestran similitudes temáticas, sobre todo en su interés por la otredad, que en este caso se hace más evidente en su defensa por los derechos de los animales. En esta línea argumentativa, también es importante mencionar que Coetzee no sólo se interesa por la visión que ofrece un mundo que utiliza el español para comunicarse, sino también por algunos de los autores con los que nos ha obsequiado la lengua española.

Palabras clave: Coetzee, derechos de los animales, fotografía, otredad, Siete Cuentos Morales.

Abstract
In the past years Coetzee has declared that he would like to distance himself from the Anglo-Saxon vision of the world and has published his latest work, Siete Cuentos Morales (2018), in Spanish first. Moreover, he has allowed us to visit an exhibition with the photographs that he took when he was a teenager. Although more than 60 years have passed between the photographs and his collection of essays, they both show similarities, especially in his interest in otherness. This becomes more evident in his defence of animal rights. Therefore, it is important to mention that he is not only interested in the vision offered by a world that uses Spanish to communicate, but also by some of the authors which has given us the Spanish language.

Keywords: Animal Rights, Coetzee, Otherness, Photography, Siete Cuentos Morales.
1. **Introducción: Coetzee en español**

J.M. Coetzee se ha convertido, indiscutiblemente, en uno de los autores más ilustres de la literatura contemporánea en inglés. Difícilmente etiquetable y, sin embargo, partícipe de varios movimientos culturales y sociales de las últimas décadas, sus obras tempranas nos ayudan a comprender la caleidoscópica sociedad de Sudáfrica. Además, el conjunto de su narrativa trasciende las fronteras de su país natal y nos brinda la posibilidad de adentrarnos en el enmarañado laberinto de la naturaleza humana. Nos ofrece también un sutil dibujo de diferentes jerarquías de poder y de su abuso; de hecho, su obra muestra una constante búsqueda de relaciones recíprocas—y de formas de expresión fuera de un lenguaje que persevera esas jerarquías—y, al mismo tiempo, la compagina con ilustraciones de asombrosas formas de resistencia ante todo tipo de debacles. Seguramente, el mejor ejemplo de resistencia sea su personaje Michael K en *Life & Times of Michael K* (1983), quien se convierte en jardinero al parapetarse en una granja abandonada para evitar su participación en una guerra civil y encuentra así su felicidad, aislado de un mundo que pretende apropiarse de él. Con este y otros ejemplos, Coetzee dibuja una aspiración ética en la que el alma del ser humano, aunque en ocasiones oscura, nos deja vislumbrar cierta esperanza si somos capaces de esbozar una sociedad alejada de la dialéctica hegeliana y el racionalismo cartesiano. En este universo narrativo, el amor, la compasión y el respeto en todas sus variantes—hacia los seres humanos, los animales y la naturaleza—ocupan un espacio muy relevante porque es la única forma de acercarse al Otro en términos levinasianos, aunque la crítica se haya enfocado más en analizar el desarraigo, el aislamiento y la soledad de sus personajes, imbricados en sociedades desiguales por excelencia.

En los últimos años, Coetzee nos ha sorprendido acercándose de varias maneras al mundo hispanohablante. Por una parte, declarando reiteradamente desear alejarse de la visión anglosajona del mundo en varias entrevistas (por ejemplo, Constantini 2018) y escogiendo el español para la publicación de *Siete Cuentos Morales* (2018), la primera obra que ha promocionado presencialmente en España;1 por otra parte, orientándose hacia autores hispanohablantes y haciéndose eco de sus obras en las suyas propias. Así, sus dos últimas novelas, *The Childhood of Jesus* (2013) y *The Schooldays of Jesus* (2016)—relatos profun-

---

1 De hecho, un año después de su publicación, la edición en inglés aún no ha salido a la luz.
adamente filosóficos que narran el periplo de una familia creada en torno a un extraordinario niño en un mundo donde se habla español—destacan también por ser un homenaje a la novela española moderna y polifónica universalmente conocida: *Don Quijote de la Mancha.* Desde 2014, Coetzee ha publicado en Argentina, también en español, introducciones de las obras que más le han influido, reunidas bajo el título de *Biblioteca Personal.* El último de los doce volúmenes, y quizás el más intimista, lleva por título *51 poetas. Antología íntima* (2017). En él se incluyen poemas de Rafael Alberti, Jorge Luis Borges, Federico García Lorca y Pablo Neruda.

Por otra parte, también en los últimos años sigue ahondando en sus argumentos en la exploración del Otro de diferentes formas; de hecho, quizás el tema que ha ido ganando más importancia en sus escritos es la defensa de una vida digna para los animales. Curiosamente, ya en 2007 publicó en una revista murciana un elogio a *Platero y yo* de Juan Ramón Jiménez, aunque este haya pasado inadvertido por la crítica. En «Platero y yo» Coetzee analiza la relación de igualdad entre un hombre y un burro al que este adora, y del que no se considera dueño:

> Platero adquiere existencia como un individuo—como un personaje, en realidad—con una vida y un mundo de experiencia propio en el momento en que el hombre al que llamo a la ligera su amo, el loco, ve que Platero lo ve, y en el acto de verse lo reconoce como un igual.

Explica también que Jiménez no intenta humanizar al burro—es decir, no trata de hacer que se parezca al ser humano como medida de todas las cosas—, sino que admira su hermosura tal y como es.

---

2 Se acaba de publicar *La muerte de Jesús,* también en español, en algunos países de Hispanoamérica. En España podemos comprar la tercera parte de la saga a partir de finales de mayo 2019.

3 No es la primera vez que la influencia cervantina es latente en las novelas de Coetzee (ver “J.M. Coetzee’s *In the Heart of the Country:* Is Magda a New Don Quixote?” y “The Limits of Reason in J.M. Coetzee’s *The Schooldays of Jesus*” de Patricia Álvarez Sánchez).

4 Hay un guiño a Alberti en *The Schooldays of Jesus* al hacerse eco de un verso de este poeta gaditano: “*Las estrellas errantes, niños que ignoran la aritmética*” (97).

2. **Siete Cuentos Morales**

Su última publicación en España por el momento, *Siete Cuentos Morales*, es un inventario de complejos ensayos de carácter filosófico en los que Coetzee aborda diferentes temas. Narrados con un vocabulario y sintaxis aparentemente sencillos, demuestran, sin embargo, estar prolijamente examinados y escogidos. Su prosa es sobria, concisa, rigurosa, y está desprovista de artificios estilísticos, un lenguaje al que ya nos tiene acostumbrados Coetzee, y que la traductora argentina, Elena Marengo, sabe recrear con precisión. Las narraciones se centran, entre muchos otros, en dos temas: su interés por la otredad—Coetzee continúa con su ya conocida y ferviente defensa de los derechos de los animales—and las particularidades de las relaciones familiares fallidas, que atraviesan cinco de estos relatos, en este caso entre progenitora y descendientes. Estas son también un tema que aparece en toda la obra coetziana en diferentes dimensiones de fracaso y éxito; se trata de los vínculos más básicos e íntimos de los seres humanos y son las primeras pequeñas partes del complejo puzzle que formamos en las sociedades. Mientras que su hijo John se siente como un niño pequeño a su lado cuando explica «Dentro de ciertos límites, la madre puede criticarlo y él se limitará a bajar la cabeza aunque la crítica sea injusta» (74), la propia Costello reflexiona: «¿Las familias, las familias felices, se mantienen unidas gracias a un repertorio de juegos que se juegan con una máscara en la cara?» (53).

---

6 Debemos señalar que la edición cuenta con algunos términos propios del español de Argentina («empacar» por hacer las maletas, «departamento» por apartamento, etc.) y con un estilo de puntuación poco convencional en algunos fragmentos que, sin embargo, sea quizás reflejo de la obra original del autor.

7 Por una parte, existen numerosas relaciones materno y paterno filiales fallidas en sus argumentos. Por mencionar dos ejemplos, Magda en *In the Heart of the Country* (1977) es descrita como una mujer desabrida precisamente por la carencia de amor paternal, que ella busca desesperadamente, y la Sra. Curren debe pasar los últimos días de su vida alejada de su hija, que abandonó Sudáfrica y creó una familia en EE.UU en *Age of Iron* (1990). Sin embargo, existen también ejemplos de amor desinteresado en los momentos más difíciles: Michael K se entrega en cuerpo y alma a cuidar de su madre cuando esta enferma en *Life & Times* y Dostoyevsky se traslada a San Petersburgo para esclarecer las extrañas circunstancias de la muerte de su hijastro Pavel en *The Master of Petersburg* (1994), poniendo en peligro su propia vida.
Las lecciones morales ya se iniciaron, al menos en parte, en su novela *Elizabeth Costello: Eight Lessons* (2003), donde su protagonista homónima, escritora y profesora universitaria, establece una brutal comparación entre los campos de exterminio nazi y la industria cárnica. Este paralelismo que ella razona con todo lujo de detalle no está falto de polémica y le resulta ofensivo a parte del público al que se dirige Costello en una de sus charlas, pero básicamente se justifica al establecer supremacías de unos seres sobre otros, algo cuyas consecuencias Coetzee lleva visibilizando en sus escritos durante décadas. De hecho, varios críticos apuntan que la Sra. Costello está aquí hablando por Coetzee (por ejemplo: Dawn y Singer 2010, 110 y Aaltola 2010, 120).

Costello es la protagonista de la mayoría de los relatos y también una ferviente protectora de los animales. Reaparece con la misma voz discordante y firme, pero esta vez se trata también de la dicción de una mujer anciana, achacosa y al borde de la senilidad. Se ha convertido en una defensora de causas perdidas y parece que su propósito es desconcertar a sus hijos—que no atinan a comprender sus intenciones—y desatender sus súplicas de que se mude a vivir a un lugar donde puedan ocuparse de ella. Los tres se encuentran, como ella dice, «en ese mismo bote que se llama vida, a la deriva, sin ilusiones salvadoras en un mar de diferente oscuridad» (57). Sin embargo, ante su petición de que les permita ocuparse de ella en sus últimos días, ella contesta que tiene otro cometido: «Me estoy acostumbrando a vivir en compañía de seres cuyo modo de ser es diferente del mío, más diferente de lo que el intelecto humano podrá comprender jamás.» (72–73)

Por otra parte, apenas unos meses antes de la publicación de *Siete Cuentos*, hemos sido testigos de la primera exposición de las imágenes inéditas que el propio Coetzee tomó cuando contaba con 15 y 16 años—entre 1955 y 56—, y que se exhibieron en la Galería Irma Stern (Ciudad del Cabo, Sudáfrica) entre finales del 2017 y principios del 2018. La singular exhibición, comisariada por Hermann Wittenberg y Farzanah Badsha, ha seguido su camino itinerante ha-

---

8 Esta idea aparece también en la obra de Isaac Bashevis Singer.
9 Coetzee visibiliza el sufrimiento animal en prácticamente todas sus novelas. Por ejemplo en *Diary of a Bad Year* describe la cocina como “a place where, after the murders, the bodies of the dead are brought to be done up (disguised) before they are devoured” (63).
10 Su nombre no aparece en los dos primeros relatos, a pesar de que son protagonizados también por mujeres jóvenes que podrían ser ella misma en otras épocas de su vida.
cia otras ciudades del mundo y muestra los intereses del autor y la época en la que creció, tal y como este narra en sus dos primeras biografías ficcionalizadas *Boyhood* (1997) y *Youth* (2002). Estas fotografías resultan relevantes porque nos permiten descubrir una posible arquitectura del pasado coetziano pero, sobre todo, porque desvelan que la semilla de estos temas que Coetzee sigue tratando hoy, también en *Siete Cuentos Morales*, estaban ya presentes en su juventud. Así, ilustran su despertar ético al mostrar relaciones de poder y servilismo, un tema que Coetzee ha analizado de forma brillante. Recordemos que Sudáfrica era un país en el que entre 1948 y 1992 se asignaba a las personas su lugar en el mundo por el color de la piel, que era decidido no solo a simple vista, sino tras pasar por una serie de pruebas poco válidas que fijaban legalmente la raza de una persona. Algunas de las imágenes capturan a dos de los empleados de su familia paterna, Ros y Freek, ignorantes de la cámara e inmersos en sus propios pensamientos, e iluminan el interés y quizás la fascinación de Coetzee por las personas con las que no podía establecer relaciones recíprocas y por sus vidas.

En esta imagen (Fig. 1), una de las más bellas de la exposición, Ros y Freek ocupan la parte central de la fotografía y parecen mirarse. Mientras que la sociedad del apartheid los deja al margen de sus prioridades y los ignora como seres humanos, Coetzee los fotografía en el centro de su composición y antepuestos a los niños de su propia familia, privilegiados de la época. El negro
de sus trajes y piel es un bello contraste con el blanco de la arena de la playa de Strandfontein en Ciudad del Cabo. Así, la exposición no sólo arroja luz sobre el momento en que se tomaron las fotos y sus intereses personales, sino que marca una época en la que Coetzee comienza a definirse como artista, e ilustra, además, su preocupación por las desigualdades.

Así, es revelador que otra de las fotografías que Wittenberg recuperó para la exposición, aunque esta no haya sido aún exhibida al público, nos muestre a su perro Tuppy subido a una escalera desde una original perspectiva (Fig. 2). El plano contrapicado hace que el perro cobre estatura e importancia, y nos obliga a observarlo como seguramente él observaría a los humanos en la mayoría de las ocasiones, desde abajo; la imagen se convierte en un ejemplo de deconstrucción muy sencillo.

![Fig. 2: J.M. Coetzee](image)

Para situar a los animales y sus necesidades en el centro de su argumentación, Costello, que ni atiende a razones ni es una mujer de razón, nos ofrece

---

11 Todas las fotografías han sido puestas a nuestra disposición por Wittenberg, quien nos concedió una entrevista con motivo de su exposición en 2018.
varios ejemplos en los que arremete contra el pensamiento racional cartesiano a partir del cual—como ella nos recuerda refiriéndose a Descartes—los animales son entendidos como seres desprovistos de alma e incapaces de sufrimiento y siguiendo a Heidegger, tampoco están provistos de conciencia. Parapetada en una aldea de la meseta castellana en España—seguramente no es baladí que Coetzee se sirva del escenario cervantino por antonomasia—, la quijotesca Elizabeth Costello ha decidido compartir su casa con Pablo, un hombre exhibicionista y perturbado, y un puñado de gatos, que parecen haber invadido su casa.12 Mediante locuaces diálogos con sus dos hijos—Helen y John—, la Sra. Costello nos adentra en un laberinto filosófico sobre la belleza, la muerte, la verdad y las relaciones familiares y, sobre todo, la otredad.

3. Conclusión

*Siete Cuentos Morales* es un diálogo sobre cuestiones epistemológicas complejas y una crítica a la forma en la que nos relacionamos con los animales y con otros seres humanos, especialmente aquellos que pertenecen a nuestras familias, temas que ya se estaban fraguando durante su adolescencia, como muestra la exposición de sus fotografías de la época. De esta manera, podemos seguir enmarcando esta obra en el conjunto coetziano que critica las relaciones de poder, pero, junto con sus últimas novelas, *Siete Cuentos Morales* muestra también un cambio significativo. Mientras que sus primeras novelas ilustran las despiadadas consecuencias de las desigualdades entre los seres humanos—muerte, violaciones, hambruna, soledad, etc.—sus dos últimas novelas y *Siete Cuentos Morales* se trasladan a escenarios que nos recuerdan a *Don Quijote* y nos transportan a argumentos donde no parece existir tal violencia. En *Siete Cuentos*, Coetzee presenta a un hijo y una hija que se unen por el supuesto bienestar de su madre. Sin embargo, sigue mostrándonos, sutilmente, que la violencia es parte de nuestras vidas en nuestra insistencia por decidir por otras personas, incluso cuando las amamos; también al entender que los animales son mercancía de la que podemos disponer. En ambos casos desestimamos la voz de esas personas y

12 La similitud con el argumento de *Age of Iron* (1990), donde la profesora Elizabeth Curren da cobijo a un singular vagabundo y a su perro, es innegable.
animales, seguimos enfocándolos con una lente que los posiciona al margen de una posible composición fotográfica.

REFERENCIAS


—. 2018. «Las literaturas del sur». Entrevista con Soledad Constantini. [Consultado online el 12 mayo 2019].


Spanish Comic Types in Restoration Drama:
The Character of Don Bertran in John Corye’s
The Generous Enemies (1672)

Marta Jiménez-Beato
Universidad de Sevilla
mjimenez43@us.es

Abstract
Although the influence of Spanish Golden Age theatre on Restoration drama has been discussed at length in studies like those by Loftis (1973) and Braga Riera (2009), the adaptation of specific characters like the figurón has not received much attention. The figurón, a flamboyant and ridiculous type, flourished in seventeenth and eighteenth-century Spanish comedies known as Comedias de Figurón, and it is used to point out and criticise human defects and also the negative aspects of the society of the time.

The starting point of the analysis is Rojas Zorrilla’s figurón Don Lucas in Entre Bobos Anda el Juego (1645), which was the source for Thomas Corneille’s Don Bertran in Don Bertran de Cigarral (1652), in turn adapted for the Restoration stage as Don Fernando Bertran in John Corye’s The Generous Enemies (1672).

Keywords: Restoration drama, figurón, adaptation, Siglo de Oro.

1. Introduction

The extraordinary success of Tuke’s The Adventures of Five Hours (1663), based on Coello’s Los empeños de seis horas (1657), inaugurated the vogue for Spanish intrigue plots and plays. The influence of the “Spanish Comedia” on Restoration drama has been discussed at length in studies like those by Loftis (1973) and Braga Riera (2009). There are also analyses of specific playwrights and their use of Spanish sources, such as Hogan’s study about Aphra Behn’s work (1995). However, the adaptation of specific character-types like the figurón has not been given much attention. This paper will focus on a comedy by John Corye, The Generous Enemies (1672), that introduces a character based on the Spanish figurón via its French adaptation.
The source of Corye’s Don Fernando Bertran in *The Generous Enemies* (1672) was Thomas Corneille’s *Don Bertran de Cigarral* (1652), which was in turn adapted directly from Francisco de Rojas Zorrilla’s *Entre Bobos Anda el Juego* (1645). The present paper will comparatively analyse the *figurón* character in each case: Don Lucas in Rojas Zorrilla’s play, Don Bertran in Corneille’s version, and Don Fernando Bertran in Corye’s adaptation.

The reopening of theatres in 1660 caused dramatists to draw plots and characters from older plays from their own literary tradition, but also from abroad. Adaptation of Spanish literature occurred not only in the seventeenth-century but in the Renaissance too. Fuchs theorises about the reason why English writers directed their attention to Spanish letters during the Jacobean and Elizabethan periods, claiming that “the development of the various vernaculars produced great anxiety about the belatedness and relative poverty of each language in relation to both classical models and contemporary rivals” (Fuchs 2013, 13). Nicoll establishes four schools of comic invention that the Restoration inherited from Elizabethan and Jacobean sources, one of them being “the school of Spanish intrigue” (Nicoll 1952, 94). Avery and Scouten claim that “it was neither the comedy of manners nor even the rimed heroic drama that emerged first” but the “Spanish romance” (Avery and Scouten 1965, cxx-iii). Many of the Spanish themes and characters which were borrowed during this period were taken, in turn, via their French adaptations. Chasles described seventeenth-century France as a “France espagnole,” attesting to the immense popularity of Spanish literature during the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries (Rogers 1926, 205). Moreover, this coincided with Charles II’s exile in France and the Netherlands, where he became acquainted with Spanish drama enough to eventually recommend *Los Empeños de Seis Horas* to Tuke and *No Puede Ser* (1661) to John Crowne (Loftis 1973, 33).

### 2. The *figurón* comic type

A complete definition of the term *comedia de figurón* is presented in Olga Fernández’s thesis *La Comedia de Figurón de los Siglos XVII y XVIII*:

_Género de comedia popular humorística satírica [...] protagonizada por un personaje ridículo, tanto por su aspecto como por su psicología, por medio del cual se critican defectos humanos y comportamientos sociales negativos [...]. Dicho personaje es el soporte fundamental de la comidicidad de la obra._ (2003, 40)
Three key elements of the *figurón* type can be extracted: humour, satire, and criticism. Satire and criticism were directed towards the nobility or towards a human defect usually tied to that part of society. *Figurones* belong to the nobility just because they have money, not because they inherited a title. The playwright exaggerates the vices of the *figurón* to morally destroy those tied to a specific social stratum.

Arellano defines the type of the *figurón* as “*un noble provinciano, representante de valores arcaicos, faltó de ingenio y lleno de defectos cómicos,*” which resonates with the *figurón* Don Lucas’ description of himself: “*No soy nada caballero / de ciudad; soy cortesano*” (Arellano 1995, 139; Rojas Zorrilla 1998, 31805–06). Thus, the protagonist is not a court nobleman, he is not fashionable although he endeavours to, which makes him even more comical. His goal is to climb the social ladder through a marriage with a lady from Madrid, which he intends to secure with his money. As expected, the marriage does not take place due to the protagonist’s extreme self-confidence and his lack of refined manners. *Figurones* resemble closely the character of the fop or coxcomb in Restoration comedy; a presumptuous and ridiculous type.

3. **Analysis of the corpus**

Both the original and the French adaptation follow the same plot: in Toledo lives a rich but greedy *figurón*, Don Lucas de Cigarral, who has secured (almost bought) himself a bride, Doña Isabel. She is in love with another man, Don Pedro, but because she is poor, she has to obey her father’s command to marry Don Lucas. Don Lucas sends his impoverished cousin Don Pedro to Madrid on his behalf, unaware that he is secretly in love with Doña Isabel too. All the characters stay in an inn before Don Lucas and Doña Isabel’s wedding, where the two young lovers, aided by the *gracioso* Cabellera, find a solution to stop the wedding. Upon finding out the truth about Don Pedro and Doña Isabel, Don Lucas, blinded by jealousy, forces them to marry and endure their poverty together.

In a conversation he has with Doña Isabel, Cabellera explains Don Lucas’ alleged family name, which of course has not been inherited but bought. The fact that Don Lucas owns a *cigarral* or country house (which only rich people could afford) perfectly ties him to the type of the *figurón* who, despite being wealthy, clashes with cosmopolitan Madrid because of his provincial roots. Ca-
bellera’s lengthy description of Don Lucas presents him as a hideous person; he is ugly, he snores and drinks, he does not have a pleasant character, and he is very greedy despite being rich.

Figurones are easy to deceive due to their excessive self-confidence, which is ultimately derived from their self-delusion. An example of this occurs when Doña Isabel answers a rude comment Don Lucas has made about her: “La fama que vos tenéis, / por ser quien sois, os aclama” (Rojas Zorrilla 1998, 1715–16). She is referring to Caballera’s description of him, but Don Lucas thinks that she is praising him.

Golden Age comedy was tightly tethered to the concept of honour, and even though the figurón is portrayed as an anti-gallant, he has a strong sense of honour and will take measures if he is cheated (MacCurdy 1983, 896). Rightly so, when he finds out that Doña Isabel and Don Pedro are in love, Don Lucas assures them that he will not kill them for that would be too kind; instead, he wants them to get married. Don Lucas knows that they are both very poor, so this is enough revenge for him.

As stated above, in 1652, Thomas Corneille adapted the play in the French stage as Don Bertran de Cigarral. The French dramatist adopts most of the aspects of the original play, and his main contribution is the age of the protagonist. Guzman, like Cabellera, gives a detailed description of his master to his betrothed Isabelle. He describes Don Bertran as a gallant of the time, a brave young man of sixty. The fact that he is sixty allows for several jokes about the ailments of old age in the play.

Don Lucas’ heritage in Entre Bobos was fictional. The French version eliminates this and creates a new background for the character: he becomes a nobleman by blood.

As in the original, Don Bertran presents a list of his many attributes (which contrasts with Guzman’s previous description of him), one of them being courage. This of course is refuted by the several episodes where Don Bertran gets into trouble with some of the characters.

At the end of the comedy, Don Bertran’s actions portray him as crueler and bitterer than Don Lucas in the original. The threat to the two young lovers is an exact translation of the one in the Spanish comedia. This time, however, the protagonist’s wrath is also aimed at his sister Léonor, which does not occur in the original. After delivering his revenge speech, Léonor informs her brother that she does not see this as a true punishment. Don Bertran, furious as he was
after the humiliation, forbids his sister from marrying anyone, so that she dies a spinster.

In 1672, two decades after Corneille’s comedy was staged and three after _Entre Bobos_ premiered, Corye produced a play called _The Generous Enemies: or The Ridiculous Lovers_. Corye’s work was defined as “one entire piece of plagiarism from beginning to end; the principal design being borrowed from Quinault’s _La Généreuse Ingratitude_; and that of _The Ridiculous Lovers_ from Corneille’s _Don Bertram de Ciganal [sic]_” (Baker et al. 1812, 259–60).

Thus, _The Generous Enemies_ does not have much in common with _Entre Bobos_ or _Don Bertran de Cigarral_, only the main comic character. In the English adaptation, Don Fernando Bertran de Cigarral is not the leading figure and he is presented in the _dramatis personae_ as “An humorous old man.” Corye’s adaptation changed the name of Don Bertran to Don Fernando Bertran, which means that the playwright considered Bertran his surname. Therefore, Corye deemed “de Cigarral” to be the name of the place where the character comes from, similar to Corneille’s version where it became his title, thus separating it from the original piece.

Don Bertran is far from being the leading character and has been downgraded to a secondary role. _Entre Bobos_ and _Don Bertran de Cigarral_ hinge upon this one _figurón_ type, around which the main plot and comic scenes are built. Corye’s adaptation has a main plot which concerns many young characters and their love interests; Don Bertran is thus inserted there as an obstacle for the lovers, but he does not pose a serious threat like Don Lucas did.

There are few additions in Corye’s adaptation of Don Bertran, and the dialogues concerning this figure could be considered a direct translation of the French play (assuming Corye did not have access to the Spanish original). Don Bertran’s actions and features reflect those of the Spanish comedy and its French version, for instance his wealth and greediness.

As in the original piece and in Corneille’s adaptation, Sancho’s description of his master is very revealing of his disagreeable character. Don Bertran is “a Gallant of the times” who, however, “shall drink, eat, swear, talk and take / Tobaccho with e’re a man in Sivell” (Corye 1672, 1.11). At the age of sixty, he has known no woman but his house-keeper, and he suffers from many ailments.

In Act 3, Alleria calls Don Bertran a “Phantastick,” a person “who has fanciful ideas or indulges in wild notions” (OED _fantastic_ n. 1). This is the
essence of the *figurón*, as portrayed in *Entre Bobos*. Right before meeting his intended wife, Don Bertran nervously asks his servants if he looks good in his frill, not fashionable for the time. Just as *figurones* were country men too old-fashioned for the court where they wanted to fit, old Don Bertran is too passé for society in general.

Corye uses almost an exact translation of Don Bertran’s list of skills and virtues, present both in the original and in Corneille’s version. And so, the English *figurón* claims to be brave like his counterparts. This, of course, is another exaggeration. It is true that Don Bertran is more violent and rude than his predecessors, as can be seen in the passage where he thinks that there is a man in Alleria’s room: “if you ‘scape Me, / the Devil’s in’t; I will dispeople all the earth, / And drown the World in blood but I will find him” (Corye 1672, 3.33). However, when faced with the prospect of a real fight, he gets scared. One aspect which changes drastically from the original and the French sources and is present not only in the character of Don Bertran, is the rude and coarse humour. Coarse and sexual remarks have no place in Golden Age theatre, whereas in Restoration comedy they were in vogue.

One of Alleria’s suitors, Don Alvarez, takes it upon himself to rid her of Don Bertran. He swears, insults him, and kicks his servants. Thus, Don Bertran decides that he will withdraw his marriage proposal on one condition: “You pay my expences hither; nay, ‘tis not much, / But I would not be laught at in my own Countrey, / For losing my labour, and my money too” (Corye 1672, 4.57). He does not mention revenge, he only wants to get his money back and leave as soon as possible. So Don Lucas’ sense of honour and revenge were softened in the English version, even though they were present in the French adaptation.

A gradual anglicisation of Spanish plots unfolded throughout the first decades of the Restoration, as proven, for instance, by the journey of Tarugo from *No puede ser* (1661) in *Tarugo’s Wiles* (1667) and, later on, in *Sir Courtly Nice* (1685). Late seventeenth-century English playwrights leave some of the features of Spanish comedy aside (such as the obsession with honour and propriety), which prevailed in the adaptations made during the first decade of the period (Braga Riera 2009, 318–19). Corye seemed to be aware that the humorousness of the *figurón* type lay in the exaltation of one or more human faults, thus Lucas and the English Don Bertran share the same vice: greed. Perhaps Corye’s version of the *figurón* has a less moralising purpose because he is only
part of a small section of the plot. He does not pose a real threat to the young lovers, as proven by how fast and easily he gets out of the engagement. He is not as oblivious as his counterparts to the other characters’ comments, although that might be because the sharp remarks are much more direct than the ones in the original, which makes it more difficult to overlook them. Even though his role as suitor is amusing for the audience, he is no longer the originator of the lovers’ misfortune, or a serious obstacle they must overcome. Overall, the English rendition of the character downplayed the key importance of his role.

REFERENCES


**Pylon Pastoral: Nature without Secrets**

**Mario Jurado Bonilla**

Universidad de Córdoba
mjubo500@gmail.com

**Abstract**

The same motif can offer diverging interpretations and may stand for almost antithetical meanings in different poets. In the first decades of the 20th century, the references to the then novelty of telephone poles and of pylons—steel towers supporting electrical wires—were frequent in poems dealing with changes in the countryside, exposing therefore, as an unavoidable supplementary theme, the poet’s idea of tradition and nature. We find examples in poems by Robert Frost (as in “An Encounter”) and in poems of British poets such as W. H. Auden, Louis MacNeice, C. Day Lewis and Stephen Spender. Spender is the author of the well-known poem “The Pylons,” which baptized this group in the 1930s as Pylon-pastoral poets. This paper intends to contrast different representations of the motif of pylons and to draw conclusions about the concepts of nature and of pastoral that underlie them.

**Keywords:** nature poetry, pastoral, landscape, Robert Frost, Stephen Spender.

Let’s consider, to start, the lyrics of the jazz standard “Moonlight in Vermont” (Blackburn 1944):

- Pennies in a stream
- Fallen leaves of sycamore
- Moonlight in Vermont

- Icy finger waves
- Ski trails on a mountain side
- Snow light in Vermont

- Telephone cables
- Sing down the highway
Travel each bend in the road
People who meet in this romantic setting
Are so hypnotized by the lovely

Evening summer breeze
Warbling of a meadow lark
Moonlight in Vermont.

This song, popularized by Frank Sinatra and Ella Fitzgerald, is unusual in his lack of rhyme and the use of haikus for each of its verses. But there is another element that can be considered unusual: in the context of natural elements such as sycamores, streams and larks, we find the man-made telegraph cables. They are, true, musically inserted in the context, since they “sing down the highway”, and visually, they could evoke the lines of a pentagram, and so come to represent the background rhythmical pattern of the whole scene. Still, the fact that that they are counted among the lovely elements of Vermont landscape is startling. The purpose of this paper is precisely to explore that perplexing encounter of industrial and technological objects in the natural context offered by pastoral poems, and the contrasts and possible coalescence ensuing from such bumping. We will focus mainly on examples taken from Stephen Spender, British poet from the Auden Group, and the American poet Robert Frost. Let’s start with America.

In *The Machine and the Garden* ([1964]2000), Leo Marx offers an analysis of how the pastoral ideal influences the “interpretation of the American experience” ([1964]2000). Marx argues that the idea of a new land, with new landscapes of sublime proportions is basic for the American identity; America comes in this way to represent natural fertility and it detaches itself from the image of the limited and over-ploughed land of Europe. In the early 19th century, the variety of American landscape ran a wide gamut from the sublime and picturesque scenery, as represented in the paintings of Thomas Cole, to rural country states, oftentimes including Palladio-style houses, like Thomas Jefferson’s Monticello, near Charlottesville (Virginia). Both landscape extremes, the Romantic and the classical, represented for their admirers and cultivators the possibilities of the American land, or, rather, the American land as pure possibility. Therefore, the Romantic ideal of an untamable nature and the classical rural ideal can both find a new limitless realization. Leo Marx argues that in these idyllic images of American nature are disrupted by the appearance of ma-
chines. The main machine here is the train. Leo Marx mentions the irruption of the locomotive in a nature-description text by Hawthorne, how its whistle played havoc with the conventional fantasy of “the pleasures of withdrawal from the world” (Marx [1964] 2000) entertained by the author.

The openness of America as a project is so vast that it can even lodge this technological irruption. Alberto Santamaría argues that such bursting into the landscape gives way to the idea of a distinctive American nature, one in which technology cooperates to realize the sublime ideal (2005, 130). Thus, Emerson, in his essay, “The poet” mentions the train in a different light from Hawthorne’s (Emerson [1844] 2016):

> Readers of poetry see the factory-village, and the railway, and fancy that the poetry of the landscape is broken up by these; for these works of art are not yet consecrated in their readings; but the poet sees them fall within the great Order not less than the bee-hive, or the spider’s geometrical web. Nature adopts them very fast into her vital circles, and the gliding train of cars she loves like her own.

As Emerson says in the same essay, “The poet is the sayer, the namer, and represents beauty”. This means that the poet, the artist, is the one that can expand and transform our idea of beauty, and therefore of natural beauty. Walt Whitman, certainly, was a kind of American poet. Robert Frost was another kind: also every bit a sayer and a namer, but with something else to say. As Harold Bloom explains, “The darker Emersonian essays—‘Experience,’ ‘Power,’ ‘Circles,’ ‘Fate,’ ‘Illusions’—read like manifestos for Frost’s poetry” (2003, 2). Frost avoids the modern traces of the technology of his own lifetime; if they are treated, it is never to sing their praises. Let’s see how Frost deals with the telegraph poles, the same ones that the song “Moonlight in Vermont” naturalizes. The poem is “An Encounter” (Frost 2013, 125):

> Once on the kind of day called “weather breeder,”
> When the heat slowly hazes and the sun
> But its own power seems to be undone,
> I was half boring through, half climbing through
> A swamp of cedar. Choked with oil of cedar
> And scurf of plants, and weary and over-heated,
> And sorry I ever left the road I knew,
> I paused and rested on a sort of hook
> That had me by the coat as good as seated,
And since there was no other way to look,
Looked up toward heaven, and there against the blue,
Stood over me a resurrected tree,
A tree that had been down and raised again—
A barkless spectre. He had halted too,
AS if for fear of treading upon me.
I saw the strange position of his hands—
Up at his shoulders, dragging yellow strands
Of wire with something in it from men to men.
“You here?” I said. “Where aren’t you nowadays
And what’s the news you carry—if you know?
And tell me where you’re off for—Montreal?
Me? I’m not off for anywhere at all.
Sometimes I wander out of beaten ways
Half looking for the orchid Calypso.

This poem appeared in *Mountain Interval* (1916), the collection that opens with the famous poem “The Road not Taken”, and the themes of wandering and wondering are also present in this one. Out of the predictable and known paths, it is where encounters may happen; the one concerning this poem is between the poet’s persona and a telegraph or telephone pole; the meeting is uneventful, as fitting the pastoral mode, but the beginning of the poem, as usual in Frost, presents the anecdote in a brilliantly demotic, narrative way. The ensuing conversation is one-sided, carried out by the poet, who addresses his questions and responses to the telegraph pole. One important element to notice is that it is the poet, not the pole, who is misplaced: the poet is “chocked,” “weary,” “over-heated”: in a nutshell, uncomfortable in the middle of that natural scene. The poet has to laugh at his own question “You here?” because he must admit that the telephone or telegraph poles are everywhere, as if acknowledging thus that technology cannot but aspire to universalism, to becoming a *worldwide web*. The limited one, that who goes nowhere in particular is the poet. The image of the telegraph poles travelling is the result of their repetition: the same moving effect that is produced by the frames on a strip of photographic film when projected on a screen. This effect adds to the impression of that pole being a ghost, a returned-to-life creature. But both the poet and the utility pole are misplaced in that landscape.

The pole therefore becomes a sort of mirror for the poet: the questions that he addresses to the pole in a way return to him, demanding an answer too.
Because of that dialogue, they become a unit, distinctive from the natural context. The prosopopeia of the pole is achieved in that way, and it proves impossible for the poet to be more integrated in the natural scenery than the pole is. The difference between them is the fact that the poet is not alienated from his endeavor, as it happens to the pole, without knowing the messages it transmits. On the other hand, the poet’s labours are lost, or at least, they do not require a definite goal: he is only “half looking for the orchid Calypso”. So, the poem does not merely establish a contrast between the technological element and nature, but, more complexly, it opposes human beings and nature, and the third element, technology, does not bridge the gap nor offer an alternative sheltering space, since it is mere media: inter-mission, trans-mission, not an arrival point.

For the poet, the alternative is not finding shelter in nature because it would amount to dissolving into it. The poet has to face nature; but nature is far from prodigal, and far from constituting a succession of locus amoenus, as Frost, being a farmer, knew all too well. In Frost, as George F. Bagby puts it, “We are far removed from nature, even unnatural” (2003, 118). That is to say, nature is maintained in its otherness, otherness which technology cannot liquefy, although no other is its true purpose. We see the attempt of such assimilation in another poem, “The Line-gang” (2013, 141), also focused on telephone poles, this time on a group of workers who are raising them. The poem is mainly descriptive, but its descriptions manage to be loaded with irony: so, the first verse runs: “Here come the line-gang pioneering by.” The casualness of the vernacular sentence, and in particular of such “by” after “pioneering,” removes any possibility of solemnity, any prestige from the action. The crew works under the illusion of being pioneers, and of achieving control over nature; the ironic interpretation, sparkled with the first line, ranges until the end of the poem: “(…) With a laugh, / An oath of towns that set the wild at naught / They bring the telephone and telegraph.” Even if the workers think they have done the job, and the towns (of which the workers are synecdoche) deride “the wild”, the ironic tone, still in force, proves those assertions deceptive.

Let’s move to Britain. By the beginning of the 20th century, the country in which the Industrial Revolution started had had its cities and landscape largely affected by technology; the growth and the insalubrity of industrial cities was one effect, the soot and the worked ground in the mining areas was another. People left their traditional environments because of the constant industrial demand for new workforce, and the land, which those people used to till, was also changed, as the anti-pastoral poem by Oliver Goldsmith “The Deserted
Village” (1770) largely expounded upon almost at the onset of that process. The idea of the technological advance and a corresponding receding of nature was ever-present in political and artistic manifestations all along the 19th century, the Luddite and the Arts and Crafts movements bearing witness to that. The Modernist Movement encompassed and used the technological language, but the destructive and corruptive overtones associated to it can clearly be felt in T.S. Eliot’s “The Love Song of J. Alfred Prufrock” and *The Waste Land*. However, the 1930s poets in Britain, with W.H. Auden as the leading figure, used technological language in a different way: not as something marginal that degrades social relationships but as central to those relationships. Even by the beginning of the 1930s, it was evident that social and personal life increasingly took place in the new mediated and mediating conditions that technology provided.

However, the poets of this group, which includes W. H. Auden, Louis MacNeice, C. Day Lewis, and Stephen Spender, did not embrace the signs of progress with the same bombastic enthusiasm than, say, the Italian Futurists; some ambivalence remains; we can see it in Spender’s poem “The Pylons” (2004, 21):

```plaintext
The secret of these hills was stone, and cottages
Of that stone made,
And crumbling roads
That turned on sudden hidden villages.

Now over these small hills, they have built the concrete
That trails black wire:
Pylons, those pillars
Bare like nude giant girls that have no secret.

The valley with its guilt and evening look
And the green chestnut
Of customary root
Are mocked dry like the parched bed of a brook.

But far above and far as sight endures
Like whips of anger
There runs the quick perspective of the future.

This dwarfs our emerald country by its trek
So tall with prophecy
```
Dreaming of cities
Where often clouds shall lean their swan-white neck.

The poem contrasts the past and the present, and explicitly treats the pylons—those steel towers supporting electrical wires—as the agents of the future, a future turned into energy and stored as dangerous and volatile electricity power. However, the position of the poet is not clear: which side is he on? The first and the third stanzas describe the countryside, showing in it something akin to embarrassment: we notice it in words such as “crumbling,” “gilt,” “customary,” “mocked”. Furthermore, there is a clear contrast between “they,” the pylons, and “our emerald country”; according to James Purdon, “This ‘they’ and ‘our’ is the surest indicator of the pastoral impulse in Spender’s poem” (2013). The pastoral here is not merely located in the countryside, but it tries to include the prophecy represented by the pylons: it is a pastoral of prophetic content, as Virgil’s Fourth Eclogue, considered the Messianic one, in which the golden age of the past is announced to come again in the immediate future. Spender’s poem balances awkwardly between past and future, contemplating the possibilities of the new electricity network and its power, both in admiration and in awe. The pylons are pastoralized by being compared to nymph-like figures (“giant naked girls”), and by the oblique reference to Zeus and Leda—Zeus being in its swan embodiment—as the last image of the poem, the same mythological intercourse that Yeats employed in his famous sonnet “Leda and the Swan” as a dark omen for the future. The poem, therefore, remains doubtful about the effects that the electricity network is going to bring to the countryside.

Both Frost and Spender’s poems share the topic of technology in natural settings; and both resort to personification in their description of utility poles and pylons. Angus Fletcher argues that personifying devices arise in nature texts “As soon as descriptive impulses strive for accuracy of record” (2004, 39). Fletcher expands this idea: “In a secular context the post-Enlightenment poet has always to deal with the antithetical claims of fact and spirit, as if the genius of place were always at war with the facts of place” (2004, 39–40). Fletcher coins the expression nostalgia of the present (2004, 39) for this irrepresible personification. The two poems analyzed here reject the nostalgia for the rural past and the faith in the technological future, and by doing so they reveal that nature cannot be addressed in an unmediated way; the presence of artificial networks in a natural environment provides the opportunity for realizing the limitations of our rapport with nature. In Frost’s poem nature is indifferent
to man; in Spender’s poem nature can only be defined as what finds itself on the brim of disappearing. Those concepts of nature are the result of different spirits—to use Fletcher’s word—, spirits fighting with the hard-and-fast natural reality. This means that nature, in works of art, grants an invaluable space for projection—it is actually, the space for projection: the composed, scripted space in permanent redefinition and construction that reflects our values, ideas and ideals as society and as individuals. Poems like “An Encounter” and “The Pylons” problematize and distort the projection, only to show it as such. Poems like these intent to give us back our basic natural poverty.

REFERENCES

James Dickey’s *Deliverance*: The Scary Side to Poor Whites

**Concepción Parrondo Carretero**

Universidad de Málaga (UMA)
parrondo1@gmail.com

**Abstract**

A narrative saturated with symbolic and metaphysical content, *Deliverance* (1970) is presented to the reader as a quest for survival and renewal in a highly capitalist, commodified, tediously monotonous white middle-class male world. On the surface, the novel deals with the story of four city slickers who endeavor in a journey to conquer their uncivilized side. At a deeper level, what the text manages to transmit is a feeling of eeriness and fear for what is not conceived upon “civilized,” the hillbillies that the protagonists encounter and fight against to gain their sense of self-worth.

**Keywords**: primitivism, civilization, superior whites, inferior whites.

**1. Introduction**

*Deliverance* has been defined by Dickey himself, as a “story of how decent men kill” (Glenday 1984), a definition that shows the paradoxical terms in which the course of the events unfolds. The adjective “decent” alludes in the story to the “common man of modern times”—the liberal professional of the suburbs—entitled to education, economic stability and respectability due to hard work, diligence and sense of community; on the other hand, the term “kill” evokes an act of primitivism and savagery in which violence plays a paramount role. Violence and death, therefore, go against any value a “decent man” may hold.

At first, *Deliverance’s* story looks uncomplicated. Four middle-class city dwellers get ready to go canoeing down the Cahulawassee River in the North Georgia Mountains to get away from the daily routine that seems to suffocate their day-to-day living.¹ The leader of the party is Lewis Medlock, who has

---

¹ Ed Gentry, Lewis Medlock, Bobbie Trippe and Drew Ballinger.
convinced the others to make the trip down a river none of them have seen and into a territory alien to all of them. The four men spend their first day of their three-day-long adventure uneventfully, yet by night fall, things go awry so much so that the vacationers will be both victims and perpetrators of acts of savagery and primitivism. In such manner, preconceived notions of white superiority and poor white inferiority are not only debased, but also questioned. As far as Deliverance’s representation of white middle-class superiority is concerned, the text functions on highly stereotyped notions of three easily distinguishable classes: the liberal whiteness, represented firstly, in the figure of Lewis Medlock, the enthusiast, lenient with, yet cautious of the rural mountaineer whom he considers dangerous; secondly, the white hegemony in the figure of Ed Gentry, the narrator-protagonist who, while suffering a transformation to conquer Nature in its wildest environment, thinks of the redneck as inferior; and, lastly, the mountaineer, the repository of all traditionally-imposed-upon social negative traits. Such combination of stereotypes sets the stage for developing the most frightening picture of the under-favored class: the poor whites of the rural South.

The following analysis focuses on the social stigmatizing of the low-class whites depicted as the most frightening type, a hyperbolized composite of social stereotyping that has been taking place since colonial times. To reflect upon the stigma of the “hillbilly,” considered inferior, the intricacies lying beneath civilization and primitivism such as violence—humiliation, rape and murder—mockery and struggle for survival are analyzed. The message sent by the narrative is, in the end, that civilization may turn primitive, as in primal and violent, to justify self-preservation.

2. Deliverance’s representations of rural poor whites: civilizations vs. primitivism

The term ‘white trash’ as stated in the introduction to White Trash Race and Class in America:

---

2 The rural type portrayed in Deliverance exhibits a combination of passed-on traits of the worst type as they embody the primal instinct to kill, hate, and resent, while, supposedly, lacking intelligence, dexterity, aesthetics, morals and values.
… is a complex cultural category; since it is racialized (i.e., different from “black trash” or “Indian trash”) and classed (trash is social waste and detritus) allows us to understand how tightly intertwined racial and class identities actually are in the United States […] It speaks to the hybrid and multiple nature of identities, the ways in which our selves are formed and shaped by often contradictory and conflicting relations of social power. (1997, 4)

These relations of social power often entail a constant struggle between the “good” stereotype (hegemonic whites) and the “bad” (the poor whites, and, in it, white trash). *Deliverance* is a clear depiction of such struggle materializing first during the banjo-guitar playing passage. Here is Ed’s description of Lonnie, the “banjo picker:”

He came back and behind him was an albino boy with pink eyes like a white rabbit’s; one of them stared off at a furious and complicated angle. That was the eye he looked at us with, with his face set in another direction. The sane, rational eye was fixed on something that wasn’t there, somewhere in the dust of the road. (*Deliverance*, 51)

The text describes the country boy—an albino—as an oddity to the white race due to his excessive whiteness; his complexion is brightly white as if his color had been altered to turn his whiteness into one of Nature’s mistakes. Someone looking like that could not have possibly been considered intelligent, is the message implied in the lines. There is also oddity in the boy’s gaze; cross-eyed, the boy’s sane and rational eye is also filled with fury and anger at the white men. In addition, the passage reveals, once again, Ed’s fascination for single-eyed gazes.³

The Cahulawassee River, with its treacherous rapids and meandering course, sets the stage for a most fatal outcome for the vacationers. Ready to make a rest stop, the friends get separated and while one group is still fighting the river current to reach the riverbank, the other has already made it to safe ground, only to fall prey to the rage of the local mountaineers. Ed’s description of the “type” brings out into the open the traditionally construed poor whites’ stereotypes:

³ Other examples of single-eyed gazing are found in the country model of the Kitt’n Britches Ad and the chicken head, half glazed looking right at and through Ed.
Two men stepped out of the woods [...] One of them, the taller, narrowed in the eyes and face [...] The shorter one was older, with big white eyes and a half-white stubble that grew in whorls on his cheeks. His face seemed to spin in many directions. He had on overalls, and his stomach looked like it was falling through them. The other was lean and tall, and peered as though out of a cave or some dim place far back in his yellow tinged eyeballs [...] “Escaped convicts” flashed up in my mind on one side, “Bootleggers” on the other. (92)

Such depiction of the mountaineers borders on the grotesque. Disclosing stereotypical signs so intrinsic to the image of the rural poor, these caricatured figures of the wild could strike anyone as people with unhealthy eating habits, prone to drinking, highly deranged (the taller one’s head spinning in many directions) and primitive. Moreover, as if the description was not bad enough, Ed’s speculation about their occupations directly leads the reader to think the worst (they must be criminals or outlaws).

In such an encounter Ed and Bobby, elements of civilization, find themselves confronted with the savagery of the “redneck.” Despondent and defiant, the backwoods men get ready to have their fun. Having stripped Bobby to “them panties:”

The white-haired man worked steadily on Bobby, every now and then getting a better grip on the ground with his knees. At last he raised his face as though to howl with all his strength into the leaves and the sky, and quivered silently while the man with the gun looked on with an odd mixture of approval and sympathy. The whorl-faced man drew back, drew out. (98)

An act of castration on the surface, the rape also signifies an act of rebellion on the redneck’s part. It is now the ‘other’ who taunts, humiliates, and attacks the dominant whites as two backwoods dwellers violently rape and sodomize one superior white in the group. As Ed prepares himself to be raped next, their lives are spared when Lewis and Drew come to their rescue and Lewis kills the primitive rapist.

Getting ready to dispose of the body, Ed’s thoughts reveal once again the stereotyped concept of the rural poor: “every now and then I looked into the canoe and saw the body riding there, slumped back with its hands over its face

4 “‘Them panties too,’ the man with the belly said” (97).
and its feet crossed, a caricature of the southern small-town bum too lazy to do anything but sleep” (114). It is the description of an animalistic creature, stripped off any human qualities whose life would not be a real loss to society.

In a desperate descent down the river, Drew appears to be shot from above and falls into the river where he drowns while Lewis badly injures his leg. It is clear that the other mountain dweller, who managed to escape during the rape scene, lurks on top of the gorge to avenge his partner. Cognizant of this fact, Ed has no recourse but to hunt him down. Gradually, the white city slickers are becoming as aggressive and savage as the mountain rednecks. Violence has become property, at this point, of not only the racialized other, the bad, but also of the civilized white, the good. As Annalee Newitz states, “The idea that middle class whites need to become savages to defend themselves is a perfect excuse for the middle classes to behave in outrageously cruel ways toward the lower classes” (1997, 144).

After climbing up the hill where the stalker prepares for his final attack, Ed waits for the right moment to kill. The following passage reveals the transformation of civilization into primitivism:

I took the knife in my fist. What? Anything. This, also, is not going to be seen. It is not ever going to be known; you can do what you want to do; nothing is too terrible. I can cut off the genitals he was going to use on me. Or I can cut off his head, looking straight into his open eyes. Or I can eat him. I can do anything I have a wish to do [...] the ultimate horror circled me and played over the knife.

The act of taking the knife means an appropriation of violence and brute force, the initial stages of Ed’s transgressing civilization to savagery, which progresses upon the idea of concealment of criminality: a right of the primal in a land where mankind has regressed. What is left is the law of retaliation—an eye for an eye—as, at this point in the story, anything goes.

Having reached their destination, the group feels no longer empowered over the racialized of the “inferior other,” the locals; but rather they have become, presumably forced by the circumstances, “their equal.” Being killed and having killed themselves, the narrative justifies, on the one hand, the higher class’s violent behavior as a self-defense mechanism and, condemns, on the other, the inferior class for their savagery and primitivism. Newitz explains:
If the lower classes “bring down” the white middle class to their level, in essence they are “asking for it” when the middle class turns savage and kills them off. Ultimately, middle class whites, can use the hatred they inspire in lower class whites to justify their own violence and to claim that they can’t help being violent anyway […] whites secure their innocence by swapping punishment and hatred back and forth between classes locked in combat with one another. (145)

The last chapter of the novel places the protagonists, whose lives have changed forever, in the little town of Aintry. Having murdered two people and buried three in the waters of the river, the surviving trio remains adamant on adhering to the version of the story related to the authorities.  

Though the local sheriff remains suspicious, he has no evidence to arrest them and, therefore, must let the group go. The following dialogue between Ed and the local sheriff puts an end to civilization and primitivism confrontation upon making clear the savagery of the three city slickers:

"Take it easy going home," he said. “And, buddy, let me tell you one thing. Don’t ever do anything like this again. Don’t come back up here.”
“You don’t have to worry about that,” I said. I grinned, and slowly, so did he. “Is this your way of telling me to get out of town and not show my face in these-here parts again?”
“You might say that,” he said …
“You’us hurt bad, but if it wudn’t for you you’d all be in the river with your other man.”
“Thanks, Sheriff. I’ll take that with me.”
“You damned fucking ape,” he said. Who on earth was your father, boy?” (Deliverance, 230–231)

Based on these presuppositions mentioned above, the ending of the novel may be interpreted as follows: not only is resorting to the most primitive attributes of human condition allowed for self-defense. It is in extreme danger, the danger of the presence of the other, (the bad, the white trash characters, portrayed as a threat to other whites) when savagery of any kind prevails. Furthermore, as the redneck, white trashy officer of the law has been outsmarted

---

5 After finding Drew’s body, the party decides to sink his body in the river to avoid raising suspicions.
by these whites, he grudgingly does have to let go. Being warned not to come back, the superior middle-class whites get away with their crime.

3. Conclusion

Notwithstanding that *Deliverance* deals with Man’s quest to rediscover his primal instinct, at a deeper level the novel engages the reader into directing their attention to the figure of the hillbilly, the redneck inhabiting the backwoods. As Dickey stated in one interview, the backcountry was to him the possibility of one’s becoming a counter-monster, behaving as man did who lived in remote parts, “doing whatever you felt compelled to do to survive” (Isenberg 2017, 280). Indeed, the story leads the protagonists to behave as any in those remote areas supposedly would; that is, having no regards for the law or anything that the “modern man” might have imposed upon them.

Secondly, *Deliverance* is a gruesome adventure that exploited the worst stereotypes of white trash, while ignoring the poverty such class has always been subjected to. The novel is a mere reflection of what society thinks of the type. As Nancy Isenberg puts it:

> They are often blamed for living on bad land, as though they had other choices. From the beginning, they have existed in the minds of rural and urban elites and the middle class as extrusions of the weedy, unproductive soil. They are depicted as slothful, rootless vagrants, physically scarred by their poverty. The worst ate clay and turned yellow, wallowed in mud and muck, and their necks became burned by the hot sun. Their poorly clothed, poorly fed children generated what others believed to be a permanent and defective breed. (Isenberg 320)

These preconceived notions of white poverty have been ingrained in the minds of the four protagonists, transpired in the narrative through Ed’s thoughts; a constant reminder of how insignificant the existence of poor whites has become for society. In addition, functioning under the worst assumptions

---

6 The few women characters in the story such as the protagonist’s wives, the secretaries in the city offices, and the model of Kitt’n Britches Ad, are depicted only from the stance of male superiority.

7 Nancy Isenberg 321.
about white trash, *Deliverance*, punishes those who dare think otherwise: Lewis’s admiration for the backwoods people’s singing become debunked upon ending up with a shattered leg; Drew’s delight for having had a musical interchange with the albino country boy only affords him his own drowning; and Bobby’s upbeat and happiness gets him brutally raped. Only Ed, the skeptical hero of the novel, is delivered back to modernity being a better man. Transformed from civilized into savage, Ed outwits the evil trickster, the redneck, on the basis of self-preservation.

In a nutshell, the novel is the perfect illustration of the stigma of white trash. It displays the traits around which the term has been misconstrued and which have not yet disappeared but live in rural areas, in the trailer parks outside the cities, in the North, South, West and East of the country and, above all, in the minds of the contemporary middle—and upper—class white elite.8

### References


---

8 As Nancy Isenberg states, “today’s trailer trash are merely yesterday’s vagrants on wheels, an updated version of Okies in jalopies and Florida crackers in their carts” (Isenberg 320).


Loveable Monsters, Redeemable Men: The Lonely Voice of Oscar Wilde

Regina M. Ponciano
Universidade de Santiago de Compostela
regina.ponciano@usc.es

Abstract

Oscar Wilde (1854–1900) is normally discussed as an aesthete, critic, poet, philosopher, or playwright, but rarely as a short story writer (McCormack 1997; Killeen 2007; Small 2017). Wilde’s short fiction, however, was key in launching his career as a professional writer. This paper looks into the themes and techniques through which Wilde upsets some of the most basic generic conventions to create a liminal narrative space in which he does not portray flat or allegorical characters, as traditional folk and ghost narratives would do, but develops rounded characters whose psychological depth becomes central to the short narrative. Through the discussion of “The Selfish Giant” and “The Canterville Ghost”, this paper explores how ethics and aesthetics converge to explore the loneliness of “monstrous” masculinities and the possibility of love and redemption for these queer men.

Keywords: Oscar Wilde, short story, “The Selfish Giant”, “The Canterville Ghost”, masculinities.

1. Introduction

Oscar Wilde (1854–1900) is normally discussed as an aesthete, critic, poet, philosopher, or playwright, but rarely as a short story writer (McCormack 1997; Killeen 2007; Small 2017). Wilde’s short fiction, however, was key in launching his career as a professional writer after the failures of his poetry collections Ravenna (1878) and Poems (1880), as well as his plays Vera, or the Nihilists (1880) and The Duchess of Padua (1883). As Wilde was working on his most important critical pieces later collected in Intentions (1891), his polemical novella The Picture of Dorian Gray (1891), his controversial symbolist play Salomé (1893, 1894) or his best-known comedy Lady Windermere’s Fan (1892), he also published three short story collections which display a higher degree of thematic
and formal experimentation than his works in other genres. In his short fiction, Wilde deploys a particular concern with men’s subjectivity, since he systematically upsets some of the most basic generic conventions to create a liminal narrative space to develop neither flat nor allegorical male characters, as traditional folk and ghost narratives would do, but rounded characters whose psychological depth becomes central to the short narrative. At once radical and conservative, Wilde’s short narratives thus portray marginal men who encounter ethical dilemmas: some well-known examples are the Happy Prince, a statue who must sacrifice the precious parts of which his body is made, but ultimately dies to only temporarily save some villagers from poverty; a fisherman who must cut away his soul in a Satanic ritual in order to be with his mermaid-lover; a young aristocrat who performs several attempted murders and eventually commits an actual murder because he believes it is his duty to fulfill a chiromancer’s prophecy. All the stories focus on these transitional or transformative moments, which nonetheless formally resist innocuous readings: through the use of pastiche, plagiarism, and ironic mimicry, the absence of narrative closure, the unexpected placings of emphases, the psychological depth of stock characters, or the disassociation of discourse and plot, Wilde complicates the stories’ relationship with generic boundaries, and thus multiplies their interpretation.

The few times Wilde’s popular stories have received critical attention, they have been mostly read as allegories about the Irish Home Rule or as manifestations of his (homo-)sexual identity. This paper rather looks into two stories in which ethics and aesthetics converge to explore the loneliness of “monstrous” masculinities and the possibility of love and redemption for these queer men. Through the discussion of “The Selfish Giant” and “The Canterville Ghost” I will illustrate how Wilde experimented with form to refract the impact of psychological forces (such as love and sadness) on masculinity.

2. “The Selfish Giant” (1888)

In Wilde’s fairy tale “The Selfish Giant”, the eponymous protagonist embodies many negative qualities of hypermasculinity, as he is portrayed as aloof, morally simplistic, and aggressively territorial:

“My own garden is my own garden,” said the Giant; “any one can understand that, and I will allow nobody to play in it but myself.” So he built a high wall all round it, and put up a notice-board.
He was a very selfish Giant (Wilde 2017, 25)

The wall creates a physical, social and emotional barrier, as it does not only keep out the children that were formerly playing in the Giant’s garden, but effectively banishes life itself: Spring, Summer, and Autumn—represented by female figures—refuse to visit the Giant’s garden when they learn of his selfishness, while Snow, Frost, North Wind, and Hail—male dandies—“roared all day about the garden,” “rattled on the roof of the castle till he broke most of the slates”, and “danced about through the trees” (Wilde 2017, 26). Unaware of the reasons for this change in the natural cycle, the Giant grows lonely as his garden grows barren and his home starts falling apart.

It is only many months later, when alerted by “the most beautiful music in the world […] that the Hail stopped dancing over his head, and the North Wind ceased roaring, and a delicious perfume came to him through the open casement” (Wilde 2017, 27). The Giant’s depression is lifted through sensorial and aesthetic stimulation, opening his eyes to see “a most wonderful sight” (Wilde 2017, 27): children were again sitting in the garden’s blossoming trees. Upon seeing a little boy who cannot climb into a tree “the Giant’s heart melted […] ‘How selfish I have been!’ he said; now I know why the Spring would not come here. I will put that poor little boy on the top of the tree, and then I will knock down the wall, and my garden shall be the children’s playground for ever and ever.’ He was really very sorry for what he had done” (Wilde 2017, 27). This affective encounter transforms the Giant: his aggressive territoriality is exchanged for kind generosity, and he is rewarded with an embrace and a kiss, which entails the restoration of natural order in his garden.

Wilde’s plot, however, transgresses the traditional happily-ever-after ending of the fairy tale genre. Although the children remain forever youthful in the Giant’s garden, the little boy disappears, making the Giant “very sad […] and] long […] for his little friend” (Wilde 2017, 28). Years pass and the Giant ages. It is only when he comes to understand that “Winter is but Spring sleeping”—that love and loss, joy and sadness, are two sides of the same coin—that the tiny boy suddenly returns bearing “wounds of Love” on his palms and feet (Wilde 2017, 28, 29). A sudden shift in language from the prosaic to the archaic delineates the final meeting:
“Who art thou?” said the Giant, and a strange awe fell on him, and he knelt before the little child. And the child smiled on the Giant, and said to him, “You let me play once in your garden, to-day you shall come with me to my garden, which is Paradise.” And when the children ran in that afternoon, they found the Giant lying dead under the tree, all covered with white blossoms. (Wilde 2017, 29)

This ambiguous encounter concludes the narrative, yet the folk-Catholic subtext suggests that it is not the end of the Giant’s spiritual journey but a threshold moment that ensures his divine redemption: the Giant’s emotional maturation during old age culminates when he leaves his terrestrial, monstrous body behind. What is tragic in the story is not the Giant’s death, then, but the morale about the arbitrariness of the boundaries that we put up and the negative effects they have upon our emotional wellbeing. God’s love, however, is granted to those who cast off their most monstrous traits.

3. “The Canterville Ghost” (1891)

“The Canterville Ghost,” according to O’Connor (2004), is a parody of Gothic melodrama, as it plays with the boundary between the comical and the horrific through a sentimental yet sensational plot. It combines elements from high and popular culture: whereas the elements of the ghost story are more popular in nature, the melodrama as form had become by the end of the nineteenth century a serious type of salon entertainment. From the point of view of genre, then, the story is already dissolving the distinction between popular and highbrow literature. Our generic expectations on the onset are that the story will favor suspense over characterization, and will focus on issues of morality and family, questions of love and marriage, Self and Other. Wilde, however, reverses these expectations continuously.

As many melodramas, “The Canterville Ghost” is structured into seven acts, a narrative device not used in any other short story by Wilde. The first act introduces the American Otis family buying Canterville Chase despite the multiple warnings that the estate has been haunted for over three-hundred years: “‘My Lord,’ answered [Mr. Otis], ‘I will take the furniture and the ghost at a valuation. I come from a modern country’” (Wilde 2017, 82). The Otis family is comically unaffected by all the Gothic tropes which they encoun-
ter: they are unbothered by the creaking floorboards, clanking chains, ancient prophecies, and the persistent reappearance of blood stains in the very place where Sir Simon de Canterville is said to have murdered his wife. The Americans, the story shows, are too modern to be frightened.

After this initial exposition that relies heavily on topicalities related to both sides of the Atlantic and the introduction of supernatural elements, the parody of such tropes escalates in the following two acts as traditional Gothic roles are reversed. Instead of Sir Simon scaring the Otises away, into insanity, or to death, as he had done repeatedly to other families, the Americans not only remain unperturbed, but also take it upon them to haunt Sir Simon and succeed in tricking and scaring him on several occasions: either by building a ghost with blankets and a turnip, or by placing a bucket full of water over the door to their bedroom, placing tripwire, or performing jumpscares. Despite many attempts by Sir Simon to reassert his ghostly authority, he is humiliated time and again: “Never in a brilliant and uninterrupted career of three hundred years, had he been so grossly insulted” (Wilde 2017, 87).

The reversal of roles is ironic not only because of our generic expectations with a ghost story, but also because being a ghost is quite literally a role that Sir Simon is playing. Repeatedly, the narrator reports how

With the enthusiastic egotism of the true artist he went over his most celebrated performances, and smiled bitterly to himself as he recalled to mind his last appearance as “Red Reuben, or the Strangled Babe” his début, as “Gaunt Gibeon, the Blood-sucker of Bexley Moor,” and the furore he had excited one lovely June evening by merely playing ninepins with his own bones upon the lawn-tennis court. (Wilde 2017, 87; italics added)

Although he is an artist, he is not one in the Romantic sense: in Act IV, it becomes apparent why he has taken on his role: “It was his solemn duty to appear in the corridor once a week, and to gibber from the large oriel window on the first and third Wednesdays in every month, and he did not see how he could honourably escape from this obligation” (Wilde 2017, 92; italics added). The question of dignity and social class—the embodiment of a particular masculinity—is a powerful drive of Sir Simon’s performance, as after countless failures “he resolved to make one final effort to assert his dignity and social position, and determined to visit the insolent young Etonians the next night in his celebrated character of ‘Reckless Rupert,’ or ‘the Headless Earl’” (Wilde 2017,
Sir Simon’s inability to perform his duty draws him into a severe depression, since he is from that moment “not seen again on any nocturnal expedition […] It was quite evident that his feelings were so wounded that he would not appear” (Wilde 2017, 94). He cannot even be persuaded to scare some of his usual victims, given “his terror of the twins prevented his leaving his room” (Wilde 2017, 95).

Sir Simon’s final defeat in Act IV is followed by an abrupt change in narrative mood as it relates an encounter between Sir Simon and Virginia, the youngest of the Otis family. As she passes the Tapestry Chamber, Sir Simon is sitting by the window:

His head was leaning on his hand, and his whole attitude was one of extreme depression. Indeed, so forlorn, and so much out of his repair did he look, that little Virginia, whose first idea had been to run away and lock herself in her room, was filled with pity, and determined to try and comfort him. (Wilde 2017, 95)

It is only at this point that the reader is presented with the ghost’s private nature and motivations. We learn that despite the legends, he has not been condemned to haunt Canterville Chase because he murdered his wife or feelings of guilt; rather, because he was starved to death by his wife’s brothers and his bodily remains were never properly interred. In response to Virginia’s pitiful kindness, Sir Simon breaks out in a melodramatic wail:

Please don’t go Miss Virginia,’ he cried; I am so lonely and so unhappy, and I really don’t know what to do. I want to go to sleep and I cannot’ […] ‘I have not slept for three hundred years,’ he said sadly, and Virginia’s beautiful blue eyes opened in wonder; ‘for three hundred years I have not slept, and I’m so tired.’ […]

‘Yes, Death. Death must be so beautiful. To lie in the soft brown earth, with the grasses waving above one’s head, and listen to silence. To have no yesterday, and no tomorrow. To forget time, to forgive life, to be at peace. You can help me. You can open for me the portals of Death’s house, for Love is always with you, and Love is stronger than Death is.’ (Wilde 2017, 97; italics added).

Virginia decides to help Sir Simon overcome his suicidal depression. The narration, however, elides the sacrifice that she has to perform by focalizing on her family instead. Upon her return in Act VII, Virginia has undergone a pivotal transformation and is no longer a girl, but now a woman. She acts on
this newly acquired maturity by providing Sir Simon’s remains with a proper interment, thus restoring peace to his soul and to Canterville Chase, and marrying her suitor.

4. CONCLUSIONS

Although “The Selfish Giant” and “The Canterville Ghost” are very different stories, they are both about ‘monstrous’ men who break with social expectations only after a period of severe depression and an act of love. Both men are redeemed through the means of sacrificial love, either of the monster himself (in “The Selfish Giant”) or of the young Virginia (in “The Canterville Ghost”). Their queer bodies are the main shackles which dictate the way they are perceived and, consequently, decide to express themselves, and their deaths are highly suggestive that queer men have no place in this (material) world. It is, of course, relevant that Wilde returns, here and in other stories, to the trope of a folkloric male monster to explore men’s predicaments when they do not conform to traditional, and I would add, gendered, expectations society had of men, their bodies, and their duties.

The two stories also share some features that elucidate how Wilde made use of the formal characteristics of the short story to explore some questions of gender. In both stories Wilde complicates the plot to upset the readers’ expectations: in “The Selfish Giant” he does so by introducing a second ending, while in “The Canterville Ghost” there is a change in focalization. Both stories also present abrupt shifts in terms of subgenre: the text moves from folktale to religious text in “The Selfish Giant,” and from ghost story to parody to melodrama in “The Canterville Ghost”. Here, and in other short stories, Wilde creates a liminal narrative space by upsetting various generic conventions associated to the popular genres of his choosing, thus developing traditional male stock characters whose psychological dimensions become fundamental to these experimental tales.

Even more significantly, both stories are also characterized by ellipses as narrative techniques, which are most poignant in the death scenes but are also found in those instances when the male characters try to express their emotional turmoil. As the quotes have illustrated, it is never made explicit what precisely made the Giant realize that he had been selfish; and similarly, it is only after a very long period of loneliness and covert depression, and after many flippant
monologues, that the ghost is able to verbalize his loneliness and express his wish to end his suffering.

As such, I hope to have shown that some male writers such as Oscar Wilde find in the modern short story a special kind of formal flexibility that allows to express or leave unexpressed (but suggested) the impact of bodily, social, and psychological expectation on the emotional wellbeing of queer masculinities in Wilde’s short stories.

REFERENCES


African Feminism in Ayesha Harruna Attah’s Saturday’s Shadows’ Female Characters

M. Dolores Raigón-Hidalgo
Universidad de Córdoba
ff2rahim@uco.es

Abstract

This paper analyses Saturday’s Shadows, a novel written by the Ghanaian Ayesha Harruna Attah under the theoretical framework of African Feminism. We will briefly develop the different manifestations of feminism in Africa, paying attention to the fluid character of these movements. We will depart from a common concern to African feminisms, to seek female agency and autonomy. In “Theorizing African Feminisms”, Pinkie Mekgwe finds common to African Feminisms the fact that they emerge as activist movements and share the necessity of a positive change in society where women are full citizens. As a method, we will trace African Feminism from, to name a few, Filomina Steady who in 1981 addressed female autonomy and co-operation; Buchi Emecheta who spoke about the importance of activism for African women; Ogundipe Leslie’s STIWNISM, Obioma Nnameka’s Nego-Feminism based on negotiation and cooperation, to Ecofeminism connected to Wangari Maathai’s Green Belt Movement who advocates for women in rural communities putting forward their genuine voice speaking out for their human, environmental, civil and political rights. From this starting point, we will discuss central issues in African Feminisms which will be exemplified by Ayesha Harruna Attah’s novel to show the way two generations of women get together in action to change the fixed structures which do not allow them to rule their lives.

Keywords: African feminism, negotiation, activism, co-operation.

White Western Feminism experienced a split in the 1980s. Women who did not belong to the First World, women from the periphery, started questioning their position within a movement led by women who had never taken into account those different from them. From this point of view, the West positions itself in a privileged centre keeping the east in the economic, political and cul-
tural border or periphery. At the same time, according to Zirión and Idarraga, it produces knowledge as well as subjects and identities; it speaks for the Other dominating and /or silencing those other voices. Refusing to accept other realities, other women, feminism in the centre is one more manifestation of neo-colonialism. Chandra Talpade Mohanty in her seminal essay “Under Western Eyes” (1988), criticizes the monolithic vision of Third World women, as a group deprived of power, living in poverty and scarcity, uneducated and constrained by cultural and traditional practices. Mohanty advocates for the deconstruction of feminist hegemonic knowledge while reconstructing autonomous knowledge and strategies situated in history, geographies and cultures in the Third World.

For Daniel Peres, “el valor del feminismo debe cifrarse en la no universalización del modelo de resistencia de las mujeres ante la opresión que sufren, pues en los diferentes lugares donde existe dicha opresión las respuestas van a variar en función del contexto” (Peres 2017, 158).

Apart from being oppressed under patriarchal modes they were also subjected to their race, class or religion.

Frente a esta visión universalista conviene revitalizar un enfoque interseccional, que aborde la conexión entre los conceptos de raza, clase, género y sexualidad… [y] que surge según Lugones como consecuencia de la superposición de exclusiones de matriz colonial (Peres 2017, 164).

Women social movements in Africa sprung from the fight for independence side by side with their male counterparts. This fight for freedom saw that once in power, men forgot about equality in rights and representation. African feminisms are diverse but at the same time, they share some common features, namely, intersectional analysis, the need to name themselves and to define their own agenda and the vindication of equality within the community. We will be dealing with them both as an activist movement and as a body of ideas that underline the need for a positive transformation of society such that women are not marginalized but are treated as full citizens in all spheres of life.

In 1981, Filomina Chioma Steady in *The Black Woman Cross-Culturally* defined “African feminisms as emphasizing female autonomy and co-operation; nature over culture; the centrality of children, multiple mothering and kinship” (Mekgwe 2008, 16). Steady also considers paramount the involvement of men which underlies every African theorization of Feminism: the need for cooperation. As Steady does, Carole Boyce-Davies and Ann Graves in *Ngambika* recog-
nized the common struggle of African men and women, challenging men to be aware of those aspects of women subjugation which differ from the generalized oppression of all African people. The Nigerian Buchi Emecheta in 1982 highlighted the importance of activism for the African woman trying to address the problems derived from social inequality. She refers to the difficulty of naming faced by feminists in Africa. Similarly, Molara Ogundipe Leslie in 1987 defines herself as a woman, an African and a Third World person. She coined the term STIWANISM or Social Transformation Including Women in Africa. Womanism, the term that the African American Alice Walker had created “a womanist is someone who appreciates and prefers women’s culture… committed to survival and wholeness of entire people, male and female…” (Walker 1983, xi), was adopted in Africa by Chikwenge Ogunyemi and Mary Modupe Kolawole who evolved in the direction of African Womanism in the work Womanism and African Consciousness (1997). The Nigerian Womanist literary critic Oyeronke Oyewumi does not agree with the Eurocentrist concept of “sisterhood” in Africa as from her point of view, it demands theorization; and it is alien to African cultures. Instead, she prefers to emphasize motherhood. The Ghanaian writer, Ama Ata Aidoo in an interview with María Frías, asserts that there are womanists and feminists, but the most important thing is what they are trying to get at. She discusses the validity of the term for African women in terms of clarity. “I learnt my first feminist lessons in Africa”, she says “feminism is not new and I really refuse to be told I’m learning feminism from abroad” (Frías 2003, 26).

Karen Warren in 1987 established connections among feminism and ecology. “She argued for a basic ecofeminist position: that feminist ought to pay attention to environmental issues and ecological interdependencies” (Cuomo 2002, 1). Ecofeminism grows from the idea that a woman’s ethics are closer to nature than a man’s and it revalues feminine traits. Common to women’s campaigns are their vulnerability to environmental problems and their lack of access to the centres of decision making which cause them. Ecofeminist practices in Africa can be seen in Kenya with the Green Belt Movement led by Wangari Mathai who advocates for women in rural communities putting forward their genuine voice speaking out for their human, environmental, civil and political rights.

1 “Feminism and Ecology: Making connections” quoted in Cuomo, Chris. “On Ecofeminist Philosophy”.
Obioma Nnaemeka coined the term nego-feminism, the feminism of negotiation in 2004:

In the foundation of shared values in many African cultures are the principles of negotiation, give and take, compromise and balance. African feminisms challenge through negotiation and compromise. African women do feminism; feminism is what they do for themselves and for others (Nnaemeka 2004, 377–8).

According to Nnaemeka, for the true development of human beings, there must be a sense of empowerment and inner fulfillment. She mentions a third space of engagement “which allows for the coexistence, interconnection, and interaction of thought, dialogue, planning, and action and constitutes the arena where I have witnessed the unfolding of feminisms in Africa” (2004, 377). As other feminists in the academia, dealing with theory and engagement, Nnaemeka speaks of positionality from the social and personal to the intellectual and political, and the intersectionality of race, gender, class, ethnicity, sexuality, religion, culture and national origin. For her, it is necessary that for true global feminism, we go across borders, which entails learning about the “other”, but more importantly, it should also entail learning from the other as the other teaches community, alliance and connectedness. Learning from requires humble listeners. Related to nego-feminism she developed the phrase “building on the indigenous” after Claude Ake. The indigenous is whatever the people consider important to their lives, whatever they regard as an authentic expression of themselves.

Building on the indigenous by making it determine the form and content of development strategy, by ensuring that developmental change accommodates itself to these things, be they values, interests, aspirations and or social institutions which important in the life of the people. Traditional is not indigenous. It is a dynamic, evolving hybrid of different histories and geographies (Nnaemeka 2004, 376–7).

Examples of people building in the indigenous are Auntie Adisa and her collective of women.

We’re a cooperative of women that started in 1980 . . . We’re from different walks of life. I was once a school teacher. Some of us are nurses, housewives. We
even have a bus driver. She explained how each of them focused on one crop to cultivate, how they were learning to process their raw materials, but wanted me to know that they weren’t isolating themselves. Some women held other jobs in the cities or went to trade there, some were married and lived with their husbands and children, and others lived on their own and it was fine. We’re just trying to live peacefully and productively. (Attah 2015, 261)

Foregrounding social and grassroots activism there are two documents produced in Ghana, the Women’s Manifesto and the Charter of Feminism considered relevant when talking about African feminisms as it is portrayed by Ayesha Attah in her novels.

About the general election in 2000, and bill on Domestic violence, women in Ghana gathered to oppose the creation of a Ministry for Women’s affairs, triggered by the new political situation and the women’s murders which took place in Accra, Ghana’s capital city. Ayesha Attah explains the situation: “The serial killer has murdered six women so far. . . One more woman killed in the ritual killings plaguing the nation’s capital; opposition says they’ve found evidence that killings are being orchestrated by President of the Republic, Dr. Karamoh Saturday” (Attah 2015, 24–5). The mobilization was supported by ABUNTU for Development and The Network for Women’s Rights (NETRIGTH), refusing the sponsorship of patrons who could bias their petitions. The manifesto sought for equality and higher participation of women in governance, better access to resources to make a living, women’s health, and women’s poverty, harmful and discriminatory social practices justified in the name of culture, violence against women, the disabled, widowed, aged women and single mothers. It was important their commitment to collective action, so as to make a difference to the situation of men, women and children and achieve gender equality. It is worth mentioning the important role played by women assemblies, among them market women in Ghana. According to Usman, “women’s political and voluntary groups and associations sprang up in post independent Ghana, such as the Ghana Women’s League and the 31st of December movement” (2017, 154–5). However, those women were victims of military attacks in the 1970s and 80s. There was an economic recession and market women were accused of it being punished in their trade. With Rawlings’s second coming under the PNDC, measures were even harsher with the consequent fear and panic in the population, mainly in women. Again Attah in Saturday’s Shadows makes Nasar explain:
'I used to be a Saturday Boy... I did a lot of things. But the one I still get nightmares from is... I beat up a pregnant woman and it didn't matter if you were man, woman, or child. The woman had stockpiled boxes of provisions, selling them at four times the normal price... We'd been trained to punish. Women like her, we believed, were the root of the country’s inflation and economic problems.' (Attah 2015, 275–7)

The African Feminist Forum took place in Accra Ghana in 2006, in order that African feminists from all walks of life and different levels of engagement could reflect on a collective basis and chart ways to strengthen and grow the feminist movement on the continent. A key outcome of the forum was the adoption of the Charter of Feminist Principles which celebrates their feminist identity and politics. By naming themselves feminists they politicize the struggle for women’s rights, question the legitimacy of the structures that keep women subjugated and develop tools for transformational analysis and action.

Ayesha Harruna Attah’s characters’ lives run parallel to the history of Ghana and Africa at the time. In Saturday’s Shadows, she wrote the personal diary of each character who comments on the history of the country. In this way, all those aspects related to social women movements and grassroots feminism are developed in the novels. Zahra Avoka, the main character in Saturday’s Shadows, works for Duell and Co., a company which provides women farmers with training, capital and equipment and to find markets with a commission of the earnings. She has been suffering from severe migraines, nauseas and blurred vision for a while but it worsens when she is doing her Christmas shopping. Her husband, Theo Avoka is a civil servant under Doctor Saturday’s military dictatorship. They have got an adolescent son attending a private school whose fees are causing them troubles. Atsu, the housemaid plays a vital role together with Zahra’s mother and Auntie Adisa, a farmer whom Zahra ends up working for. The struggles that Zahra and Atsu undergo in a violent run down city throughout the novel contrasts with “paradise”, as Zahra describes Auntie Adisa’s farm, a cooperative of literate women who have chosen to work the soil being respectful to nature. By the end of the novel and once she has been fired from work, dismissed by her lover and hardly dejected by her illness, Zahra becomes into a proper African woman, she remembers her father and everything she learnt from him, the way her parents loved each other and herself, her connection with the land. She realizes of the sacrifices older women had made for
younger generations to live a better life. She has also earnt how important is the personal, spiritual connection among women to build a project for the betterment of society, the importance of community. Zahra, her mother and Auntie Adisa are talking about regrets. Finally, Zahra is able to value her mother:

… the woman whom I’d avoided becoming because I thought her too dogmatic, too behind the times, too servile. And yet she was a woman who’d borne it all with resignation: a headstrong daughter; a husband who barely showed her he appreciated her; her thwarted desire to be surrounded by lots and lots of children she could take care of… [her mother] I wished I had gone to school. I should have begged to go to school. No, not begged. I should just have done it. Run away. [Zahra] I wish I’d learned to be a better wife and mother… less selfish… My generation has always been about itself and its pleasure. We weren’t so much into making sacrifices, which is what made you both such strong women… It was for our survival… Maybe this generation will figure out the secret formula’ I said. “It’s their turn to figure out how to get it right” (Attah 2015, 332–4).

These thoughts connect with Nnaemeka’s nego-feminism, “In the foundation of shared values in many African cultures are principles of give and take, compromise and balance” (Nnaemeka 2004, 377). The past and the present together give our life continuity and coherence. It is necessary to look into the past to envision our future, to imagine or expect that something is a likely or desirable possibility in the future. We agree with Charmaine Pereira:

Facing the challenges ahead requires renewed determination to craft the theoretical frameworks for deepening our understanding of our varied contexts in order to dismantle existing relations of oppression and domination… creating more liberatory possibilities for African women and societies will necessarily be work-in-progress, drawing on and amplifying the possibilities for inspiration and strength through the building of feminist solidarity and collective action. (2017, 29)

REFERENCES


Tradition as Freedom: 
Jorge Luis Borges and the Identity of Irish Writing

Bill Richardson
National University of Ireland Galway
bill.richardson@nuigalway.ie

Abstract
Jorge Luis Borges drew parallels between the links between Irish writers and the English language, and the connections between writers from Argentina and the Spanish language. His reflections not only cast light on the work of important Irish authors but also serve to probe questions relating to identity that are central issues in the contemporary world. Such matters concern notions about “core” and “peripheral” cultures, the relationships between writers and nations, and the need for a greater understanding of how people generally define their “place in the world”. I examine some of Borges’s key statements on the work of James Joyce, and focus on relevant issues raised by Borges in his essay “The Argentine Writer and Tradition”, where he expounded on the idea of “tradition as freedom”, citing Irish writing as an instance of how this can work.

Keywords: Irish literature, Jorge Luis Borges, tradition, identity, James Joyce, Ulysses.

Jorge Luis Borges took a keen interest in Ireland, although he did not get to visit the country until late in his life. At the time of that visit, he was eighty-two years of age and had become one of the most famous authors of the period, feted around the world for his work, particularly his famous ficciones. Although he had by then become almost totally blind, Borges accepted invitations to visit a range of cities in various countries in America, Europe and Asia. On his visits to such cities, however, Borges might not go much further than his hotel room, other than a trip to a lecture hall or an occasional foray to a special location with literary associations such as the Père Lachaise cemetery in the case of Paris or the Scott Memorial in Edinburgh. What he preferred to do was to re-visit the writings of authors connected to the cities in question—by having someone read to him—and thereby enjoy what the city and the particular author’s works...
evoked. It was on Bloomsday, 16 June 1982, that he came to Dublin, at the invitation of the Joyce Centenary Committee, to honour James Joyce on the hundredth anniversary of that writer’s birth. What he was visiting was again a literary place, and there was no shortage of writers whose work he was familiar with and whom he associated with the city, not only Joyce but authors such as George Bernard Shaw, Oscar Wilde and W.B. Yeats.

With regard to Joyce, Borges combined great admiration for the Irishman’s writing talents with scepticism about what he had achieved in the composition of *Ulysses* and *Finnegans Wake*. Borges received a first edition of *Ulysses* not long after it appeared, and published an essay entitled “El ‘Ulises’ de Joyce” in 1925 (Borges 2011) along with a translation into Spanish of an extract from Molly Bloom’s soliloquy, probably the first published translation into Spanish of any of Joyce’s great novel. In that article, we can witness the ambiguities to which I have referred. For a start, Borges states that he has not read the entire novel, but instead claims to “have become acquainted with it by skimming through it”.¹ The fact of not having read the entire text, however, does not negate the idea that Borges as a reader can appreciate the novel. Rather, the Argentinean writer focuses on the notion that Joyce’s work is centred on a city, and just as we can know a city without becoming familiar with every single one of its streets, so he claims to know this work by Joyce. The idea is a good one, since the trope of the city of Dublin is central to *Ulysses*, and the very creation of the geography of the text is part of what the novel achieves. After all, its chapters can be read and appreciated individually, even if they can also be linked with other chapters that appear around them, just as streets can. It is worth noting that this focus on the city chimes with Borges’s own preoccupations at the time, since he was immersed in and inspired by his home town of Buenos Aires in the 1920s.

On a theoretical level, the key question this raises concerns the ontological status of, on the one hand, the Dublin that the visitor who goes to that city sees, and on the other, the Dublin that exists in the mind’s eye, conjured up by means of Joyce’s text. Bertrand Westphal (2011) suggests that the relationship between these two versions of Dublin is best examined by considering Thomas

¹ The original reads: “Confieso no haber desbrozado las setecientas páginas que lo integran, confieso haberlo practicado solamente a retazos…” (Borges 2011, 71).
G. Pavel’s notions of “segregation” and “integration”. By this is meant that we either proceed by “isolating the text as a mere product of imagination” or we claim, *qua* Pavel, that “no genuine ontological difference can be found between fictional and nonfictional descriptions of the actual world” (Westphal 2011, 94). Westphal concludes as follows:

Regarding the possible study of the relationship between Dublin *in itself* and the Dublin of Joyce, one will adopt one attitude or the other, with nuances. Everything depends on the degree of intensity that we assign to the model: its existence may […] take on a symbolic character, and therefore be more or less “weak.” Just as there is a Dublin subject to the gaze of the visitor, there is a symbolic Dublin with less anchorage. It is the Dublin of works of fiction.

Of course, these two Dublins overlap; part of the human perception of spatiality is that there is common ground between imagined spaces and tangible, concrete ones. As Umberto Eco, quoted in Westphal (2011, 95), puts it: “A fictional text abundantly overlaps the world of the reader’s encyclopaedia.”

What fascinated Borges more than anything else about *Ulysses*, however, was the language Joyce used. He saw Joyce as a writer with an exceptional concern for the texture and quality of language, and spoke of him as one who wrote prose that aspired to the condition of poetry. He praised the rhythms and cadences of the writing and marvelled at its beauty and experimental quality. For all that he admired Joyce, however, Borges took the view that both the major works were essentially failures, and that Joyce would have been better off concentrating on writing poetry such as the poems that appeared in *Chamber Music*. If he had nothing but praise for what he called Joyce’s ability with “word music”, he felt that this was not what was needed in order to write a novel.

In 1945, a complete translation of *Ulysses* into Spanish by José Salas Subirats was finally published (Joyce 1945). In his review of this translation, Borges is again complimentary of Joyce’s verbal skills but sceptical about the shape of the novel: “*Ulysses* perhaps contains the most chaotic and boring pages ever found, but it also includes the most perfect […] that perfection is verbal”.

---

2 The original reads: “*El Ulises, tal vez, incluye las páginas más caóticas y tediosas que registra la historia, pero también las más perfectas. Lo repito, esa perfección es verbal*” (Borges 2011b, 234).
He maintains that translating *Ulysses* is essentially an impossible task, or at least that what the translator should do is be as playful and inventive with the Spanish language as Joyce is with English. When this translator does not do that, Borges claims that he fails: “[Salas Subirats] tends to fail when he restricts himself to the translation of meaning.” He continues: “Joyce stretches and distorts the English language; his translator has a duty to undertake similar liberties”.

This points up Borges’s own approach to translation, which was always inclined to favour freedom and inventiveness. His own translation technique was to employ the original as a source of inspiration for the production of a text that was really a co-creation of the original author and the translator.

We can see this in Borges’s version of the page from *Ulysses* that he translated in 1925, a version of the last page of Molly’s soliloquy. Perhaps the most notable liberty taken by Borges in this translation is the transposition of the setting from Dublin to Buenos Aires. Borges does this by omitting the references to geographical place names that occur in the original, and also by having Molly use the *voseo* forms of Argentine Spanish. Here is an example: “the sun shines for you he said the day we were lying among the rhododendrons on Howth head” [“*para vos brilla el sol me dijo el día que estábamos tirados en el pasto*”] (quoted in Waisman 2005, 166). It is worth noting that what is happening here is not so much the deployment of verbal ingenuity and wordplay as Borges simply taking a liberal approach to the transposition of setting and to the invention of appropriate expressions conveying the sense of the original. The unexpected turns of phrase are not strange inventions or distortions but simply the use of a range of suitably creative expressions and approximate equivalents that capture the essence of Joyce’s text rather than attempting to stand as exact verbal equivalents of the original.

Borges identified with Joyce himself in a number of ways, and not least—perhaps ironically—as an émigré, someone who stands outside his home culture. As we know, Joyce, via Stephen Daedalus, spoke of using “silence, exile and cunning” to overcome stultifying nationalism and petty narrow-mindedness; these were, for him, the restrictive nets of “home, fatherland and church”.

---

3 The original reads: “*En esta primera versión hispánica del Ulises, Salas Subirats suele fracasar cuando se limita a traducir el sentido. Joyce dilata y reforma el idioma inglés; su traductor tiene el deber de ensayar libertades congéneres*” (Borges 2011b, 235).
Like Joyce, Borges thought in broad terms about the world and about culture in general, but also like him, he combined that universal vision with a strong sense of a bond with his native land. Unlike Borges, however, Joyce lived outside Ireland for more or less all his adult life. The Argentinean writer, on the other hand, spent virtually all his adult life in his native Buenos Aires, although he had spent his youth from age fourteen until he was twenty-one living with his family in various European countries. But what Borges identified with in a special way was the sense that Joyce, as an Irish writer, could come to the language in which he was composing as an outsider; he saw Joyce, and other Irish writers, as people who used the language of the colonizer in which to express themselves, but who were prone to “disrupting” the language. He felt that this “outsider” dimension brought particular qualities to their work, including a special adeptness at using the language that injected it with a freshness that more mainstream writers might not achieve.

He exulted in the sense of a broader cultural outlook, calling himself “an ‘international’ writer who resides in Buenos Aires”. He would claim that “not to belong to an homogeneous ‘national’ culture is perhaps not a poverty but a richness” (Heaney et al. 74). His own stories were often set in no particular locale or identifiable place. But Borges’s most important statement in this regard was a lecture he gave in 1951, subsequently published as “The Argentine Writer and Tradition” (“El escritor argentino y la tradición”; Borges 2011a). In an era of ardent nationalism, fomented by Peronism, Borges was being criticized around that time for not writing literature that was sufficiently imbued with national Argentine traits. His stories—especially some of the classic ones such as “The Library of Babel”, “The Circular Ruins” or “Tlön, Uqbar, Orbis Tertius”—were often tales that seemed to take place in a kind of nowhere and that certainly did not reference Argentina in terms of setting or culture. The result was that, in 1942, when the so-called “National Culture Commission” in Argentina evaluated Borges’s anthology for the purposes of awarding the National Prize for Literature, they came to the conclusion that the award could not be bestowed on Borges. The members of the panel based this decision on the fact that Borges’s book was not “Argentinean” enough (Balderston 2013,

4 In his 1925 essay on *Ulysses*, he had stated: “Siempre los irlandeses fueron agitadores famosos de la literatura de Inglaterra” (Borges 2011, 71).
9). The jury condemned Borges’s work for its “character as dehumanized literature”, as a “dark and arbitrary cerebral game”, and described it as “exotic and decadent work”. This is the background for Borges’s lecture on the Argentine writer and tradition. In it, he was adamant that it was a grave mistake to insist on “the idea that Argentine poetry should abound in features that differentiate it as Argentine and in local Argentinean colour”.

Borges’s summary of his position is that the Argentine tradition is that of all Western culture, and that his compatriots have as much or more right to it than any Western nation. In this context, he cites the case of Jewish writers and their position as being both within and outside of the European tradition. He also refers to Irish writers, such as Shaw, Berkeley and Swift, about whom he says that it was enough for them to feel different, to feel Irish, in order for them to be great innovators in the English language. He concludes:

It seems to me that we Argentines, we South Americans in general, are in an analogous position [to the Irish]; we can deal with all the European themes, without any sense of awe or superstition in relation to them, and with an irreverence that can lead to, and does lead to, very fortunate outcomes.

It is worth adding that, in his preparations for this lecture, Borges noted briefly the connection between this kind of approach and the sense of liberation that it allows; his emphasis is on the freedom from tradition that the sense of being an outsider can bring to the writer. In a note in his manuscript, he wrote: “Tradition as freedom, as repertoire. Thorstein Veblen and the Jews.

---

5 By way of contrast, the winning entry in the competition, the novel Cancha larga by Eduardo Acevedo Díaz, was considered by the panel to be “a valuable document describing those things that are truly ours […] an undeniably Argentinean work”; in the original Spanish, this reads: “un documento valioso sobre cosas nuestras […] una obra indiscutiblemente argentina” (quoted in Marengo 2003, 5).

6 In the original: “literatura deshumanizada, de alambique, más aún de oscuro y arbitrario juego cerebral […] una obra exótica y de decadencia” (quoted in Podlubne 2009, 45).

7 Original: “La idea de que la poesía argentina debe abundar en rasgos diferenciales argentinos y en color local argentino” (Borges 2011a, 552).

8 Original: “Creo que los argentinos, los sudamericanos en general, estamos en una situación análoga; podemos manejar todos los temas europeos, manejarlos sin supersticiones, con una irreverencia que puede tener, y ya tiene, consecuencias afortunadas” (Borges 2011a, 556).
The case of the Irish, our case.”

Here we see him making a direct link not only between the writer’s need for freedom within tradition and the evidence of this in Irish writing, but also between this Irish characteristic and the case of Argentineans. What this amounts to is an exploration of the complexity of identity, the use of the trope of the Irish writer, seen as a kind of “insider-outsider,” who uses the language of the colonizer without being entirely committed to all the cultural values associated with it.

To Borges, Ireland served as an emblem of mixed cultural identity, complex human conflict, and a nationalism and zeal for independence that existed alongside consummate literary accomplishments. The provincial narrow-mindedness that was rejected by an author such as James Joyce was precisely the kind of limiting paradigm of nationhood that Borges himself rejected in his own country. Borges always maintained a genuine interest in Ireland, and especially, of course, in a wide array of Irish writers. Not only was he an admirer of famous authors such as Wilde, Joyce, Yeats, Swift, Shaw and George Berkeley, but also of less well-known writers such as George Moore, Liam O’Flaherty and Lord Dunsany. When he eventually visited Ireland in 1982, it was to “see”—at least in his mind’s eye—the Dublin depicted in *Ulysses* and to celebrate the virtues of those great writers whom he admired. Above all, perhaps, what stirred him was the combination he witnessed in Ireland of consummate literary and linguistic skill with the transcendence of oppressive insularity.

**REFERENCES**


---

9 Original: “La tradición como libertad, como repertorio. Thorstein Veblen y los judíos. El caso de los irlandeses, el nuestro” (quoted in Balderston 2013, 4).


In a heterosexist Africa, same-sex desires are forbidden by law. A very distinctive example of this can be found in the so-called Same-Sex Marriage Prohibition Act passed in 2014 by Nigerian president Goodluck Jonathan in which he prohibited these “un-African” unions imprisoning or even murdering afroqueer individuals. This conception of same-saxe desire lays bare the precariousness, and the constant violation of human rights LGBTQI+ collectivities experience. New generations of African arti(vi)sts such as the Nigerian Chinelo Okparanta with her short story “Grace” (2013), the Nigerian Arinze Ifeakandu with his story “God’s Children Are Little Broken Things” (2013) and the Kenyan Troy Onyango with his story “The Transfiguration” (2016) are discussing otherised subjectivities to encourage a move from un-African conceptions of the self. These emerging authors explore fully African sexual practices in an attempt to modify the collective imaginary and normalise queer intimacies.

**Keywords**: (Afro)queerness, same-sex desire, (neo)colonialism, gender, Africa.

**INTRODUCTION**

This article must commence with a concise epistemological remapping of gender in pre-colonial Africa where it was not conceived as a binary, hierarchical system; on the contrary, gender identity and gender roles were fluid, never as monolithic and fixed as in the Global North. Colonialism made feasible the imposition of this dyadic structure that operated in the West but was absolutely alien to Africans. Authors such as Ifi Amadiume or Oyeronke Oyewumi have extensively discussed the expression of gender identity in pre-colonial Nigeria in an attempt to unearth a rhizomatous paradigm of a queer Africa. Nonetheless, queer subjectivities are held as un-African imports from the West which
unmistakably exposes the extent of (neo)colonial (identitary and social) biopolitics that have distorted African belief-systems. Oyewumi highlighted that

western gender categories are presented as inherent in nature (of bodies) and operate on a dichotomous, binarily opposed male/female, man/woman duality in which the male is assumed to be superior and therefore the defining category, [which] is particularly alien to many African cultures (2002, 4).

She further argues that “[t]he original impulse to apply this assumption transculturally is rooted in the simplistic notion that gender is a natural and universal way of organizing society and that male privilege is its ultimate manifestation” (1997, 32). It should not be overlooked that gender was not the central organising principle in indigenous Igbo and Yoruba ethnic groups in Nigeria. In these societies, seniority and social positioning constituted the central organising principles.

Ifi Amadiume, another pioneering author, theorised about those nuanced gender manifestations in indigenous Africa through the study of the Igbo village town Nnobi as shown in her path-breaking study *Male Daughters and Female Husbands: Gender and Sex in an African Society* (1987). The Nnobi clan showcased the flexibility of gender through those “male daughters” or women who had “the status of a son and [were] able to inherit her [their] father’s property” due to the absence of closer male lineage members ([1987] 2015, 32). Indeed, women-to-women marriage in this society was a usual practice carried out as a strategy to achieve power and economic success ([1987] 2015, 70). This is one of the reasons why “female husbandry” must not be mistaken with what we understand as present-day lesbianism. Chantal Zabus has also provided numerous instances of same-sex relationships between men in other African ethnic groups as a *rite of passage* or as non-normative forms of socialisation though never as a form of homosexuality as understood by the West. It would be interesting here to recall the male-male non-penetrative practice of “boy-wifery” in South Africa and the practice of “mine marriages” (2013) as illustrations of diverse portrayals of socialisation.

In most present-day African countries, same-sex unions are punished by imprisonment (up to fourteen years), corrective rape, lynching, flagellation or even the death penalty. To exemplify this reality, I will allude to the homophobic and transphobic *Same-Sex Marriage Prohibition Act* (SSMPA) passed and enforced in 2014 by the then-president Goodluck Jonathan which prohibited
those “immoral behaviours”—typified as sodomy, abomination or perversion—imprisoning and even executing those who dare to come out and express their queerness. Not only have certain laws inherited from the British colonial period had an ever-lasting effect on African vulnerable queer bodies but they have also entailed a backlash in terms of human and social rights for contemporary African societies. LGBTQI+ subjects are stigmatised, discriminated against (specially if they have a HIV/AIDS status) or sexually abused by police forces and citizen “vigilantes” on a daily basis. Traditions, customs and a strong conception of family as the cornerstones of African societies are presented as one of the main arguments against queer relationships. Presumably, and from a societal perspective, homosexuality and transgenderism would topple essential African institutions such as family and clan and these structural changes would result in a greater communal change which is clearly unwanted. The authors addressed in this paper aptly write about queer desire in Nigeria and Kenya from an un-stigmatising and humanising perspective to denounce those crystallised chimeras (neo)colonialism have deeply ingrained in the African collective imaginary. These literary manifestations might also be held as routes to re-connect with a truly African identity, to take roots by means of these rhizomatic and multifaceted stories.

In the literary arena, there is a growing repertoire of afroqueer characters in, for instance, Wole Soyinka’s The Interpreters (1965), Ama Ata Aidoo’s Our Sister Killjoy (1977), Mariama Bâ’s Scarlet Song (1981), Unoma N. Azuah’s Sky-High Flames (2005), Jude Dibia’s Walking with Shadows (2006) or Chimamanda Ngozi Adichie’s The Thing Around your Neck (2009). The fact that these writers discuss diverse manifestations of homoerotic and transerotic desire in a non-monolithic manner entails a(n) (re)emergence of this reality within the collective African and global imaginary so that a new awareness can raise and a new acceptance of the Other is eventually granted. The three short stories discussed in this section re-articulate conceptions of queerness in Africa providing the reader with a kaleidoscopic account of what it means to be part of a sexual minority in Nigeria and Kenya. Chinelo Okparanta, Arinze Ifeakandu and Troy Onyango build non-essentialising testimonies that gravitate towards alternative conceptions of Africa(ns/nness).

The first short story, “Grace”, is included in the Anglo-Igbo collection Happiness, like Water (2013) written by the Nigerian, US-based writer, Chinelo Okparanta. She introduces what Unoma N. Azuah coined as the emergent les-
bian voice (2005, 130) since she explores same-sex desire between two women (one of them is Nigerian and the other is North-American) in present-day America. This text could be placed under the label of Black Queer Diaspora since it “offers the diasporic queer as the exemplary subject of globalization, in order to posit an analogy between queerness as that which subverts gender normativity, and diaspora as that which troubles geographic and national stability” (Wesling 2008, 31). In this story we only get the name of the protagonist, a young Nigerian student of Theology, Grace, but we never get the name of the professor for whom she falls. Grace can therefore be categorised as the Afro-diasporic Queer Other in her being a body in transit in sexual and geographical terms. Her multiple positionings across lines of age, geography, ethnicity or social status together with sexual and gender identity invites an intersectional approach to the character and her conflicts.

Thematically, Grace tackles religious fundamentalism in consonance with non-normative sexual identities (given that she is a closeted lesbian), along with “deviant” notions of womanhood. These questions are mediated through the academic and romantic relationship the protagonist initiates with her Old Testament professor. The latter addresses Grace’s dilemmas from a commonsensical standpoint as she seeks to exemplify that Catholicism and alternative sexual orientations can be reconciled. For Grace, this inner conflict is evident, particularly when she is forced to marry a wealthy Nigerian man. She [Grace] tells me that this morning she finally got the courage to say something to her mother. That she walked down the hallway in their house, climbed up the stairs and into the attic, because her mama was there, sorting piles of paper, maybe business papers. She says to her mama, ‘I’m not marrying him.’ [...] ‘Stop that nonsense,’ she finally says. And then her brother Arinze walks into the attic room, holding a box [...] ‘Mama, I’m not getting married,’ Grace says. [...] ‘All that studying’, her mother says. ‘You’ll marry your studies? Marry your books? You already have one degree but you want another. You’ll marry your degrees? [...] She tells her mama then that it’s not for her. ‘What’s not for you?’ her mother asks. ‘Marriage,’ she says. ‘Marriage is not for you?’ [...] What good

1 Grace’s name keeps a symbolic liaison with Christianity, ironically implying that a person who thinks her sexuality is unnatural or immoral, who does not follow normative notions of (hetero)sexuality and considered a disgrace in her home country may be blessed by the same God some believe condemns homosexuality.
is having that doctorate that you’re going for, if your life is empty — no husband, no children’ […] Grace then turns to leave the attic room, but something makes her turn back. So she stands facing her mama. She fixes her eyes on one of the holes on the brick wall. […] Then she says, calmly, in a clear, firm voice, ‘I won’t.’ (Okparanta 2013, 137–138, emphasis added)

We must outline the significance of the spatial dimension of this excerpt: the attic. As it invokes the acclaimed work by Sandra M. Gilbert and Susan Gubar (1979), the attic is a space of reclusion, a prison for those transgressive subjects who do not follow normativity. Here, Grace could be read under these terms as a self-censored character who is trapped in a symbolic heterosexist attic by a homophobic family. She shares with Charlotte Brönte’s Bertha Mason the anomalous position of the unconventional, restrained and criminal uncanny. If theorised in the homosexual rhetoric, the “closet” is a space of oppression where dissident subjectivities have been forcibly confined by a society thoroughly heterocisnormative and patriarchal, but it also contains a potential for transgression and non-conformism; a space of symbolic female dissidence.

Additionally, Grace’s statement that conventional marriage is not for her is a tour de force for two reasons: Grace deviates from sexual standards established by her Nigerian society and family and second, she contests fixed gender roles, performing a reappropriated womanhood and Nigerianness.²

The second Anglo-Igbo short story titled “God’s Children Are Little Broken Things” was written by Nigerian Arinze Ifeakandu in 2013. This coming-of-age text narrates the story of two African male young adults and lovers—Lotanna and Kamsi—and their homosexual experience delineating the impact this had on the construction of their sexual identities and masculinities. The protagonists of this story depict a contemporary masculinity exponentially distanced from hegemonic codes of manhood but, nonetheless, still subjected to heterosexist precepts. We find, then, an overlapping of traditional and modern practices that intersect in contestation, crisis and transition.

² In an African context, sexual identity is linked up to national identity. In other words, heterosexuality is considered to be part of the Africanness (or the Nigerianness for this matter) of anyone belonging to this continent; that is why Arinze (Grace’s older brother) is considered “more” African than Grace herself, simply because he is Nigerian and heterosexual (being both part of the African Diaspora).
Religion is another key theme in this story. Lotanna and Kamsi are censored, to a certain extent, by religion and also by their parents. Parents play a more crucial role when it comes to disciplining their children’s sexuality. Eventually, parents are successful in this task:

You create dreams in which he comes and talks with you. You talk and talk and laugh and laugh, and it feels like you are stretching a fractured arm, testing it. When you wake up the room is so fucking cold. You want to ask him, Why? And, Did you think about me? And, Why didn't you just endure like everyone else? You walk into your room. There is no power. You light a candle, and everything else becomes shadows. You call Dad. He sounds surprised: Lotanna? [...] Tonight, you dream that he walks into this room. He is wearing his Arsenal jersey and green shorts. He lies beside you and says, What happened to you, Lotanna? You look so broken. (Ifeakandu 2013, 20)

These thoughts of melancholy and yearning are proof of the inner battling Lotanna and Kamsi experience. These ambivalent characters are deeply constrained by the vision society has of homosexuals and their transgressive sexualities. Homosexuals counter-intuitively reject their homosexuality since it is perceived as corruption or deviation even though they embrace it when they follow their innermost sexual instincts. It is worth noticing the confusion and alienation these subjects experience—doubly precarious because of their age and their sexual orientation.

The final short story that is going to be discussed in this paper is called “The Transfiguration” (2016), written by the Kenyan author, Troy Onyango. This is a hybrid text, since it combines narration and photography, which is in keeping with the nature of the main character of this story as she is a transitioning Kenyan woman. In fact, the title of this story speaks of the nomadism, and both physical and religious conversion undergone by an abject body who is turning into something else, something more spiritual and transcendental. Once again, religious references are present in this story where a transfiguration of this converted individual slowly takes place. This and the other two stories under analysis resignify dogmatic notions Catholicism has traditionally had on homosexuality and queerness pointing out a transfigured vision of LGBTQI+ collectivities in contemporary Africa.

In Kenya, transgender people are still persecuted. In the words of the human (trans) rights advocate Audrey Mbugua: “[t]ranssexualism is a high-
ly misunderstood subject in Kenya. Some conflate it with inter-sexuality and hermaphroditism [and homosexuality as well]” (2009, n.p.). A reductionist conception of not just homosexuals but transgender individuals is explicitly underlined throughout the analysis of these texts which showcase a society unwelcoming for non-conforming subjects.

He’s the only one who took me in and gave me a roof over my head when all my relatives said they could not let a shoga into their house. This was after Beka, my sister, walked in on me one Saturday afternoon. She found the neighbour’s son and me stark naked; two boys shagging like two dogs in autumn. I tried pleading with her not to tell mother but her vicious self wouldn’t be silent. She told mother that same evening. Mother took to prayer with a rejuvenated spirit—reading verses of the Bible and telling me about the transfiguration of Christ. [...] My father became aloof. He wore a vacant and expressionless look like he had stared into a dark pit and seen something he wasn’t supposed to; a kraken of sorts. [...] More than a year and I hadn’t touched another boy. Three months later, I was out on the streets. (Onyango 2016, 129)

This is another instance of the treatment shogas receive from their own families.³ The protagonist is not merely passing as a homosexual or a transvestite woman; she can be defined as a transgender or just a queer who lacks social and familiar recognition and validation except for that “friend of hers” (Mzamodo) who “unconditionally” supports her. This ill-reputed man was the only one who took the protagonist in when she was rejected by her family and provided her with hormones (whose quality was probably no good) for her sex-change therapy in return for her cleaning services (and, very possibly, her sexual services). Help comes at a cost since he actively takes advantage of her underprivileged situation, building dependency from her, but she is ready to overlook this exploitation if she eventually becomes a woman Mzamodo would accept as his wife. Marrying and behaving like a wife for him might make her (inner and outer) transition total and, hence, she would conclude that transfiguration she is going through. Another theme that needs to be delved into is corporeality of (transgender) women in Africa and worldwide. Although

³ In Kenya, a shoga has a number of negative connotations; it may mean homosexual, a man related to women, a catamite, a faggot, a transvestite or a queer subject.
briefly, I will refer to the hybridity of this text (as combining narration and photography) which is exemplified through the portraits of modified Barbie dolls created by the Atlanta-based photographer Sheila Pree Bright for her 2003 photographic series *Plastic Bodies* which clearly aims to unsettle traditional notions of womanhood.

**Conclusion**

To conclude, I would like to emphasise the relevance of these texts which daringly expose African realities that need to be brought to the fore in order to start conversations in which these afroqueer and afrodiasporic characters are no longer peripheral and in which alternative conceptions of desire and intimacies are eventually acknowledged. To this end, literature aptly works as a powerful form of liberation while showing the way for new forms of being African and gay, African and lesbian, African and wo/man or African and queer in the twenty-first century.

**References**


Bremón’s *The Double Cuckold* (1678) and Marmion’s *A Fine Companion* (1633): A Revision of the Literary Sources of Durfey’s *Sir Barnaby Whigg* (1681)

Alberto Zambrana Ramírez
Universidad de Sevilla
alzambra@gmail.com

**Abstract**

Even though he was a very prolific playwright, Thomas Durfey remains a largely neglected author and his work has attracted little critical attention (McVeagh). His comedy *Sir Barnaby Whigg* (1681) was produced at the time of the political turmoil which dominated England during the Exclusion Crisis (1678–1682), and has traditionally been analyzed through the prism of a reaction against Shadwell and as a Tory satire on the Whigs (Owen 1996, 194). This paper will focus instead on the two literary sources which form the basis of Durfey’s comedy in order to shed new light on the construction of the play. We will also see how Durfey adhered to the common Restoration practice of mixing literary material from several sources. Somehow, authors felt that one single piece afforded insufficient diversion to the audience, and therefore they freely searched within a literary network that encompassed output of diverse nature and provenance.

**Keywords**: Thomas Durfey, *Sir Barnaby Whigg*, sources, *The Double Cuckold*, *A Fine Companion*.

In Act 3 of Thomas Durfey’s *Sir Barnaby Whigg* (1681), the second scene discovers the vast majority of the play’s characters together with “A table and Musicians”, showing evident signs that a dance is about to follow. At some point during this scene, Sir Walter Wiseacre, the double cuckold of the comedy, praises his uncle Sir Barnaby’s musical skills, who proceeds to sing a song as follows: “Farewell my Lov’d Science, my former delight, / Moliere is quite rifled, then how should I write? / My fancy’s grown sleepy, my quibbling is done; / And design or invention, alas! I have none […]” (28). A few lines later
Sir Barnaby continues: “I got Fame by filching from Poems and Plays, but my Fidling and Drinking has lost me the Bays [...]” (28).

In an article published in 2005, Maria José Mora has discussed Durfey’s comedy in terms of a literary response to Shadwell’s prior attack in A True Widow (1679), reassessing the weight of the widespread jibes at Shadwell studied by some scholars. This song, according to the author, represents “a thorough bashing of Shadwell as a poet” (121) and is meant to ridicule his theatrical production. Together with the allusions to the scientific experiments in Shadwell’s The Virtuoso (1676) and his manifested alignment with the comedy of humours, this song also contains explicit accusations of plagiarism. I would like to bring the attention to the ‘filching from Poems and Songs’, underscoring its significance within the cultural context of the Restoration period.

Issues of authorship have never gone unnoticed throughout the history of literature. However, after Foucault’s influential essay ‘What is an Author?’ in the 1980s, some modern scholars seem to have placed a special focus on notions such as ‘literary borrowing, ‘appropriation’, ‘plagiarism’, ‘sources’ or ‘property’. The contributions of Gewirtz (1982), Hutcheon (1986), Mallon (1989), to name but some of the most representative cases, have analyzed these concepts from different theoretical perspectives. More recently, the works of Laura Rosenthal (1996) or Paulina Kewes (1998) have discussed some of these notions within the context of the Restoration period.

Borrowing from others, despite not being a literary practice exclusive to the Restoration, gained special prominence during this time. In fact, taking material from other sources was a common Restoration habit that collaterally led to frequent and agitated debates about the appropriateness of appropriating. Throughout his life, Durfey’s appropriating practices became the usual target of his contemporaries’ attacks, especially those launched by the dramatic cataloguer and writer Gerard Langbaine (1656–1692), whose biting comments on Durfey’s literary habits may rank as one of the main reasons for this author’s unfavourable literary reputation in history.

For Sir Barnaby Whigg, Durfey resorted to both French and English works. In An Account of the English Dramatick Poets (1691), Langbaine traces the origins of Durfey’s play: “this play is founded on a Novel of Monsieur S. Bremond, call’d The Double Cuckold; and part of the Humor of Captain Porruss is borrow’d from a Play called The Fine Companion” (184). The French source corresponds to Le Double cocu, to which Durfey might have had access.
either through the English translation by James Morgan in 1678, or given his French ascendancy, directly from the French itself.\(^1\) For the construction of Captain Porpuss, Durfey in all likelihood found inspiration in Captain Whible, a character taken from Marmion’s pre-civil war drama *A Fine Companion* (1633).

If we compare the works, the similitudes between Durfey’s play and *The Double Cuckold* come to the foreground immediately (Grobe 1954, 178–87). One of the most significant similarities affects the selection of characters. Contrary to what might be expected, the character of Sir Barnaby in the comedy does not occupy a central position in the development of the action. The basis of the play is actually grounded on five principal characters: Sir Walter Wiseacre (1), tired of his conventional, tedious marriage with Millicent (2) and secretly in love with Livia (3), decides to hire Jack Townly (4), “a modish inconstant young fellow, in love with, and beloved by all women and courts alike”, as described in the *Dramatis Personae*. Townly’s loving advances to Millicent are meant to clear the way for Wiseacre’s loving aspirations with Livia. Yet Millicent, not entirely unaware of her husband’s unfaithful intentions, convinces Townly to get closer to Livia, who turns out to be Captain Porpuss’s (5) wife, thus frustrating Sir Walter’s expectations. Most of the action of the comedy is therefore built upon the complex love intrigues affecting these characters, an aspect which runs strikingly parallel to the train of events of its alleged source *The Double Cuckold*: Don Fernand (1), the Viceroy of Catalonia, growing tired of his Vice Queen (2), engages Count Henry (4), a young gallant from Naples newly arrived at the court, to make advances to Donna Angelica (3), wife to the Grand Master (5) and the Viceroy’s secret object of desire. Most of the novel is equally constructed along a complex system of love intrigues which produce different types of scenarios.

These scenarios, in turn, develop along a substantially similar basis. Tediumness in marriage and jealousy are weighty guiding principles at the heart of both plots. Don Fernand states that his wife is “jealous and troubles me continually with her importunities”. He wonders: “What remedy is there for me? I have try’d thousand ways in vain, she hath counter turn’d all my inven-

---

\(^1\) Durfey was the son of a French Huguenot who had fled the Catholic siege of La Rochelle in 1628 (McVeagh 2000, 3).
tions. I am continually wearied with her endless complaints and reproaches” (19–20). He describes his monotonous marriage through food imagery: “The quiet possession palled him, and being disgusted with the continual serving up of the same diet, he was resolv’d to divert himself with change when he could, at the expence of others” (1–2). In the same way, in Durfey’s comedy, Sir Walter declares: “I’m fed up with an everlasting dish of Mutton; yesterday she was Mutton. To day she’s Mutton, and to morrow she will be Mutton; and for a man to feed eternally upon Mutton, -a Pox on’t, ‘tis unreasonable” (2.2, p. 24). 2

Jealousy occupies a prominent position in both literary pieces as well. In the novel, we are reminded that “a little jealousy is sufficient to disunite two women; A bare suspicion will dissolve the strongest tye of friendship that can be between them” (4). The play, in turn, contains constant allusions to jealousy. Take this quote for example: “[…] Jealousie, that Canker of Wedlock, that Aquafortis of Matrimony, that eats and eats so damnably, till it hath devour’d all the love betwixt man and wife […].” (1.1, p. 18).

The evolution of the action in The Double Cuckold contains narrative devices that are subsequently treated by Durfey in performative terms. For example, the two works employ outdoor scenes in gardens or labyrinths. Although these scenes do not develop along identical ways, both works identify them as dangerous, sneaking venues prone to create confusion in the characters. In The Double Cuckold, we can see Count Henry on his bending knees next to an arbor, holding Donna Angelica’s hands. At this point, Don Fernand glimpses them but is unable to identify the female lover. Later in the novel, Don Fernand explains to the Count that it is Donna Angelica whom he loves, and asks him to refrain from staying with Donna Angelica alone. In Sir Barnaby Whigg, for instance, the garden is described as “the Retreat of Lewdness, the very Mart of Debauchery: Here the raw Country-Fop treats the Town-Bully; the sneaking Cuckold his ugly Wife, and more ugly Offspring; the Spindle-Shank’d Prentice his Dirty Drab, and the Court Flesh fly his Miss of Quality” (4.2, p.37).

Outdoor scenes are complemented with indoor scenes in both literary sources. One of the most significant instances refers to the use of closets as

---

2 The references to food in the play are mainly applied to the character of Sir Barnaby, pictured as a “huge fat fellow, one of Oliver’s Knights”. Sir Barnaby’s obesity is intended to further ridicule Thomas Shadwell.
hiding rendezvous for lovers, usually displaying an unpredicted but somewhat comical outcome. In the novel, the Count’s suspicious movements have caused Don Fernand to disguise himself as a spy at the door of the closet where the Count is hiding. Don Fernand knocks at the closet but the Count, unable to ascertain the identity of a figure with a hat on, struggles with Don Fernand. Unexpectedly, the Grand Master meets Don Fernand on his way out but, taking him for a thief, drubs him with a cane. In a similar way, in *Sir Barnaby Whigg*, the closet serves a comical purpose. In one of the most farcical moments of the play, Livia, uncertain about her husband’s whereabouts, presses Townly to get into the closet. What she was unaware of is that the closet had already been occupied by another gallant, Benedick. Sir Walter appears on stage with a light looking for Livia and she is urged to hand him the keys to the closet. She informs her woman of the situation but mistakenly lets Benedick out instead of Townly. By the time they finally discover their mistake, Townly has managed to leap out of the balcony.

Thematic borrowings find a clear example in one of the most hilarious scenes of Durfey’s comedy, which is taken directly from *The Double Cuckold*. In the novel, Count Henry assumes the identity of Donna Brigitta in order to easily gain admittance to Donna Angelica’s apartment. Townly in *Sir Barnaby Whigg* assumes a female identity in order to get easy access to Livia’s apartment, but far from making things easier, Captain Porpuss’s immediate attraction to Livia’s fake sister worsens the situation. This direct thematic borrowing is further enhanced by a similar treatment as regards the type of language employed by both Captains. In the novel, the Grand Master resorts to his military expressions. In the play, Captain Porpuss displays his abrupt, blunt sailor language.

Durfey’s resolution of the play does not seem to have a correspondence in that of its alleged source. The novel concludes with the flight of Count Henry and Donna Angelica, which bears no resemblance to the way in which the play concludes. *Sir Barnaby Whigg* ends with Sir Walter threatening Townly with punishment for having made of himself a “double Cuckold both in Wife and Mistress, and therefore double shall be the punishment”, to which the Captain adds, “Nay, it shall be Treble, for I’ll have a snack of him, by Mars” (5.2, p. 61).

As this analysis has shown, *Sir Barnaby Whigg*’s substantial dependence on *The Double Cuckold* does not seem to leave scope for doubt. In the case of Marmion’s pre-Restoration play *A Fine Companion* (1633), Durfey retained some of the defining traits of Captain Whibble, a *Miles-Gloriosus* type of char-
acter from whom Durfey in all likelihood found inspiration to model Captain Porpuss. Both characters are unquestionably bound together by their humour, but they also exhibit differentiating features. On the one hand, Captain Porpuss’s role in *Sir Barnaby Whigg* is much more central and relevant for the development of the plot. Captain Whibble, by contrast, plays a much more marginal role in *A Fine Companion*. His presence is mostly associated with a character called Carelesse, a prodigal young man who benefits from his father’s whimsical decision to disinherit his worthy older brother. Captain Whibble is usually seen accompanied by “crowd of sponging, tavern-dwelling swaggerers” (Sonnenshein 1968, xxxvi). Divergences between Whibble and Porpuss do not end here. As opposed to Porpuss, Whibble is a coward. There are situations in *A Fine Companion* which testify to Whibble’s lack of prowess. For instance, In Act 3, Scene 4, Whibble is being pushed by Fido, a friend of Careless’s. Instead of responding with violence, Whibble congratulates him on his bravery and promises Fido and his friends to treat them to dinner. Similarly, in Act 4, Scene 4, Whibble finds himself immersed in the middle of a plan designed by Fido intended to reveal the captain’s worthless nature. For that, Careless disguises and challenges Whibble to become his patron in a quarrel, but Whibble refuses and calls him “pitifull, drunken, shallow coxcomb”. Careless reacts by kicking and beating him.

Whibble and Porpuss also differ in their marital status, Porpuss being a married man in *Sir Barnaby Whigg*, which provides an extra opportunity to create more intrigue in the play.

Finally, Porpuss and Whibble are bound together by their use of language (Watson 1931, 139–44). Both of them display a blunt, coarse type of linguistic productions which is even hard to understand for the rest of the characters. One of Porpuss’s early speeches in the play is self-explanatory:

Once! I tell thee I do love thee: by Mars I do; Prithee furl thay Sails and let me view thee a little; I have no fine phrases, but by Boreas I affect thee heartily, thy face, thy leg, thy shape, thy everything: When wilt thou come to the Tower, and let me salute thee with the great Guns—hah? Bounce, bounce, bounce, thou shalt have Royal sport my Girl (1.1, p.2).

Sir Barnaby himself, referring to Porpuss’s language, expresses that “tis impossible to understand him; for he stuffs a story so full of Sea-terms, the Devil himself can’t tell what he means” (2.1, p. 20). In the same line, Sir Walter
pleads with him to stop “this blustering: Gad thou hast got so many Damn’d, cramp, hard Sea-words, they are enough to fright an Honest Country Gentleman out of the Company” (1.1, p.4). Sonnenshein has noted at least one direct verbal borrowing present in Durfey’s comedy. After briefly introducing himself, Porpuss boasts about his sea experience: “I have stood and fac’d both frigid and torrid Zones, plough’d up the Bosphorous like a Molehill, kindled a Torch in the Sun, shot both the Gulfs of Venice and Florida, and seen the Navel of the World, you Scoundrel” (1.1, p.4). In the same fashion, Whibble in A Fine Companion states: “I haue bene stil’d, the rocke of Pirats, I; I haue plowd up the Sea, till Bosphorus Has worshipt me; I haue shot all the Gulphes, And seene the navell of the world, you stinkard (3.4, f2r).

To sum up, in the preface to The Miser (1672), Thomas Shadwell tried to forestall accusations of plagiarism acknowledging his debt to Molière while simultaneously stressing his contribution: “The Foundation of this Play I took from one of Moliere’s called L’Avare; but that having too few persons, and too little action for an English Theater, I added to both so much, that I may call more than half of this Play my own” (Mora 2005, 98). In Sir Barnaby Whigg, Durfey does not acknowledge his sources, but the path followed to shape his work does not leave scope for doubt. At least in four of the five acts of Sir Barnaby Whigg the plot runs parallel to that of The Double Cuckold, only deviating at the end with the inclusion of different characters to complicate the intrigue. For the literary construction of Captain Porpuss, however, Durfey adopted and adapted features from Marmion’s Whibble, managing to create an unmistakably comical character modelled on a type that was becoming popular on the Restoration stage: the blunt sailor. By combining two sources and building on them, Durfey—like Shadwell—tried to satisfy the taste of Restoration audiences for greater variety and complexity in comic material.

REFERENCES


Langbaine, Gerard. 1691. *An Account of the English Dramatick Poets*. California: California UP.


Part II
Language and Linguistics
Interference in Sentence Processing:
The Case of Negation

IRIA DE-DIOS-FLORES
Universidad de Santiago de Compostela
Basque Center on Cognition, Brain and Language
iria.dedios@usc.gal

Abstract
This paper investigates different configurations of negation with the aim of studying their perceived acceptability in a speeded judgement task. Departing from negative polarity item (NPI) illusions, this research focuses on similar sentences that, instead, contain two negative markers in different clauses (e.g., *The bills that no senators voted for have never become law*). The primary aim of the project is to ascertain whether the presence of the negative quantifier in the relative clauses impedes the identification of these sentences as grammatical. The experimental results show that the perception of acceptability of grammatical sentences with two negative markers is degraded when compared to the same sentences that contain only one negation. This finding bears interesting parallelisms with research on NPI illusions, and suggests that multiple negation sentences could represent a case of illusion of ungrammaticality.

Keywords: multiple negation, acceptability, grammatical illusions, interference.

1. Introduction

This paper investigates the processing of grammatical sentences that contain two negation markers. These sentences, exemplified in (1), will be referred to as multiple negation sentences. The main objective of the project is to determine whether the perception of acceptability of these grammatical sentences is reduced as a consequence of the presence of two negative elements, even though they appear in different clauses and are, therefore, structurally independent.

(1) The bills that no senators voted for have never become law.
Ultimately, this project aims at contributing to a broader experimental agenda on grammatical illusions. Grammatical illusions are cases of mismatch between the constraints of the grammar and actual language comprehension results (Phillips, Wagers & Lau 2011; Lewis & Phillips 2015). The label grammatical illusion is used to describe situations in which processing measures (e.g., speeded ratings, reading times, etc.) reveal that speakers do not seem to notice a grammatical error, while they clearly recognize the same sentences as unacceptable when given ample time (i.e., in offline acceptability judgements). Two paradigmatic cases of this are agreement illusions, illustrated in (2) (Bock & Miller 1991; Staub 2009), and negative polarity item illusions, illustrated in (3) (and covered in the next section). Even though (2) and (3) are clearly ungrammatical sentences, online processing measures reveal that the parser initially treats them as correct due to the presence of intervening elements: the plural cabinets in (2), and the negative quantifier no in (3).

(2) *The key to the cabinets are on the table.
(3) *The bills that no senators voted for have ever become law.

In spite of the fact that grammatical illusions have attracted much interest in the past few years, the opposite phenomenon—illusions of ungrammaticality—is less often discussed. Taking NPI illusions as a starting point, the present work explores multiple negation sentences like (1) as candidate structures for illusions of ungrammaticality. The rationale of the study is explained below, but first, it is necessary to discuss the specifics of NPI illusions that make multiple negation sentences an interesting case study.

1.1 Negative polarity item illusions

Negative polarity items (NPIs) constitute a closed class of lexical items—like ever or any—that are subject to very specific licensing conditions (see Barker 2018 for a recent review). One of the most prominent licensing environments are contexts that have some negative element. For example, in (4a) the NPI ever is licensed by the presence of the negative quantifier no in subject position, while its absence renders (4b/c) ungrammatical. As shown by the ungrammaticality of (4b), mere linear precedence of a negative element is not enough; the negative element must be structurally accessible.
(4) a. No authors [that the critics recommended] have ever received acknowledgement…
b. *The authors [that no critics recommended] have ever received acknowledgement…
c. *The authors [that the critics recommended] have ever received acknowledgement…

…for a best-selling novel. 
(Parker & Phillips 2016)

The interesting aspect of (4b) is that speakers often fail to notice the grammatical violation. This is because the presence of the negative quantifier no inside the relative clause reduces the effects of disruption. Even though (4b) and (4c) are equally ungrammatical, processing experiments find (4b) to be parsed with much more ease than (4c). Yet, when participants are given enough time to judge the sentences, they recognize both structures as unacceptable. This interference effect is known as NPI illusion; a subtype of grammatical illusion that has been found to occur in a variety of languages and measurements (Drenhaus, Saddy & Frisch 2005; Vasishth et al. 2008; Xiang, Dillon & Phillips 2009; Xiang, Grove & Giannakidou 2013; Parker & Phillips 2016; de-Dios-Flores, Muller & Phillips 2017; Yanilmaz & Drury 2018). These studies present different explanations for the processes by which NPI illusions emerge. For reasons of space, here is only a brief sketch of two existing hypotheses that make specific predictions for the sentences investigated here (i.e., multiple negation sentences).

On the one hand, Parker & Phillips (2016) present compelling evidence that NPI illusions can be turned off when extra material is included between the illicit licensor and the NPI. The authors interpreted this finding as evidence that NPI illusions reflect access to intermediate stages of parsing: when the NPI is checked against the licensing context soon after the relative clause as in (4b), the irrelevant negation may be transparently accessible to spuriously license the NPI. However, when the licensing context is accessed at a later point in time, the material inside the relative clause is no longer accessible for licensing. This proposal will be referred to as the changing encodings hypothesis. On the other hand, there is an alternative speculation which is only mentioned in passing by Parker & Phillips (2016) and that will be referred to as the ever-never confusability hypothesis. Under this hypothesis, the improved perception of illusion-like sentences reflects a confusion between ever and never due to the orthographic and phonological similarities between the two elements. Given
that the negative adverb *never* would provide a grammatical continuation, mis-representing *ever* as *never* could explain the improved perception. This investigation makes use of multiple negation sentences in order to test contrasting predictions sketched on the basis of the two previous accounts.

1.2 The present investigation: multiple negation

The main objective of this project is to study the perceived acceptability of multiple negation sentences in a processing demand task. In these sentences, the negative adverb *never* is linearly preceded by a structurally inaccessible negation—the quantifier *no* inside the relative clause. In order to track the acceptability of these structures, they will be compared to similar sentences containing only one negative marker (i.e., condition A, single negation), and to sentences in which the two negative elements form a dependency (condition C, double negation). This manipulation results in the three experimental contrasts shown in table 1. For the purpose of this investigation, single negation sentences are taken to be the simplest of the three and serve as an unproblematic baseline for comparison. On the other end, instances of double negation are used as some sort of ‘ungrammatical’ or degraded baseline\(^1\). These initial assumptions will be empirically validated in the experiment.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Single negation</th>
<th>The authors [that the critics recommended] have <em>never</em> received acknowledgement for a best-selling novel</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Multiple negation</td>
<td>The authors [that <em>no</em> critics recommended] have <em>never</em> received acknowledgement for a best-selling novel</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Double negation</td>
<td>No authors [that the critics recommended] have <em>never</em> received acknowledgement for a best-selling novel</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 1: Sample set of experimental conditions

Multiple negation sentences could be considered the opposite configuration of NPI illusions in that when the NPI *ever* is substituted by *never*,

\(^1\) Even though standard English is generally classified as a double negation language, double negative dependencies are expected to be perceived as unacceptable when encountered in the absence of contextual cues.
they become grammatical strings. Under the *ever-never confusability hypothesis*, they represent the configuration that is assumed to rescue NPI illusions. Therefore, this hypothesis predicts that multiple negation sentences should pose no processing or acceptability problems and, therefore, are expected to pattern closely to single negation sentences. The opposite outcome is predicted under the *changing encodings hypothesis*. Under this second hypothesis, illusions arise because the quantifier *no* in the relative clause is transparently available to license *ever* in early stages of parsing. The content that precedes *never* in multiple negation sentences is the same that precedes *ever* in NPI illusion configurations (see example (4)). Consequently, the negative quantifier *no* could also be transparently available to entertain a double negation dependency when *never* is encountered. Maintaining such localist double negation dependency between *no* and *never* would possibly generate a drop in the acceptance of multiple negation sentences relative to single negation. To arbitrate among these possibilities, the fundamental question that this research hopes to answer is whether multiple negation sentences pattern closer to single negation sentences or to double negation sentences.

2.Experimental evidence

In this experiment the speeded acceptability technique is used to investigate the perception of acceptability of multiple negation sentences. Speeded acceptability judgements have been reliably used as a time-sensitive measure to test grammatical illusion configurations (e.g., Drenhaus, Saddy & Frisch 2005; Parker & Phillips 2016; de-Dios-Flores, Muller & Phillips 2017). They are considered an online technique because the limited amount of time provided to respond forces participants to operate on fast and unconscious intuitions of grammaticality.

2.1. Methodology

2.1.1 Participants

The participants in this task were twenty-eight native speakers of English (19 female, mean age 20 y/o). They were recruited at the University of Mar-
yland using the participant database of the Department of Linguistics. Their participation in the task was compensated with a university credit or, alternatively, with 10$. All the participants provided informed consent and were unaware of the purpose of the experiment.

2.1.2 Materials

The experimental materials consisted of 36 like those in table 1. These were adapted from the stimuli used in Parker & Phillips (2016) by solely substituting the NPI ever by the negative adverb never. Each item had a version in one of the three conditions. Each different version was placed in a separate list using a Latin Square design, ensuring that no participant saw more than one version of a given item. The assignment of participants to one of the three resulting lists was completely random. The experimental materials were intermixed with 72 filler sentences of similar internal structure, length and complexity. In total, each list was composed of 108 items—half grammatical and half ungrammatical. In this way, the probabilities of providing a yes or no answer were initially equal. In order to achieve this ratio of grammatical-to-ungrammatical sentences, 42 fillers contained ungrammaticalities. These included preposition usage, number agreement, verbal morphology and pronoun-antecedent mismatches.

2.1.3 Procedure

The materials were presented on a desktop PC using Ibex (Alex Drummond, http://spellout.net/ibexfarm/). Each sentence was displayed word by word at a rate of 400 ms. per word, in the center of the screen, using the rapid serial visual presentation (RSVP) paradigm. At the end of each sentence, a response screen appeared and participants were asked to provide a yes/no button press judgement in a maximum time of 2 seconds. When participants failed to provide the judgement in time, a message indicated that they were too slow. Participants were instructed to read the sentences carefully and judge whether they came across as well-formed English. At the beginning, 6 practice items helped them familiarize with the procedure. The task lasted for approximately 30 minutes.
2.1.4 Data analysis

The yes/no responses collected were analyzed using a generalized linear mixed model for binomial distributions (Jaeger 2008). The analysis was carried out using R, an open-source programming environment for statistical computing (R Development Core Team 2014). Specifically, the model was estimated using the package lme4 for linear mixed effects models (Bates et al. 2015). An effect was considered to be statistically significant at the $p>0.05$ level when the absolute z-value was above 2.

2.2 Results

![Figure 1](image.png)

**Figure 1**: average percentage of “NO” responses for the experimental conditions calculated by participant. Error bars indicate standard error of the mean.

Figure 1 shows the average percentage of “NO” responses to each of the three experimental conditions. That is, the proportion of times that these sentences were not considered to be acceptable by the participants. Sentences con-
aining a single negation (condition A) were rejected in less than 20% of the cases, which means that they were considered as acceptable in the vast majority of cases. The presence of two negations significantly increased the probability of rejection compared to single negation, both for multiple negation (A vs. B: $\beta = -1.48$, SE= 0.21, $z=-7.06$) and for double negation sentences (A vs. C: $\beta = -3.05$, SE= 0.23, $z=-13.35$). Nonetheless, the proportion of rejections was lower for multiple negation sentences (condition B, less than 40%), than for traditional double negatives, which were rejected in the majority of cases (condition C, 70% of rejections). The contrast between these two conditions was statistically significant (B vs. C: $\beta = -1.57$, SE= 0.19, $z=-8.31$). In sum, the results show a significant three-way distinction among the experimental conditions.

3. Discussion

This experiment tested the impact of different negation configurations on fast perceptions of acceptability using a processing demand task. Based on linguistic and psycholinguistic considerations, it was initially assumed that single negation sentences would be unproblematic for native speakers of English, and that double negation sentences would be deemed unacceptable when encountered in isolation. These assumptions are borne out in the results. Although double negation sentences were conceived as a baseline for comparison, the low percentage of acceptance of these sentences is interesting in itself. Particularly, considering the limited attention that the phenomenon of double negation has received in psycholinguistics. This study provides clear evidence that double negative dependencies are rejected by native speakers of English, at least when encountered in the absence of an appropriate licensing context.

The degraded perception observed for multiple negation sentences is incompatible with the view that reanalyzing ever as never could somehow rescue NPI illusions in processing tasks. The results from this investigation provide initial support against the ever-never confusability hypothesis, as it predicted that multiple negation sentences should come across as well-formed in English. The acceptability contrast between single negation and multiple negation sentences cannot be attributed to constraints of the grammar or other linguistic considerations, and points to a processing problem as the source of the effect. The attested pattern of results bears significant resemblances to NPI illusion results (e.g., Parker & Phillips 2016; de-Dios-Flores, Muller & Phillips 2017). In these
studies, an illusion of grammaticality is identified with higher acceptance rates for unlicensed NPIs in sentences with intrusive no (example 4b), compared to sentences without it (example 4c). The results from this experiment show the opposite: lower acceptance rates for grammatical sentences with intrusive no (i.e., multiple negation) than for similar sentences without it (i.e., single negation). The lower acceptance of multiple negation sentences reveals that, whereas intrusive negation ameliorates the perception of ever in ungrammatical sentences, it deteriorates the perception of never in grammatical sentences. The difficulties observed for multiple negation sentences could arise as a consequence of entertaining a double negative dependency between no and never, in accordance with the changing encodings hypothesis. The attested misalignment between grammatical knowledge and processing results could represent an illusion of ungrammaticality.

4. Final remarks

Speeded acceptability tasks gather information about participants’ fast perception of acceptability, and they have been proved to be a reliable technique uncovering grammatical illusions. Nonetheless, speeded judgements only collect end-of-sentence decisions and do not allow us to study whether native speakers consider the same sentences as acceptable when given ample time, or which are the specific sentence regions that generate the behavior. For this reason, similar experiments using untimed judgements and time-sensitive tasks (e.g., self-paced reading) are essential for a complete understanding of multiple negation sentences as a case of illusion of grammaticality. Moreover, the existing parallelisms between NPI illusions and multiple negation sentences call for an in-depth investigation of the relation between these two phenomena.

References


Jaeger, T. Florian. 2008. “Categorical data analysis: Away from ANOVAs (transformation or not) and towards logit mixed models.” *Journal of Memory and Language* (Special Issue: Emerging Data Analysis) 59 (4): 434–446.


Assigned Gender in Astrological Vocabulary: The Case of þe planettes

IRENE DIEGO-RODRÍGUEZ
Universidad de Alcalá
i.diego@edu.uah.es

Abstract
This paper aims to study gender variation from a diachronic perspective, analysing the gender of the eight proper nouns used to name the planets and of the common noun planet in several Old English and Middle English astrological texts. During these periods, there were eight planets: Earth, Mercury, Venus, Mars, Jupiter, Saturn and the Sun and the Moon, which were also considered planets. Both OE <eorþe> (ModE Earth) and <sunne> (ModE Sun) are Germanic feminine nouns ending in <e>. Unlike them, the OE term <mona> (ModE Moon) is a masculine noun ending in <a>. The three of them belong to the weak declension. However, the other five planets were incorporated into English from Latin: <Mercurius>, <Mars>, <Jupiter> and <Saturnus>, which are masculine nouns, and <Venus>, which is feminine. Furthermore, the common noun planet comes from Old French <planête>. During the ME period, the loss of inflections entailed the disappearance of “overt marking within the noun phrase” (Guzmán-González 1999, 38). Grammatical gender survived during the ME period to a limited extent in personal pronouns and possessive determiners, though (Moore 1921, 84). This fact will be illustrated with examples taken from different corpora.

Keywords: Assigned gender, grammatical gender, Middle English, Old English, astrological vocabulary.

1. Introduction

The gender system of Present Day English (hereafter PDE) is certainly grounded in semantic criteria. This fact automatically implies that “male humans are masculine, female humans are feminine, and anything else is neuter” (Corbett 1991, 12). It also makes English an unprecedented and extraordinary example among the other Germanic languages, as far as gender is concerned.
This is a consequence of what occurred during the transition between the Old English (henceforth OE) and the Middle English (hereafter ME) periods, which stands for the shifted from a morphological to a semantic assignment system (Corbett 1991, 102).

There were three different genders during the OE period, which implies that nouns were grammatically neuter, feminine or masculine. Therefore, gender was not assigned regarding sex affinity but the form of words (Fernández-Domínguez 2007, 48). Nominal inflections, as well as pronoun, determiners and the strong adjective declension, were used in order to express gender (Mustanoja 1960, 43). However, in the transition between OE to ME, most of these adnominal inflectional endings were lost. As a result, it was infeasible to distinguish one gender from another (Classen 1919, 97), and it became a necessity to replace a gender based on grammatical forms (Classen 1919, 97) with one based on meaning. Thus, English became “a pronominal language system, in which the personal pronouns he/she/it reflect a triple gender system and the relative pronouns who/which distinguish only between the animate and the inanimate” in PDE (Curzan 2003, 20).

Nevertheless, it is possible to find some lexical fields which disclose that gender assignment can be volatile and as a result, the same noun may present distinct marks for gender. This variability can be illustrated by taking the distinctive lexicon associated to astromedical literature. Although it has traditionally been stated that “astrological texts and the nouns they contain cannot serve as representative of the language as a whole, and they cannot tell the full story of how grammatical gender was being lost in the rest of the lexicon” (Curzan 2003, 88), it is necessary to study this lexicon in depth regarding the changeable nature of gender. That is why my main aim is to analyse gender variation in late Middle English zodiacal lunaries, a neglected genre (Taaitsainen 1988, 39). Kibre (1997, 94) defines lunaries as tracts which deal with “the incidence and course of diseases and their treatment, as well as the imminence of death, according to the phases of the moon in the twelve Signs of the Zodiac”.

2. Methodology

The astrological medical texts compiled for this research form a corpus of approximately 12,100 words [Table 1]. The manuscripts contain fifteenth-century treatises and as a result, their language is quite standardised. First of all, I have myself transcribed the zodiacal lunar contained in Glasgow Univer-
sity Library, MS Hunter 513, entitled *pe boke of ypocras*. Different copies of this tract appear in other four manuscripts (De la Cruz-Cabanillas and Diego-Rodríguez, 2017): London, Royal College of Physicians, MS 384; British Library, MS Additional 12195, MS Harley 2378, and MS Sloane 73. Three other lunaries contained in The Middle English Medical Texts Corpus have been considered for this study: Harvard University, Countway Library of Medicine, MS 19 which contains a Middle English version of *De condicionibus planetarum septem*; British Library, MS Sloane 3285 and its treatise entitled *When the Mone is in Aries*; British Library, MS Egerton 2572 and the lunary *Off þe xij synys*.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Manuscript</th>
<th>Words</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>GUL, H513</td>
<td>1,896</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BL, H2378</td>
<td>2,024</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BL, Add12195</td>
<td>1,736</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BL, S73</td>
<td>2,067</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RCP 384</td>
<td>1,875</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BL, E2572</td>
<td>1,791</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Harvard 19</td>
<td>242</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BL, S3285</td>
<td>460</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total:</strong></td>
<td><strong>12,091</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 1: Astromedical Corpus

A concordance programme (i.e., AntCorc) was used in order to scrutinise the frequency of the planets and all their different spellings. Then, all gendered pronominal references have been identified and analysed. A clear explanation of the reasons behind the choice of one gender or another and behind the coexistence of two genders in a same text for a given noun is provided.

### 3. Analysis and Discussion

As the corpus only contains astrological tracts, the lexicon under study shows a high frequency of this semantic area compared to other lexical fields [Tables 2, 3]:
### Table 2: Frequency of *pe planettes* in the corpus

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Manuscript</th>
<th>PDE moon</th>
<th>PDE sun</th>
<th>PDE Earth</th>
<th>PDE Mercury</th>
<th>PDE Venus</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>GUL, H513</td>
<td>&lt;mone&gt; 53</td>
<td>&lt;sonne&gt; 5</td>
<td>&lt;mercurius&gt; 2</td>
<td>&lt;venus&gt; 7</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>&lt;mon&gt; 1</td>
<td>&lt;sone&gt; 1</td>
<td>&lt;mercurij&gt; 1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>&lt;luna&gt; 1</td>
<td>&lt;sole&gt; 2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BL, H2378</td>
<td>&lt;mone&gt; 56</td>
<td>&lt;sunne&gt; 5</td>
<td>&lt;mercurius&gt; 3</td>
<td>&lt;venus&gt; 9</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>&lt;mon&gt; 4</td>
<td>&lt;sone&gt; 4</td>
<td>&lt;mercury&gt; 1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>&lt;luna&gt; 4</td>
<td>&lt;sole&gt; 5</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BL, Add12195</td>
<td>&lt;mone&gt; 40</td>
<td>&lt;sonne&gt; 4</td>
<td>&lt;marcury&gt; 4</td>
<td>&lt;venus&gt; 10</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>&lt;mon&gt; 18</td>
<td>&lt;son&gt; 2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>&lt;luna&gt; 3</td>
<td>&lt;sole&gt; 5</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BL, S73</td>
<td>&lt;mooone&gt; 53</td>
<td>&lt;sunne&gt; 8</td>
<td>&lt;mercur&gt; 1</td>
<td>&lt;venus&gt; 8</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>&lt;luna&gt; 4</td>
<td>&lt;sone&gt; 6</td>
<td>&lt;mercurius&gt; 3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>&lt;lonna&gt; 1</td>
<td>&lt;sole&gt; 5</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RCP 384</td>
<td>&lt;mone&gt; 25</td>
<td>&lt;sonne&gt; 6</td>
<td>&lt;mercur&gt; 2</td>
<td>&lt;venus&gt; 7</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>&lt;mooone&gt; 32</td>
<td>&lt;sone&gt; 2</td>
<td>&lt;mercurius&gt; 1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>&lt;luna&gt; 1</td>
<td>&lt;sole&gt; 2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BL, E2572</td>
<td>&lt;mone&gt; 14</td>
<td>&lt;sonne&gt; 2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Harvard 19</td>
<td>&lt;luna&gt; 1</td>
<td>&lt;sone&gt; 1</td>
<td>&lt;mercurius&gt; 1</td>
<td>&lt;venus&gt; 1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BL, S3285</td>
<td>&lt;mone&gt; 4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Table 3 (1/2): Frequency of *pe planettes* in the corpus

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Manuscript</th>
<th>PDE Mars</th>
<th>PDE Jupiter</th>
<th>PDE Saturn</th>
<th>PDE planet</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>GUL, H513</td>
<td>&lt;mars&gt; 10</td>
<td>&lt;jubiter&gt; 1</td>
<td>&lt;saturnes&gt; 3</td>
<td>&lt;planetete&gt; 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>&lt;saturnus&gt; 5</td>
<td>&lt;planet&gt; 8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>&lt;satournus&gt; 2</td>
<td>&lt;planetis&gt; 6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BL, H2378</td>
<td>&lt;mars&gt; 11</td>
<td>&lt;jupiter&gt; 4</td>
<td>&lt;saturn&gt; 2</td>
<td>&lt;planetete&gt; 8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>&lt;saturnus&gt; 4</td>
<td>&lt;planet&gt; 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>&lt;saturne&gt; 6</td>
<td>&lt;planetis&gt; 5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>&lt;saturnis&gt; 1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BL, Add12195</td>
<td>&lt;mars&gt; 13</td>
<td>&lt;lubiter&gt; 1</td>
<td>&lt;saturn&gt; 7</td>
<td>&lt;planyth&gt; 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>&lt;jubiter&gt; 3</td>
<td>&lt;saturs&gt; 2</td>
<td>&lt;planet&gt; 5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>&lt;lubiter&gt; 2</td>
<td>&lt;saturnus&gt; 4</td>
<td>&lt;planete&gt; 6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>&lt;jupiter&gt; 1</td>
<td>&lt;saturne&gt; 4</td>
<td>&lt;planetis&gt; 4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>&lt;planettis&gt; 4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Despite the 650 occurrences, gendered pronominal references are inexistent regarding the great majority of the planets. They are always preceded by “unmarked modifier forms” (Jones 1967, 301):

1. A demonstrative or definite article, categories that show no gender distinction. This makes impossible to determine the assigned gender: “þe planet” (MS H513, f. 98v).
2. The use of plural pronouns or determiners: “þese planetis” (MS H2378, f. 11v).
3. Headings. Key words as marginal notations in manuscripts are frequently found in most manuscripts in the corpus. These words appear in isolation and written in red ink or inside a figure, and often they are signs of the Zodiac or planets together with their anthropomorphic characteristics: [margin] Taurus cold / & drie. satur- /nus (MS S73, f. 128v).

Thus, it is only possible to study the coexistence of feminine and masculine pronominal references in the several occurrences concerning to Moon, and in one instance concerning to Mars, which represents less than 10% of the examples taken from the corpus [Graphic 1]. What is more, these examples can only be found in the manuscripts that contain þe boke of ypocras, which implies
that the three other manuscripts: British Library, MS Egerton 2572 and MS Sloane 3285; Harvard University, Countway Library of Medicine, MS Harvard19 which contain different astrological treatises, can no longer been taken into consideration for this study.

Graphic 1: Representation of the percentage of examples containing gendered references

With regard to the only example found in H513 of a gendered pronoun used to make reference to Mars, the following appears:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Manuscript</th>
<th>Reference</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>H513</td>
<td>If þe mone holde with mars &amp; caste lyght to hym</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H2378</td>
<td>If þe mone holde wyth mars &amp; kast lyth to hym</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Add12195</td>
<td>Yf þe mone hold with mars and cast lyth to hymme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S73</td>
<td>If þe moone holde wib mars &amp; caste li3t to him</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RCP384</td>
<td>If þe mone hold with mars and cast light to hym</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 3: Gendered pronominal references to the word Mars

The fact that it shows masculine gender in the use of the possessive pronoun is due to the preservation of the Latin gender. Mars comes from Latin Mars, Martis, a masculine noun which belongs to the third declension, adopted in English as a masculine as well.

However, something different happens when the examples concerning to Moon are taken into consideration [Table 4]¹:

¹ Table as in Diego-Rodríguez, Irene (2018, 231–232).
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Gendered pronominal references to the word <em>Moon</em></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>H513</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Add12195</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Harley2378</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>RCP384</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Sloane73</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>H513</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Add12195</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Harley2378</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>RCP384</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Sloane73</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>H513</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Add12195</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Harley2378</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>RCP384</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Sloane73</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>H513</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Add12195</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Harley2378</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>RCP384</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Sloane73</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>H513</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Add12195</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Harley2378</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>RCP384</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Sloane73</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>H513</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Add12195</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Harley2378</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>RCP384</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Sloane73</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>H513</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4 (1/2): Gendered pronominal references to the word *Moon*
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>H513</th>
<th>Add12195</th>
<th>Harley2378</th>
<th>RCP384</th>
<th>Sloane73</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>when þe mone hath with hym Saturnus</td>
<td>yf þe mone haue with her saturn</td>
<td>yf þe mone haue wyth hym saturre</td>
<td>þe moone haþe with hym saturre</td>
<td>If þe moone haue with him saturre</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H513</td>
<td>Add12195</td>
<td>Harley2378</td>
<td>RCP384</td>
<td>Sloane73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>if þe mone haue with hym þe Sonne</td>
<td>yf þe mon haue it hym þe Sonne</td>
<td>yf þe mone haue wyth hym þe sunne</td>
<td>If þe moone haue with hym þe sonne</td>
<td>if þe moone haue wiþ him þe sunne</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H513</td>
<td>Add12195</td>
<td>Harley2378</td>
<td>RCP384</td>
<td>Sloane73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>if þe mone haue wiþ hym a planet</td>
<td>yf þe mon haue with him venus</td>
<td>if þe mone haue wyth hym a planete</td>
<td>yf þe mone haue with hym venus</td>
<td>If þe moone haue wiþ him a planete</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H513</td>
<td>Add12195</td>
<td>Harley2378</td>
<td>RCP384</td>
<td>Sloane73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>if þe mone haue with hym Saturnus</td>
<td>yf þe mon haue with her Saturne</td>
<td>If þe mone haue wyth hym saturre</td>
<td>þe moone haue with hym saturre</td>
<td>If þe moone haue wiþ him Saturnus</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H513</td>
<td>Add12195</td>
<td>Harley2378</td>
<td>RCP384</td>
<td>Sloane73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>þe mone haue with hym Gemeni</td>
<td>þe mone haue &lt;with&gt; her Jubyter</td>
<td>þe mone haue wyth hym Jupiter</td>
<td>þe moone haue with hym Jupiter</td>
<td>if þe moone haue wiþ him Jubiter</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4 (2/2): Gendered pronominal references to the word Moon

Out of the fifty-nine gendered pronominal references to the noun Moon registered from the different manuscripts containing a copy of þe boke of ypocras, fifty-two are masculine (88%) and only seven references are feminine (12%) [Graphic 2]. In addition, the feminine pronouns only appear in one of the manuscripts in combination with masculine forms: London: British Library, MS Additional 12195. This clearly differs from the examples taken for Mars, where all the gendered references are masculine, and as a result, the case of Moon deserves further attention below.
The peculiarity associated to the case of Moon makes it crucial to explain the reasons why in the great majority of examples taken from the corpus it keeps its OE masculine gender, but in London: British Library, MS Additional 12195 it is possible to find in some of the cases feminine personal and possessive pronouns. PDE Moon comes from OE <mone>, a masculine noun from the weak declension. Then, it is clear that it maintains its grammatical gender in the examples analysed. However, it is not as simple to understand and explain why in MS Additional 12195 both genders coexist and the feminine personal pronoun is used twice and the possessive one five times.

Mustanoja (1960) and Fernández-Domínguez (2007) provide some key ideas that may explain this phenomenon. First of all, it is essential to bear in mind that “Middle English literature consists of direct translations from Latin and French” (Mustanoja 1960, 45). Medical astrological texts in general, and the zodiacal lunaries under consideration are not an exception. These tracts were translated during the early Middle Ages from Greek and Arabic sources into Latin and later, these Latin treatises were translated into the vernacular during the late Middle Ages (De la Cruz-Cabanillas and Diego-Rodríguez 2018). The scribes who copied these texts during the fifteenth century were probably fluent in Latin or French and as a result, “it frequently happens that a noun, even when it is not a direct loan, is assigned the gender of the corresponding Latin or French noun” (Mustanoja 1960, 45). The influence of Latin luna, lunae, a feminine noun belonging to the first declension; or French
\textit{lune}, also feminine, may explain why this noun takes sometimes the feminine gender in the corpus. Another reason has to do with the scribe’s “attitude to the referent” (Fernández-Domínguez 2007, 54). The use of feminine or masculine references to \textit{Moon} in MS Additional 12195 may be simply the direct consequence of the fact that the scribe happens to have female or male in mind (Mustanoja 1960, 46) and therefore the gender is “selected for sexless entities on an arbitrary basis as a result of what has been defined as a “certain emotional attitude, or a strong feeling of affection” (Fernández-Domínguez 2007, 54). Finally, it also needs to be taken into consideration the “association of the moon with Diana” (Mustanoja 1960, 49). This may be also related to the use of feminine pronouns although pagan mythology does not seem to play a role in this kind of medical astrological tracts.

\section*{4. Conclusion}

Medical astrological treatises are not commonly the focus of linguistic analysis. Nonetheless, the examination of the data retrieved from the corpus of Middle English medical astrological texts reveals their relevance and importance to understand the process of gender assignment. Out of 650 examples taken from the corpus, only sixty-four (five examples concerning \textit{Mars} and fifty-nine concerning \textit{Moon}) contained gendered references. This number represents only 9\% of the total.

Despite numbers and percentages, the findings are in line with Curzan’s claims and therefore, the cases of \textit{Mars} and \textit{Moon} represent how medical astrological vocabulary stands for

one of the last subsets of inanimate nouns to retain grammatical gender concord in the anaphoric pronouns and they are the nouns most susceptible to foreign influence, which serves to perpetuate the use of gendered pronouns in reference to them. Somehow these nouns are seen as gendered at a time in the language when the distinction between animate and inanimate is strengthening and the masculine and feminine pronouns are coming to be associated solely with animate, gendered beings (2003, 130–131).

Primarily, the coexistence of both genders within the same treatise has been explained, and it proves the fact that this lexicon is “exceptional in the demise of grammatical gender and in the rise of natural gender” (Curzan 2003, 130).
REFERENCES

Anthony, Laurence, “AntConc Homepage”, Laurence Anthony’s Website. [Accessed online on November 10, 2018].


Moore, Samuel. 1921. “Grammatical and Natural Gender in Middle English”. PMLA 36 (1): 79–103.


Complex Collective Subjects in Inner-Circle World Englishes: Verb Number Variation and Quantifying Usage

Yolanda Fernández-Pena
Universidad de Vigo
yolanda.fernandez@uvigo.es

Abstract
Complex collective subjects (e.g., a lot of, a heap of) have arisen great interest in recent investigations for their variable agreement patterns and potential quantifying usage. This investigation extends the scope of prior research by exploring the verb number variation and quantifying usage of five complex collective noun phrases (i.e., a bunch/couple/group/host/number of) in the inner-circle World Englishes of the Corpus of Global Web-based English (GloWbE). The results obtained reveal diatopic variation: the inner-circle Englishes differ in the extent to which they use plural agreement with these complex noun phrases, with the British Isles leading the way. The collective nouns, although displaying different agreement preferences, turn out to pattern consistently across the inner-circle varieties and their quantifying usage is found to be conditioned by the syntactic configuration of the subject.

Keywords: verb agreement, collective noun, World Englishes, quantification, corpus.

1. Introduction

This paper reports the results of a corpus-based investigation on the verb number agreement patterns and quantifying usage of complex collective noun phrases (NPs, henceforward) such as those in (1) and (2).

---

1 I am grateful to the Spanish Ministry of Science and Innovation and the European Regional Development Fund (grant no. FFI2016-77018-P), and the Autonomous Government of Galicia (grant no. ED431C 2017/50) for generous financial support. Special thanks are due to Prof. Javier Pérez-Guerra and Prof. Kristin Davidse for their insights and suggestions, and to Prof. Marianne Hundt, Dr. Hans Martin Lehmann and Dr. Gerold Schneider for giving me access to the Dependency Bank interface.
(1) [A number of other activities] are included in the GN2 project [GloWbE: gb_genl:100120:p]

(2) [A host of construction projects] are demanding my attention [GloWbE: gb_genl:606676:p]

In previous investigations on formal written American English—with data from The Corpus of Historical American English (COHA) (Davies 2010)—I observed that, historically, the complex collective NPs a bunch/couple/group/host/number of have come to serve as idiomatic periphrastic (absolute) quantifiers (Fernández-Pena 2018a). The degree of grammaticalisation of such usage was found to condition their Present-Day patterns of agreement: higher grammaticalisation involves the recategorisation of a formerly fully lexical collective NP into a more grammatical and idiomatic periphrastic quantifying expression (a N_coll of) that lacks control over verb number, which comes to be determined by the (plural) noun following of, also referred to as ‘oblique noun’ (e.g., activities and projects in (1) and (2)). Along these lines, this paper extends my prior investigations with a view to determine whether the quantifying usage of these five complex collective NPs is widely spread across inner-circle varieties of English. To this end, I carried out a corpus-based investigation with data from The Corpus of Global Web-based English (GloWbE) (Davies 2013) whose main contribution rests in the wider picture of the agreement patterns and quantificational use of complex collective NPs that the evidence from six inner-circle Englishes and a less formal (web-based) register provide.

The paper is organised as follows: Section 2 outlines the main aims of the study and describes the methodology, Section 3 reports the data analysis and, finally, Section 4 presents some concluding remarks.

2. AIMS AND METHODOLOGY

This investigation aims at extending my prior research on complex collective NPs with a two-fold purpose: first, to examine further the current usage and the quantifying potential of the aforementioned five complex collective NPs in a more informal web-based register and, second, to detect potential diatopic variation in their agreement patterns and quantifying usage across inner-circle World Englishes.
For the purposes of this research, I retrieved data from a parsed version of the *Corpus of Global Web-based English* (*GloWbE*), which contains almost two billion words from written texts on the web—both websites and blogs—from 20 different varieties of English. Given the great diatopic diversity in *GloWbE*, the study was limited to only the inner-circle varieties (i.e., ‘native’; Kachru 1985), namely British, Irish, American, Canadian, Australian and New Zealand English, thus avoiding any potential interference of the substrate languages that are in contact with the varieties of English from the outer circle.

In keeping with Fernández-Pena (2018a), the scope of the investigation was restricted to instances that contained:

• a (singular) collective noun with potential for quantifying usage: *bunch, couple, group, host* and *number*
• an *of*-dependent with a plural oblique noun (e.g., *a bunch of things / people*)
• a verb overtly inflected for number

After the manual pruning of the examples retrieved by the parser, the total number of instances scrutinised amounts to 2,445. The variables analysed pertain to:

• verb number
• regional variety
• determiner of the collective noun (i.e., definite, indefinite, zero, other)
• determiner of the oblique noun (i.e., definite, zero, other)

To determine the statistical significance of these variables on verb agreement with the collective nouns investigated binary logistic regression analysis was used. The model, which comprises the aforementioned four variables as well as the type of collective noun, is overall significant (LL: 1022.23; \( p < .0001 \)) and has excellent classification properties (\( C \)-index=.845) (see Brezina 2018, 126). The individual coefficients displayed in Figure 1 reveal that plural agree-

---

2 The parsed version of *GloWbE* is available via the Dependency Bank interface (University of Zurich): [http://www.es.uzh.ch/en/Subsites/Projects/dbank.html](http://www.es.uzh.ch/en/Subsites/Projects/dbank.html)
ment is significantly favoured by (i) British and Irish English (with respect to American English), (ii) the collective nouns bunch, couple, host and number (in contrast to group), (iii) the premodification of the collective noun and (iv) the use of a determiner other than the definite article before the collective noun (note that the opposite trend is attested for the determiner of the oblique noun).

### Logistic Regression Model

**Response variable:** (verb) agreement (singular | plural) (948:1497)

**Overall model statistics**

| Overall significance: Likelihood Ratio Test | 1022.23 |
| Model accuracy: C-index | 0.845 |

| Factor                              | Coef. | S.E.  | Wald Z | Pr(>|Z|) |
|-------------------------------------|-------|-------|--------|----------|
| Intercept                           | -1.6962 | 0.5688 | -2.98  | 0.0029 ** |
| Variety=Australian English          | 0.1508 | 0.2070 | 0.73   | 0.4664   |
| Variety=Canadian English            | 0.3517 | 0.1859 | 1.89   | 0.0586   |
| Variety=British English             | 0.5285 | 0.1345 | 3.93   | <0.0001 *** |
| Variety=Irish English               | 0.8737 | 0.2134 | 4.09   | <0.0001 *** |
| Variety=New Zealand English         | 0.2384 | 0.2070 | 1.15   | 0.2495   |
| Collective noun=bunch               | 1.3774 | 0.1600 | 8.61   | <0.0001 *** |
| Collective noun=couple              | 2.2012 | 0.1937 | 11.37  | <0.0001 *** |
| Collective noun=host                | 2.0874 | 0.2717 | 7.68   | <0.0001 *** |
| Collective noun=number              | 0.8178 | 0.1465 | 5.58   | <0.0001 *** |
| Determiner collective noun=indef.art.| 2.8871 | 0.1505 | 19.19  | <0.0001 *** |
| Determiner collective noun=other    | 1.3217 | 0.2136 | 6.19   | <0.0001 *** |
| Determiner collective noun=zero     | 2.0051 | 0.5171 | 3.88   | 0.0001 *** |
| Premodifier collective noun=yes     | 0.5898 | 0.1262 | 4.67   | <0.0001 *** |
| Determiner oblique noun=other       | -0.0530 | 0.7376 | -0.07  | 0.9427   |
| Determiner oblique noun=zero        | -1.2477 | 0.5327 | -2.34  | 0.0192 * |

**Figure 1. Binary logistic regression estimates**

### 3. Data analysis

#### 3.1 Verb number agreement variation

As concerns verb number choice, the results confirm the tendencies attested in previous studies (Fernández-Pena 2018a, 2018b): complex collective subjects with plural oblique nouns tend to pattern with plural verbal forms also
in inner-circle Englishes. Overall, as Figure 2 illustrates, in *GloWbE* the five collective nouns take plural agreement in 61% of the instances retrieved, which is in keeping with the findings obtained from more formal sources (about 63% in *COHA*).

This prevalence of plural patterns leaves room for the potential quantifying usage of complex collective NPs also in the inner-circle Englishes. As (3) and (4) illustrate, when the collective noun serves as a quantifying-like modifier of the oblique noun (i.e., *apps* and *things*), it is the latter that takes over the role of head of the NP, thus controlling agreement.

(3) [A bunch of great new photo *apps*] *have* appeared [*GloWbE*: gb_genl:778338:p]
(4) [A whole host of *things*] *have* changed. [*GloWbE*: us_genl:1411961:p]

The quantifying potential of the five collective nouns under scrutiny has been claimed to differ from collective to collective (Fernández-Pena 2018a, 2018b). In this same vein, as predicted by the regression analysis, Figure 3 corroborates that one of the factors that conditions verb number choice and, subsequently, the quantifying usage of these complex NPs is the type of collective noun. Hence, the data show that *bunch, couple* and *host* occur frequently with plural verbal patterns (>80%), whereas with both *group* and *number* the incidence of singular agreement is substantially higher (about 55%), much in
line with the trends attested in more formal registers (Fernández-Peña 2018b, 459–541).

![Figure 3. Verb number agreement with the five collective nouns in the inner-circle varieties](image)

Far from detracting their quantifying potential, this finding just reveals that, to a large extent, only *group* and *number* function also as fully lexical nouns and thus still control verb agreement in a large number of cases in the inner-circle Englishes. Section 3.3 will shed more light on this result by revealing the paramount importance of the syntactic configuration of the complex collective NPs for their quantifying reading and usage.

### 3.2 Diatopic variation

Regional variation has been widely attested as a point of divergence in the agreement patterning of collective nouns: they are claimed to be more frequently found with plural agreeing forms in British English than in the American variety (Quirk et al. 1985, 16–17; Biber et al. 1999, 188; Levin 2001, 60–70). In a prior analysis of 23 complex collective NPs (Fernández-Peña 2018b, 376), I attested an unexpected strong preference for plural verbal patterns in both formal written American and British English—with the latter leading the way—as well as diatopic differences in the inner-circle varieties of English: Irish English strongly preferred plural patterns (64%) and American English slightly
favoured singular agreement (52%), while the other varieties showed balanced proportions for both number values (42–57%).

Table 1 below displays the diatopic variation of the five collective nouns under analysis here. The varieties are presented in decreasing rate of plural verb number. Overall, there is a general preference for plural verbal patterns in the six varieties, particularly in Irish English (69.52%). British, Canadian, Australian and New Zealand English pattern quite alike, with rates of plural agreement ranging from about 60% to 64%. Finally, American English is the variety that occurs with plural verbal forms less frequently (55.80%), which corroborates the traditional claim about its weaker preference for plural agreement with collective nouns (i.e., weaker than in British English) and, at the same time, contrasts with the slightly higher proportion of singular verb number in Fernández-Pena (2018b, 376).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variety</th>
<th>Verb number</th>
<th></th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Singular</td>
<td>Plural</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Irish English</td>
<td>64 (30.48%)</td>
<td>146 (69.52%)</td>
<td>210</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>British English</td>
<td>305 (36.01%)</td>
<td>542 (63.99%)</td>
<td>847</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Canadian English</td>
<td>101 (37.69%)</td>
<td>167 (62.31%)</td>
<td>268</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Australian English</td>
<td>77 (39.49%)</td>
<td>118 (60.51%)</td>
<td>195</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Zealand English</td>
<td>81 (40.30%)</td>
<td>120 (59.70%)</td>
<td>201</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>American English</td>
<td>320 (44.20%)</td>
<td>404 (55.80%)</td>
<td>724</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>948 (38.77%)</strong></td>
<td><strong>1,497 (61.23%)</strong></td>
<td><strong>2,445</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 1. Verb number agreement patterns of the six inner-circle varieties in *GloWbE*

The diatopic variation captured in Table 1, however, does not seem to be a highly determining factor. Although the difference among the agreement patterns of the six varieties is statistically significant ($\chi^2(5)=18.23, \ p=0.0027$), Figure 4 confirms that only the pattern of the American variety is significantly different from the tendencies attested for the other five varieties.
The results indicate that the rate of singular agreement in American English is statistically higher than the proportion of singular verb number attested in the other varieties.

As concerns the individual variation of each collective noun, it bears pointing out that, overall, each and every collective noun turns out to pattern alike in the six varieties. In general terms, the tendencies displayed in Figure 3 were consistently attested across the six inner-circle Englishes, with *bunch, couple* and *host* occurring with plural agreement in the vast majority of the cases (>75%) and *group* and *number* showing wider variation. All the same, their patterns of agreement were also found to vary slightly from variety to variety in line with the general tendencies presented in Table 1.

### 3.3 Syntactic configuration and quantifying potential

In Section 3.1 I claimed that the quantifying potential of complex collective NPs was available in plural verbal patterns. In prior research I demonstrated that this quantifying reading and usage of complex collective NPs is constrained by the internal syntactic configuration of the NP (Fernández-Pena
2018a). To explore further this issue and assess their quantifier usage in the inner-circle Englishes, I explored the type of determiner and the premodification pattern of the collective as well as the type of determiner of the oblique noun.

Starting with the determiner of the collective noun, it bears pointing out that only the indefinite article facilitates the quantifying interpretation of complex collective NPs, as definite determiners, particularly the definite article, elicit a referential usage of the collective noun that subsequently cancels the quantity reading (Alexiadou et al. 2007, 431). Compare (5) and (6).

(5) [the number of unemployed graduates] has risen. [GloWbE: gb_gen-l:1478431:p]
(6) [A number of graduates] have posted messages [GloWbE: gb_gen-l:1417150:p]

It follows from the above that in definite NPs (the \( N_{coll} \) of \( N_{pl} \)) the collective determines not only the referent of the NP but also the number of the verb, whereas in indefinite NPs (a \( N_{coll} \) of \( N_{pl} \)) its potential nuance of vague quantification is boosted and results in a higher incidence of plural verbal forms agreeing with the plural oblique noun. The data from GloWbE displayed in Figure 5 corroborate these claims: definite NPs pattern with singular verbs in about 79% of the cases, while the indefinite article favours about 80% of plural agreement (\( \chi^2(1)=655.76, p<.0001 \)).

![Figure 5. Verb number agreement with definite and indefinite collective NPs](image-url)
Figure 5 also reveals that complex subjects preceded by the indefinite article account for nearly two thirds of the sample (1,599 tokens, 65.40%), which suggests that they are highly frequent in the inner-circle World Englishes as well and allegedly show a great degree of entrenchment as potential periphrastic quantifiers.

The quantifying usage of these indefinite NPs varies depending on the type of determiner in the of-dependent (Fernández-Pena 2018a). Accordingly, when the oblique noun takes a determiner (normally definite), the phrase conveys partitive meaning (7) and, in the absence of a determiner, the NP is ‘pseudopartitive’ (8) (Selkirk 1977). Both syntactic configurations express quantification to different extents: whereas in partitive structures both nouns are referential and thus denote ‘a set taken out of a bigger set’ or, in other words, relative quantification; in pseudopartitives the lack of a determiner in the of-dependent precludes the instantiation of a second referent, which in turn facilitates the reinterpretation of the collective noun as a sort of modifier conveying indefinite (i.e., absolute) quantification (Langacker 2016).

(7) [A bunch of the songs on this album] have been sampled [GloWbE: ca_3358535:p]
(8) [a bunch of Ø tasks] are run in order to make the page load. [GloWbE: us_genl:673675:p]

Figure 6 displays the frequency of these two types of syntactic configurations in the inner-circle Englishes. The data reveal that the use of collective nouns in partitive NPs is very marginal in comparison with their frequency in pseudopartitive phrases (97 tokens, 6.07% vs 1,502 tokens, 93.93%).

Even though both structures can be taken to express quantity, only the pseudopartitive one is liable to the pragmatic strengthening and reanalysis processes that result in the grammaticalisation of the structure and its incorporation into the quantifier paradigm (as was the case with a lot of; Traugott and Trousdale 2013, 116). Along these lines, the patterns of agreement of the pseudopartitive NPs illustrated in Figure 7 leave enough room to tentatively claim that the main meaning and function of these collective nouns in pseudopartitive phrases may be that of absolute quantifying expressions. The exception to this trend is a group of, whose considerably higher rate of singular agreement (47.34%) suggests a still frequent use as a fully lexical collective noun.
As a final remark, it is worth noting that this potential usage of *a bunch/couple/group/host/number of* as idiomatic periphrastic quantifiers is further reinforced by their limited and quantificational premodification patterns. As a matter of fact, collective nouns in pseudopartitive phrases prove to be very rarely premodified (21%). When they take premodification, they tend to collocate with intensifiers or downtoners that reinforce their quantificational meaning, which thus reveals their syntactic rigidity (e.g., *a whole bunch of workers, a large number of cases*; see Brems 2011, 191–201).
4. Concluding remarks

This investigation explored the verb number agreement variation and quantifying use of complex collective subjects in the inner-circle World Englishes in GloWbE. The results revealed that these World Englishes differ slightly in the extent to which they favour plural agreement and that both the agreement patterns and the quantifying potential of the collective nouns are largely determined by the internal syntactic configuration of the noun phrase. Overall, the data unveiled a high potential for absolute periphrastic quantification also in the inner-circle Englishes in that the five complex collective NPs mostly occur in (non-premodified) pseudopartitive configurations \( (a \text{ N}^{\text{coll}}_\text{pl} \text{ of } N_\text{pl}) \)—the only structure where absolute quantifying meaning is claimed to emerge—and with substantially high rates of plural agreement (except for a group of).

In brief, the intralinguistic factors prevail over regional variation inasmuch as the former were found to explain verb number variation and, crucially, the (idiomatic) quantifying usage of these complex subjects, which can be claimed to be deeply entrenched in Present-Day Englishes (at least in informal registers).

References


A Concise Analysis on How ELT Course Books Promote Teaching Pronunciation in Portuguese Public Schools

Carlos Lindade
Universidad de Vigo
clindade@uvigo.es

Abstract

Pronunciation teaching has not always been popular with teachers and theorists, and there’s very little research on this matter in the Portuguese context. This paper aims to briefly discuss the relation between the role of pronunciation teaching in the 3rd cycle EFL classroom and course books used in Portuguese public schools, in hopes of understanding how course books support teaching English pronunciation in Portugal.

Keywords: Applied Linguistics, Teaching English as a Foreign Language, course books, pronunciation.

1. Introduction

The role of pronunciation in ELT has changed numerous times throughout the past two centuries. From being completely ignored in the grammar translation and cognitivist methods (19th–early 20th century), to later being at the forefront of instruction during the audiolingual/oral method (1940’s–1950’s), to being considered almost meaningless during the cognitive approach and the silent way (1960’s–1970’s) and later moderately relevant throughout the communicative approach (1980’s to the present-day). Thus, its importance is strongly connected with teaching methods and approaches (Brown 2007, Celce-Murcia 1996).

Nowadays, research in this field has highlighted that pronunciation teaching has not always been popular with teachers and theorists. On the one hand, teachers often feel under-prepared to teach pronunciation and, on the other hand, lexical and grammatical language functions are more convenient to present to learners as well as easier to prepare within a learning unit. Another argument on teaching pronunciation comes from Brown (2007), who points out that children often outperform older learners when learning pronuncia-
tion, promoting an idea that pronunciation is extremely difficult to teach to teenagers and adults. Nevertheless, variables such as those proposed by Jones (2002) still prove a valid rebottle as learners of different ages react differently to teaching approaches and task types, hence the importance of designing pronunciation lessons around motivational factors.

In the end, pronunciation teaching has been considerably neglected for the last 80 years and we have all lost through this. Integrating pronunciation tasks with other skills such as lexical and grammatical language functions might be one of many solutions, as it will not only reinforce learning goals but increase intelligibility and uphold L2 learner’ expectation to communicate as efficiently as possible. But is it enough? For the purpose of this paper another question remains to be answered: do Portuguese ELT course books integrate pronunciation activities?

2. Portuguese ELT course books, material development and pronunciation

Discussing Portuguese ELT course books is not an easy task. Firstly, there is a huge deficit of academic contributions regarding material development (MD) for ELT course books made and/or used in Portugal. Secondly, contributions regarding Applied Linguistics in ELT are abundant and diverse but to this point there is, to my knowledge, no evidence of a single contribution that ties pronunciation, ELT course books and MD in Portugal. Perhaps the lack of contributions regarding MD and pronunciation in Portugal is heavily related to the fact that MD is not always perceived as a field of academic study.

Brian Tomlinson, one of the foremost authors in this field, considers that materials nowadays are not fully exploiting the potential of facilitating learning of the resources available to them. They are not fully exploiting:

The capacity of the brain to learn from experience and, in particular, the role that affect can play in this process;
The knowledge, awareness and experience which learners bring to the process of language learning;
The interests, skills and personality of the learners;
The knowledge, awareness and experience which teachers bring to the process of language learning;
The interests, skills and personality of the teachers;  
The visual, auditory and kinaesthetic aids available to materials developers.  
The potential of literature and, in particular, of storytelling for engaging the learner. (2013: 251)

In light of this, and in spite of all their flaws and limitations, course books have not lost their central role in the classroom, in particular among those professionals with very little experience in teaching or those who are insecure, heavily influencing the teaching method/approach and serving as a reference on what to teach (Bragger & Rice 2000). According to Bragger & Rice (2000), teachers do not only rely on course books for teaching purposes, but they also use them as a reference for curriculum design, lesson planning and assessment. Considering that researchers have studied how various aspects of language (skills, cultural content, grammar content, among others) are integrated in ELT course books, very little has been published on how pronunciation is treated (Derwing, Diepenbroek & Foote 2012), raising new questions on the state of pronunciation teaching today.

Experience with EFL course books used in Portugal has provided a unique empirical perspective regarding the presence and frequency in which certain skills are featured. Although there is no published research in this field based on the Portuguese setting, it is believed that pronunciation tasks have been drastically reduced to the point of having almost disappeared from course books used within Portuguese public schools in the 3rd cycle. According to Tomlinson (2013), it seems that what we are doing is not matching what we know about language acquisition, empowering the need to combine what universities research and publishers know about language teaching.

3. Results

Having analyzed the 29 different coursebooks used between grades 7 and 9, from eight different publishers, the course books made in Portugal by Portuguese publishers (Porto Editora, Texto Exitores, Asa Editores and Areal Editores) do not present activities that focus on pronunciation. Nevertheless, one exception must be mentioned, since one exercise was found in a 7th grade A2 level book, which focused on the various pronunciations of the –ed morpheme, as an extension exercise of the grammar section of the unit dedicated to the Past Simple.
Regarding the books from foreign publishers (Oxford University Press, Express Publishing, Pearson Longman and Santillana) in the 7th and 8th grade, one of the course books does not present pronunciation activities in the student’s book, but in one of the supplemental components of the project. In the 9th grade course books the situation is slightly different, because only one project presents pronunciation tasks in the student’s book, even though they are compiled in a single page at the very end of the book.

Research might suggest that the unpopularity of pronunciation is not only a reality in Portugal, but it has been generalized among course books made in Portugal by Portuguese publishing houses. It is also interesting to consider the decrease of pronunciation tasks as learners progress from level A2 to level B1, considering the fact that the current 9th grade course books are designed around B1 level (CEFR), while 7th and 8th year books are aimed for an A2 level. If this is the case, will pronunciation focused teaching be evident and abundant at lower levels, specifically those grades 3 to 6 where it’s compulsory to learn English?

4. Final remarks

In conclusion, regardless of the number of course books printed in Portugal in the last decade alone, the relation between pronunciation and language teaching is frail. How does one overcome this and promote a stronger bond? This is undoubtedly an issue for a follow-up paper. More research must be done regarding pronunciation in 1st, and 2nd cycle course books and data must be collected regarding in-service teacher’s views on this topic. Hopefully, future contributions on this matter will help bring pronunciation back to the Portuguese English classroom.

References


**Chances are: Enlarging the Catalogue of Epistemic Adverbial Expressions in English**

**María José López-Couso and Belén Méndez-Naya**

Universidade de Santiago de Compostela
mjlopez.couso@usc.es, belen.mendez@usc.es

**Abstract**

This paper studies the emergence and adverbialization of the epistemic marker *chances are*, as in *Chances are, there is light at the end of the tunnel*. Data from the Corpus of Historical American English (COHA) show that *chances are* originates in a complementation structure of the type *(the) chances are + (that)* complement clause, whose matrix evolves into a parenthetical in the course of the twentieth century. The reanalysis of the construction is enabled by the rise of the complementizer zero, in accordance with Thompson and Mulac’s (1991) matrix clause hypothesis. Another indication of the progressive adverbialization of *chances are* is the omission of the determiner. Unambiguous parenthetical uses are infrequent in the COHA material, but evidence from punctuation suggests that examples of initial *chances are* normally occur in a different tone unit and are thus to be considered parentheticals.

**Keywords**: epistemic(ity), grammaticalization, adverbialization, happenstance, chance.

1. **Preliminaries**

Epistemic meanings of possibility have been shown to grammaticalize across languages from deontic or dynamic meanings, which in turn derive from lexical sources conveying ability, power and the like. Well-known examples of this grammaticalization pathway are English *can* and *may*, originally ‘know

---

1 This research is funded by the Spanish Ministry of Economy and Competitiveness (grant FFI2017-86884-P) and the Regional Government of Galicia (grants ED431D 2017/09 and ED431B 2017/12). Thanks are due to two anonymous reviewers for their helpful comments on an earlier version of this paper.
how to’ and ‘have strength’, respectively (i.e., mental and physical ability > root possibility > epistemic possibility; Bybee et al. 1994, 191ff). An additional cross-linguistic lexical source for epistemic possibility is that of happenstance (‘something that happens by chance’). Examples include Latin **forte** (‘chance’) and the Scandinavian adverbs *kanhända, måhända* and *törhända* ‘maybe’ (< (det) *kan* / *må* / *tör hända* (att) ‘it can/may/must happen that’) (see Boye and Harder 2007, 591).

Happenstance is also a prolific source for epistemic adverbial expressions in the history of English, especially in the Middle and Early Modern English periods, with adverbs such as *peradventure, maychance, may fortune*, alongside *perhaps* and *maybe*, the two major epistemic adverbs of possibility in Present-day English (cf. López-Couso and Méndez-Naya 2017).

On the basis of evidence drawn from the *Corpus of Historical American English* (*COHA*; Davies 2010), which covers the time-span 1810–2009, the present paper explores the emergence, development and present-day use of an epistemic adverbial expression originating in the happenstance noun *chance*, namely *chances are*, as in (1), which (to our knowledge) has not been discussed in the literature on epistemicity in English. This seems to be a twentieth-century development which can be traced back to a matrix clause in a complementation structure of the type exemplified in (2).

(1) What follows are some great destinations that, **chances are**, will be fairly free of whatever nasty seasonal conditions ... (*COHA*, 2000, MAG)

(2) I think the **chances are** that it is an injury. (*COHA*, 1846, FIC)

### 2. The noun *chance* as a source of happenstance adverbial expressions

The noun *chance* is a French loanword borrowed into English in the course of the Middle English period with the meaning of happenstance. The earliest occurrences in the *Oxford English Dictionary* (*OED*) date from the late thirteenth-century text *The Chronicle of Robert of Gloucester*, as shown in (3).

(3) To come...to helpe is moder, that was her ofte in feble **chaunce**. (1297 *R. Gloucester’s Chron.* (1724) 465; *OED* s.v. *chance* n., adj, and adv. A.1.a)
In the course of the Late Middle and Early Modern English periods, the noun *chance* served as the source for various adverbial happenstance expressions, mostly in combination with a preposition (*at, by, in, of, on, through, up, upon* and *with*). Some of these combinations developed over time the epistemic meaning of possibility. Thus, *by chance* was at first used with the happenstance meaning ‘as it falls or fell out; without design; casually, accidentally, incidentally, haply’ (*OED* s.v. *chance* n., adj., and adv. P1.a), as in (4), and then in the sixteenth century with the epistemic meaning ‘perhaps, maybe’. The *OED* provides only one example of this sense, reproduced here as (5).

(4) And ȝef the man other that wyf By cheaunce doumbe were. (*c*1315 Shoreham 60; *OED* s.v. *chance* n., adj., and adv. P1.a)

(5) Thou mayst lese thy goodes.. and also by chaunce the helth of thy body. (1526 W. Bonde *Pylgrimage of Perfection* i. sig. Bvii; *OED* s.v. *chance* n., adj., and adv. P1.b)

Another adverbial expression involving the noun *chance* and a preposition is *perchance* ‘maybe’ (*OED* s.v. *perchance* adv., n. and adj.), shown in (6). This adverb was borrowed from Anglo-Norman in the mid-fourteenth century, and is still current in Present-day English, though its frequency is not very high (*OED* frequency band 4: 0.1–0.99 per million words).

(6) It mai par chance faile. (*a*1393 Gower *Confessio Amantis* (Fairf.) i. 2225 (MED); *OED* s.v. *perchance* adv., n. and adj. A.1.a.a)

Outside the prepositional pattern, the noun *chance* is also the source for the adverb *chance*, as in (7). This formation, characterized as archaic in the *OED*, came to life by conversion of the noun in the late sixteenth century, much later than the prepositional formations discussed above.

(7) It may *chaunce* cost some of vs our liues. (1600 Shakespeare *Henry IV, Pt. 2* II.i.12; *OED* s.v. *chance* n., adj., and adv. C)

### 3. Enlarging the catalogue: *Chances are*

As shown in section 2, Middle and Early Modern English were crucial periods in the formation of the inventory of epistemic adverbial expressions...
deriving from the happenstance noun *chance*. It seems, however, that the catalogue of such expressions was still subject to change after the close of Early Modern English. Examples such as (8) and (9) from the *OED* illustrate the use of the parenthetical *chances are* meaning ‘possibly, probably’.

(8) She’ll give you a sit-down for yourself, **chances are**, but bring back a ‘lump’ for us. (*1926 J. Black You can’t Win* vi. 67; *OED* s.vv. *lump* n.¹ 1.g; *sit-down* adj. and n. B.1.b).

(9) **Chances are**, he’s having a go-round with some editor out there who’s just shit-canned one of his articles. (*1973 T. Crouse Boys on Bus* i. v. 100; *OED* s.vv. *go-round* n. 3; *shitcan* v. 1.b)

The formation *chances are* differs from the adverbial forms mentioned in section 2 in that it involves a clausal (S+V) rather than a phrasal structure. Moreover, judging from the scanty evidence provided by the *OED*, the adverbial parenthetical *chances are* seems to be a more recent addition to the inventory of epistemic expressions deriving from the notion of happenstance than the *chance*-formations discussed in the preceding section. Examples (8) and (9) are the only unambiguous occurrences of *chances are*-parentheticals attested in the *OED* quotation database. Interestingly, both are twentieth-century instances and both represent American English: *You can’t Win* is the autobiography of the American burglar Jack Black and *The Boys on the Bus* was written by the American journalist and writer Timothy Crouse. In view of this, the corpus-based analysis of *chances are* that follows is restricted to American English from the nineteenth and twentieth centuries as represented in *COHA*.

In order to provide a first approach to the origin and development of the expression *chances are*, we looked for this string in *COHA*. The search yielded a total of 1,470 hits, which were then manually pruned. Once irrelevant examples were discarded,² we were left with a total of 1,213 instances, distributed as shown in table 1.

---

² Examples which did not involve a subordinate clause were discarded, e.g., the *chances are now against thee* (*COHA*, 1823, FIC).
CONSTRUCTION | EXAMPLES
---|---
1. *(the)* chances are X + *(that)* complement clause | 178
2. *(the)* chances are + *(that)* complement clause | 1,021
3. *(the)* chances are PAR | 14

Table 1: Constructions involving *chances are* in *COHA*

In construction 1, *(the)* chances are X + *(that)* complement clause, the quantification/qualification of the probability is expressed: the chances are good/even/three to one/etc. that... The earliest examples of this type in *COHA* go back to the 1840s. One of these is given as (10). Since this construction does not seem to be the direct ancestor of the parenthetical *chances are*, it will be disregarded in the discussion that follows.

(10) unless the chances are a **hundred to one** that he will cut and harvest it. *(COHA, 1844, FIC)*

Alongside construction 1, we find structures in which the probability is not qualified or quantified (construction 2 in table 1). In construction 2, the noun *chances* behaves like nouns such as *thing, fact, problem*, etc., which are commonly known as ‘shell-nouns’, that is, “abstract nouns that have, to varying degrees, the potential for being used as conceptual shells for complex, proposition-like pieces of information” *(Schmid 2000, 4)*, in constructions of the type *the thing/fact/problem is that*... Such constructions have been shown to develop into some sort of pragmatic markers *(Aijmer 2007)*.

As far as the formal features of construction 2 are concerned, different patterns can be identified, depending on whether the noun *chances* is preceded or not by the article *the* and on whether the complement clause that follows features the complementizer *that* or its zero counterpart. Examples (11)–(14) illustrate the four variants attested in the data:

(11) **The chances are that** you will never behold the light of another sun. *(COHA, 1852, FIC) [TCAthat]*
(12) and **the chances are** ∅ she would have got in during the night. *(COHA, 1863, NEWS) [TCAzero]*
(13) **Chances are that** you won’t. *(COHA, 1914, FIC) [CAthat]*
(14) **Chances are** ∅ they’re on that train. (*COHA*, 1908, FIC) [CAzero]

*COHA* also yields examples of parenthetical uses of *(the) chances are* (construction 3), where *(the) chances are* seems to have undergone a process of adverbialization. Two parenthetical types can be distinguished, depending on whether the determiner is overtly expressed or omitted. Compare (15) and (16).

(15) You never will need it, **the chances are**. (*COHA*, 1922, FIC) [TCApar]

(16) = (1) What follows are some great destinations that, **chances are**, will be fairly free of whatever nasty seasonal conditions ... (*COHA*, 2000, MAG) [CApap]

Figure 1 shows the distribution of the four different patterns in construction 2 and of unambiguous parentheticals (construction 3) in *COHA*. Since the word counts for the different decades in the corpus are uneven, we have normalized the figures per 10 million words.

![Figure 1: Distribution of the four patterns in the *(the) chances are* + *(that)* complement clause construction and of *(the) chances are*-parentheticals in *COHA* (normalized frequencies per 10 million words)](image)

Of the four patterns in construction 2, those with an expressed determiner (TCAthat and TCAzero) are already attested in the nineteenth century.
The TCAthat variant (blue line in figure 1) is the earliest one to appear in the COHA material (in the 1830s), peaking in frequency in the first two decades of the twentieth century. From that moment onwards it starts losing ground, gradually at first, but dramatically from the 1960s. In turn, the TCAzero pattern (red line) is first attested in the 1880s, and its frequency rises rapidly until the 1950s, when it plummets. On the other hand, the earliest instances of the construction with omission of the determiner correspond to the CAthat pattern (green line), illustrated in (17), which is evinced in COHA from the 1880s, but remains rather infrequent across the time-span examined here.

(17) and I think chances are that we will pay still higher prices. (COHA, 1889, NEWS)

Finally, the pattern CAzero (purple line) is first found in the COHA material in the first decade of the twentieth century. (18) is one of the earliest recorded examples.

(18) Chances are it’s me he is trying to gather. (COHA, 1908, FIC)

This pattern experiences a first boost in frequency in the 1950s, coinciding with the beginning of the decline of the two patterns showing a determiner (TCAthat and TCAzero). With this peak in frequency, CAzero gains salience in the speech community, as evinced by the release in 1957 of a song precisely with the title “Chances are” (Robert Allen and Al Stillman). The song, performed by singer Johnny Mathis, became a Nr 1 hit that year. Its lyrics (see (19) below) play with the more/less lexical uses of the noun chance.

(19) Chances are ’cause I wear a silly grin
    The moment you come into view
    Chances are you think that I’m in love with you
    Just because my composure sort of slips
    The moment that your lips meet mine
    Chances are you think my heart’s your Valentine
    In the magic of moonlight when I sigh, hold me close, dear
    Chances are you believe the stars that fill the skies are in my eyes
    Guess you feel you’ll always be the one and only one for me
And if you think you could
Well, chances are your chances are awfully good

In the 1970s CAzero surpasses what had been the most frequent variant until that moment, the TCAthat pattern, and its frequency rockets from the 1980s, ousting all the other alternatives.

Regarding the parenthetical construction (construction 3), the earliest instances correspond to the TCApar pattern, which is attested in the first quarter of the twentieth century, precisely after the increase in frequency of the TCAzero pattern (see above). It seems therefore that the expansion of the complementizer zero was the trigger for the syntactic reanalysis of the matrix clause as a parenthetical, in accordance with Thompson and Mulac’s (1991) matrix clause hypothesis. A couple of examples are (20) and (21), where TCApar occurs in sentence-medial and sentence-final position, respectively.

(20) Such a presentation of ‘Uncle Tom’s Cabin’ was never before presented, and I am free to confess the chances are never will be again. (COHA, 1913, FIC)
(21) you do not need the money involved. You never will need it, the chances are. (COHA, 1922, FIC)

Similarly, the CAzero pattern seems to have paved the way to the emergence of the CApar pattern, illustrated in (22).

(22) but I guess you want your mama, maybe, or your bottle, chances are. (COHA, 1918, FIC)

It is no wonder that the growth in popularity of CAzero, which is especially conspicuous from the 1970s (see above), coincides with the increasing occurrence of the CApar pattern in medial position (23) or qualifying a response (24), that is, as an unambiguous parenthetical. In such cases we can say that the adverbialization of chances are is complete.

(23) Henrietta, who, chances are, if in 1991 she was sixty-three and homeless and HIV-positive and too scared to take her medication and had one good lung left from crack addiction, even if she detoxed, by now, chances are, is dead. (COHA, 1996, FIC)
(24) Would I do it again if I knew what was going to occur? **Chances are, no.** (COHA, 1997, NEWS)

A crucial question that arises here is, what is the status of initial *chances are*? Is it to be regarded as a matrix clause or, on the contrary, could it be analysed as a parenthetical? (cf., among others, Thompson and Mulac 1991; Boye and Harder 2007, 586). The ambiguity can only be solved if “there is a pause or some intervening material such as hesitation sounds (*uh, uhm*) or other fillers (*you know, I mean*)” (Kaltenböck 2007, 45). For nineteenth- and twentieth-century English, the existence of punctuation marks could be taken as an indication of prosody. The occurrence of commas between *chances are* and a following zero complement clause, as in (25) and (26), lends some support to the analysis of *chances are* in such instances as an initial parenthetical. Figure 2 provides the frequency in COHA of examples featuring a punctuation mark after initial *chances are* (red line), as compared to all occurrences of *chances are* in the CAzero pattern (blue line). As can be seen, the frequency of examples of initial *chances are* followed by a punctuation mark is not negligible at all and seems to be on the rise.

![Figure 2: Punctuation marks in the CAzero pattern (normalized frequencies per 10 million words)](image)

(25) **Chances are**, there is light at the end of the tunnel. (COHA, 2002, MAG)
(26) **Chances are**, I’d still be floating up in Heaven or wherever, waiting to be attached to a body to spend some time on Earth. (*COHA*, 2004, FIC)

4. **Concluding remarks**

In this paper we have approached the study of a new epistemic expression in English, namely parenthetical *chances are*, which derives from the notion of happenstance. The origin of *chances are* is to be found in a complementation structure of the type *(the) chances are* + *(that)* complement clause (construction 2), which occurs in various patterns differing as regards the presence/absence of the determiner and as regards complementizer choice (*that* vs. zero). Evidence from *COHA* (1810–2009) has shown that the rise of zero (TCAzero, CAzero) facilitates the emergence of parenthetical uses of *(the) chances are* (construction 3). The pattern CAzero is a twentieth-century development, which becomes salient in the 1950s, ousting all other patterns (TCAthat, TCAzero, CThat) by the 1980s. Unambiguous parenthetical *chances are* (in sentence-medial or sentence-final position or in responses) are sporadically found from the 1910s, their frequency remaining low at the turn of the twenty-first century. Punctuation suggests that initial *chances are* occurs in a different tone unit at least in some examples, which lends support to its analysis as a parenthetical.

**References**


Modeling the Choice of Near-Synonyms in the Recent History of American English: The Case of *Fragrant*, *Perfumed* and *Scented*¹

DANIELA PETTERSSON-TRABA
Universidade de Santiago de Compostela
daniela.pettersson@usc.es

Abstract
Recent research has focused on the semantic structure of groups of near-synonyms, linguistic constructions which denote the same concept but contrast in nuances of denotational meaning, style, connotation, and/or collocation. However, existing studies have all considered near-synonyms from a synchronic viewpoint, disregarding their diachronic development. This paper aims at filling this gap by examining three adjectival near-synonyms in Late Modern and Present-day American English, namely *fragrant*, *perfumed* and *scented*. Results indicate that, while *fragrant* accompanies nouns which refer to entities with a natural smell, *scented* and, particularly, *perfumed* modify nouns denoting artificial objects. Additionally, *scented* is gaining ground at the expense of *fragrant* and *perfumed*, a replacement which is explained by the fact that, whereas *fragrant* and *perfumed* exhibit a strong tendency to occur in the natural and artificial senses respectively, *scented* does not display a clear preference for one particular sense.

Keywords: near-synonymy, semantics, collocations, diachrony, sweet-smelling.

1. Introduction

Most synonyms existing in language are near-synonyms, that is, words or constructions which share the same core denotational meaning but differ

¹ For financial support, I am grateful to the European Regional Development Fund and the following institutions: Regional Government of Galicia (Grants ED481A-2016/168, ED431D 2017/09 and ED431B 2017/12) and the Spanish Ministry of Economy, Industry and Competitiveness (grant FFI2017-86884-P).
in peripheral aspects or in other dimensions such as connotation, style and/or collocation (Cruse 2000, 159–60). The last few decades have witnessed a growing interest in the semantic structure of near-synonyms, especially from the perspective of cognitive linguistics (cf. Geeraerts 2010). These studies all adopt ideas from the distributional method to lexical items, postulated by Firth (1957) and Sinclair (1966, 1987), who claimed that the semantic and functional features of these elements closely correlate with their distributional patterns. Recently, statistical tools have been applied to the study of sets of near-synonyms, which allowed these two scholars’ approach to progress considerably. For instance, different types of association measures (e.g., Church et al. 1994; Gries 2003) have been used to identify the words that collocate with near-synonyms and to reveal differences in semantic nuances between them. However, existing studies have dealt with near-synonyms from a synchronic viewpoint, while their historical evolution has been disregarded. In fact, to my knowledge there is only one diachronic study on near-synonymous lexical items, namely, Primahadi-Wijaya-R. and Rajeg (2014), who examined the nominal collocational profiles of the adjectives hot and warm throughout the last one and a half centuries (i.e., 1860s–2000s). They identify several diachronic trends that contributed to the differential use of these two near-synonyms in Present-day American English. For instance, over time, warm increasingly collocates with nouns such as heart, welcome or smile, thus signaling a tendency for it to be used in a metaphorical sense of ‘friendliness’. Hot, on the other hand, is associated with words such as dog from the 1920s onwards, and with nouns denoting people (e.g., girl, guy, woman) from the 2000s onwards to refer to ‘sexually attractive’ individuals.

Against this backdrop, the aim of this paper is to trace the diachronic development of three near-synonymous adjectives in nineteenth and twentieth century American English, which denote the concept sweet-smelling, namely fragrant, perfumed and scented, exemplified in (1)–(3):

(1) […] in the centre of the garden is a pyramid of fragrant leaves and bright blossoms. (COHA, 1835)

2 More advanced statistical approaches used include, among others, correspondence analysis (e.g., Levshina et al. 2013), logistic regression (e.g., Speelman and Geeraerts 2009) and Behavioral Profiles (e.g., Liu 2010).
(2) Easterners pomaded their locks with perfumed creams. (COHA, 2007)

(3) The young clerk pulled out a scented handkerchief […] (COHA, 1880)

This synonym set is particularly interesting because, if we look them up in reference materials, they seem interchangeable by virtue of (i) having the same denotational meaning, (ii) being defined in terms of each other (e.g., the definition of fragrant in the Newbury House Dictionary of American English is ‘pleasant smelling, perfumed’) and (iii) modifying the same nouns in the examples provided: for instance, the three adjectives collocate with words such as flower, smell and water. Some dictionaries provide an additional sense for perfumed and scented. According to Lexico and Cambridge Dictionary, among others, there seems to be a difference in nuance depending on whether the source of the smell is natural, that is, an entity which can release a natural smell on its own, or artificial, to wit, an entity which can acquire a pleasant smell only by being impregnated by a sweet-smelling substance. However, even though this sense is only provided for perfumed and scented, we do find examples in which fragrant modifies ‘artificial’ nouns, as in (4) in which it collocates with the noun body lotion.

(4) Choose from one of Chanel’s new range of fragrant body lotions. (Longman Dictionary of Contemporary English, s.v. fragrant)

The rest of the paper is structured as follows: Section 2 deals with the data retrieval process and the methodology, Section 3 summarizes and discusses the results and Section 4 presents some conclusions.

2. DATA AND METHODOLOGY

The data was extracted from the Corpus of Historical American English (COHA; Davies 2010), which contains more than 400 million words from 1810 to 2009. From this corpus, the attributive uses of the near-synonymous adjectives fragrant, perfumed and scented were retrieved using the search strings fragrant_j*, perfumed_j*, and scented_j*, and subsequently selecting the relevant examples. Then, the instances were annotated for three variables: Period, Sense and Semantic Category. Period is a categorical variable with four values
corresponding to the time-span covered in COHA divided into four fifty-year periods: 1810–1859 (P1), 1860–1909 (P2), 1910–1959 (P3), 1960–2009 (P4). Sense comprises the two senses referred to earlier—whether the source of the smell is natural or artificial—and a third one labeled ‘neutral’, which includes those examples of the adjectives in which it was not possible to identify the sense (cf. (6) below). Semantic Category refers to the semantic class of the head nouns of the adjectives, based on the semantic classification of the Historical Thesaurus of the Oxford English Dictionary (for more details, see Pettersson-Traba 2018). As shown in Table 1, this variable contains nine values, three of which comprise only natural smells—food and drink, plants and flowers, earth—and three of which include solely artificial smells—aesthetics, cleaning, textile and clothing. The three remaining categories—body, matter, sensation—contain nouns which can denote either an artificial or a natural smell depending on the context, as well as ambiguous examples, that is, examples in which it was not possible to identify the sense. Consider (5) and (6). Whereas (5) clearly belongs to the artificial sense, since there is a direct reference to the perfume Shalimar, in (6) we cannot be certain that fragrant is used in the natural sense, as it is not clear whether the smell referred to is the natural fragrance of the hair or whether it comes from an artificial source, such as shampoo or a different cleansing agent. Example (6), therefore, belongs to body and to the ‘neutral’ sense.

(5) Or, touching her perfumed wrist to my cheek: “This is called Shalimar.” (COHA, 2006)

(6) For a moment she laid her cheek against Angie’s warm fragrant hair. (COHA, 1984)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Semantic Category</th>
<th>Illustrative examples</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Food and drink (F&amp;D)</td>
<td>chicken, coffee, rice</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Plants and flowers (P&amp;F)</td>
<td>flower, moss, pine</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Body (Bo)</td>
<td>cheek, mouth, wrist</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Earth (Ea)</td>
<td>sea, field, gale</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Matter (Ma)</td>
<td>air, gas, smoke</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Textile and clothing (T&amp;C)</td>
<td>garment, dress, linen</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sensation (Sen)</td>
<td>aroma, odor, smell</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
153

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Semantic Category</th>
<th>Illustrative examples</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Aesthetics (Aes)</td>
<td>cream, oil, perfume</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cleaning (Cl)</td>
<td>disinfectant, soap, shampoo</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 1: Semantic classification of head nouns

The independent effects of the three variables under study—Period, Sense, Semantic Category—on the choice of near-synonyms were examined by means of multinomial logistic regressions (cf. Levshina 2015, 277–89). Logistic regression is a statistical test that predicts the probability of occurrence of the levels of a response variable on the basis of one or more explanatory variables, called predictors. Multinomial logistic regression analysis was chosen here because it serves to model situations in which there are more than two possible outcomes: in this case we have three, namely, the adjectives **fragrant**, **perfumed** and **scented**, which functioned as the response variable. Two separate analyses were conducted, one with Period and Sense as predictors of Synonym, and another one with Period and Semantic Category, given that Sense and Semantic Category were too closely related to be included in the same model.

Multinomial logistic regression allows us to measure the influence of predictors such as Period, Sense and Semantic Category. However, it does not provide information regarding the role of individual collocates on the choice of near-synonym. To remedy this, the most important collocates of the adjectives were visualized by means of collocational networks. Collocational network analysis (Brezina et al. 2015; Baker 2017, 96–100) consists of plotting the collocates of lexical items in networks where the collocates are connected to their nodes—in this case the three near-synonyms—by means of arrows. To identify the collocates, the Mutual Information (MI) score provided in COHA was employed and a collocation window of L5-R5 (excluding function words) was established.\(^3\) Two collocational strength thresholds were defined (Baker 2017, 98): a collocate was included in the networks if it exhibited a minimum frequency of co-occurrence with the near-synonyms of 5 and an MI score of 3 or higher. Four collocational networks were built, one per period, to visualize the diachronic devel-

---

\(^3\) For this analysis, all instances of the near-synonyms were considered, not only their attributive uses.
opment of the near-synonyms. These networks help determine which collocates are shared by the near-synonyms at different points in time and allow to identify potential variations in the relation between the members of the synonym set.

3. Results

A total of 2,097 instances of *fragrant*, *perfumed* and *scented* in attributive function were retrieved from *COHA*. As shown in Table 2, *fragrant* is the most frequent adjective of the three, accounting for more than half of the instances, followed by *scented*, which amounts to approximately 20%, and closely followed by *perfumed*, with a relative frequency of 18%.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Fragrant</th>
<th>Perfumed</th>
<th>Scented</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>61.13% (1,282)</td>
<td>18.03% (378)</td>
<td>20.84% (437)</td>
<td>100% (2,097)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2: Overall frequency of the near-synonymous adjectives in attributive function

3.1 The effects of Period, Sense and Semantic Category

Table 3 displays the results of the multinomial logistic regression models applied in this study. Both models are statistically significant, and all the predictors have a significant effect. However, the interactions between Period and Sense, on the one hand, and Period and Semantic Category, on the other, are not significant. The two McFadden’s $R^2$ values are close to the threshold indicating a good fit. Values between 0.2 and 0.4 signal that the predictions of the model match the observed data (Levshina 2015, 280), so the values achieved here reveal that there is some variance that is not accounted for. This is not surprising considering the low number of predictors included. The accuracy of the models, which is about 67%, meaning that the predictions of the models fit the data in 67% of the cases, points to a similar conclusion.5

---

4 Note that this number of cases is for the regression analyses only (cf. footnote 3)
5 The interaction between the variables is not significant and is thus not discussed. The lack of interaction might be due to data sparseness.
Table 3: Summary statistics of the multinomial logistic regression models

Figure 1 displays the independent effect of Sense. There is a rather clear division of semantic labor between *fragrant*, which is predominant in the natural sense, and *perfumed*, the most probable adjective in the artificial sense. Contrariwise, *scented* does not clearly favor any of the two senses, although it shows a somewhat stronger tendency to denote artificial smells.

With respect to Semantic Category (Figure 2), *fragrant* is predominant in matter, earth, food and drink, plants and flowers and sensation, but *perfumed* and *scented*, despite their lower frequency, outperform *fragrant* in the categories aesthetics (only in the case of *perfumed*), cleaning and textile and clothing. Therefore, *perfumed* and *scented* are closer in meaning than they are to *fragrant*, although they also exhibit differences: *scented* is significantly more probable in cleaning and plants and flowers, and *perfumed* in body, sensation and textile and clothing.
Figure 2: Independent effect of Semantic Category

Figure 3: Independent effect of Period
Regarding the diachronic development of the near-synonyms (Figure 3), *fragrant* is the most frequent adjective during the whole time-span considered, but its decrease is statistically significant from 1910 onwards (P3 and P4). Similarly, *perfumed*, although much less common than *fragrant*, also decreases slightly in frequency over time. In contrast, the increase of *scented* in P3 and P4 is statistically significant, which seems to demonstrate that this adjective is gaining ground at the expense of *perfumed* and, especially, of *fragrant*.

### 3.2 The role of individual collocates

Figures 4, 5, 6 and 7 display the results of the collocational network analysis. In P1 (Figure 4) there is a clear dominance of *fragrant*, with sixty-five collocates. *Perfumed* collocates with nine words, four of which are shared with the other two adjectives (e.g., *breath* and *flower*), while *scented* shares its four collocates with *perfumed* and/or *fragrant* (e.g., *air* and *breath*). In P2 (Figure 5), the picture is slightly different. *Fragrant* is still dominant with 103 collocates, but both *scented* and *perfumed* have increased in relative frequency as they have acquired several new collocates. The increase of *scented* is particularly noticeable, totaling thirteen, of which all but one (i.e., *soap*) only collocated with *fragrant* and/or *perfumed* in P1, namely, *bloom*, *blossom*, *breath*, *breeze*, *cool*, *fresh*, *grass*, *rose*, *summer* and *water*. The situation changes again in P3 (Figure 6), with *fragrant* clearly losing ground. *Scented* has now surpassed *perfumed* (15 and 13 collocates, respectively) as it has acquired collocates of its own, some of which have been drawn away from *perfumed* or *fragrant* (e.g., *tree*, *oil*, *orange*). Finally, the collocational network for P4 is displayed in Figure 7. *Scented* is the only adjective which has increased in terms of collocates over time: from four in P1 to seventeen in P4. Moreover, in many cases the shared collocates are now more strongly associated with *scented* than with *perfumed* and/or *fragrant*; this is the case of *bath*, *geranium*, *hair*, *hot*, *oil*, *perfume*, *smell*, *smoke*, *warm* and *water*. Therefore, the collocational networks indicate that the expansion of *scented* in P2 and, especially in P3 and P4 is at the expense of *fragrant* and *perfumed*, since some of the collocates which were previously shared by the adjectives are now exclusive to *scented*. 
Figure 4: Collocational network P1

Figure 5: Collocational network P2
Figure 6: Collocational network P3

Figure 7: Collocational network P4
The aim of the present contribution was to analyze the collocational profiles of the near-synonymous adjectives *fragrant*, *perfumed* and *scented* in nineteenth and twentieth century American English. The results revealed a major significant split between nouns denoting natural sweet smells, which typically collocated with *fragrant*, and nouns designating artificial sweet smells, which were mainly modified by *perfumed*. On the other hand, *scented* was a fairly common modifier of both types of nouns, though it showed a somewhat stronger tendency to denote artificial smells. Therefore, the study corroborates what some dictionaries indicate: *perfumed* and *scented* typically modify nouns denoting man-made objects, which can only exhibit a sweet, pleasant smell by being impregnated by artificial substances, whereas *fragrant* collocates more frequently with nouns referring to natural entities.

Concerning the historical evolution of the near-synonyms, although no interaction between the predictors was found in the multinomial regression analyses, additional methods revealed that this set is undergoing some important changes. The results of the collocational network analysis indicated that *scented*, although less frequent in P1, has been slowly but steadily encroaching upon the territory of *perfumed* and, to a certain extent, that of *fragrant*. One possible explanation to account for this expansion of *scented* is that, whereas *fragrant* and *perfumed* are more specialized semantically, exhibiting a strong tendency to occur respectively in the natural and in the artificial senses, *scented* does not display a clear preference for one of the senses. Moreover, while the specialization of *fragrant* and *perfumed* has gradually become more marked over time, thereby narrowing down their collocational range, *scented* is not as restricted in this respect and its collocational range has therefore been progressively widened. However, this is an explanation that requires further research.

**References**


Analogization at Work: Evidential and Mirative as-Parentheticals with Raising Verbs in Late Modern English

MARIO SERRANO-LOSADA
Universidad Complutense de Madrid
mario.serrano@ucm.es

Abstract
Throughout history, evidential and mirative raising verbs have undergone paradigmatization, a process that persists in the present-day language. With this ongoing change as backdrop, this chapter zeroes in on evidential and mirative as-parentheticals with raising verbs during the Late Modern English period. In doing so, it highlights the role of analogy to argue that the development of the different raising verb constructions can be explained through both concrete and structural analogical modeling. Thus, new raising verbs seem to emerge as a result of the analogical pressure exerted by preexisting members of the paradigm of raising verbs. The rise and entrenchment of as-parentheticals in Late Modern English—explored here through frequency changes—can be taken as evidence for the ongoing analogization and paradigmatization of evidential and mirative raising verbs. Moreover, the constructional changes that newly recruited raising verbs undergo have parallel precedents in changes experienced by analogous predating constructions.

Keywords: parentheticals, evidentiality, mirativity, analogization, paradigmatization.

1. Introduction

Over the course of its history, English has grammaticalized several evidential and mirative raising verbs (EMRVs), among which we find evidential

---

1 This chapter has been made possible by the financial support of the Regional Government of Galicia (grants ED431D 2017/09, ED431B 2017/12 and ED481B 2018/041) and the European Regional Development Fund and the Spanish Ministry of Economy, Industry and Competitiveness (grant FFI2017-86884-P).
seem and mirative turn out. These verbs are converging into an emerging paradigm—i.e., they show increasing paradigmatization: as the historical record shows, new members are still being recruited (e.g., mirative end up in the twentieth century, see Serrano-Losada 2018a) and their constructional behavior is gradually leveling. Thus, EMRVs have come to share several core features in Present-day English (PDE), including the fact that they can be used in parenthetical constructions. Although these parentheticals may take different forms (e.g., it seems vs ∅ turns out), most can be used in the [as it EMRV] construction, illustrated in (1)–(3):

(1) [Solomonov’s] flagship restaurant is called Zahav, […]. As it happens, Zahav is only a few blocks from WHYY, which gave our contributor Dave Davies the chance to take an enviable research trip. (COCA:SPOK:2017)

(2) The goal of the document, as it appears, is to integrate language learners to the American mainstream language and culture (COCA:ACAD:2005)

(3) But we put the movie together, and […] the entree into the world just wasn’t working. And it wasn’t because of the scene, as it turned out. It was because of everything that was around it. (COCA:SPOK:2017)

Such EMRV as-parentheticals have scope over the entire proposition, marking it as evidential or mirative. While the parentheticals in (1) and (3) convey mirative overtones of surprise and counterexpectation, (2) expresses indirect (reasoning or inferential) evidential meaning.

As-parentheticals, also known as “adverbial parentheticals”, feature an adverbial element as (or so) that refers anaphorically to its host clause (López-Couso and Méndez-Naya 2014, 298–99). Parentheticals are syntactically and prosodically independent from their host clause. They have (limited) positional mobility and can thus occupy different slots in the sentence, whether initial (1), medial (2) or final (3). Moreover, their host clause is complete without the parenthetical, which entails that their meaning is procedural, not propositional (Dehé and Kavalova 2007, 1).

This paper aims to examine the development of EMRV as-parentheticals during the Late Modern English period (LModE, 1700–1900) against the backdrop of the ongoing paradigmatization of EMRVs, i.e., the increasing integration of a grammaticalizing element into a paradigm with other elements,
in the present case, the class of EMRVs. Focusing on the oftentimes disputed role of analogy in language change, I argue that the development of these parentheticals is the result of both concrete and structural analogical modeling. Furthermore, this development seems to be reinforced by several constructional changes parallel to those experienced by preexisting members of this emerging paradigm of EMRV constructions.

The paper is organized as follows. Section 2 offers a brief introduction to EMRVs and examines some of the historical developments that these verbs have undergone, taking turn out as a case in point. Section 3 examines the possible role played by analogy in the emergence and development of EMRVs, focusing on as-parentheticals. Finally, Section 4 provides some brief closing remarks and highlights some avenues for further research.

2. English evidential and mirative raising verbs: An emerging paradigm?

2.1 EMRVs

Verbs like seem and turn out are often referred to as subject-to-subject raising predicates, as they can take a “raised” subject (see Huddleston and Pullum 2002, 1194). Thus, although Peter in (4a) is the syntactic subject of turn out, semantically it relates to the to-infinitive clause (to be a pretty decent guy), not to turn out. The verb turn out is rather used as a mirative strategy, marking the proposition Peter is a pretty decent guy as surprising or unexpected. Alongside seem and turn out, this group includes the verbs appear, chance, end up, happen, prove and wind up, among others. ² Beside their (semi)copular uses (e.g., She seems nice), they can take part in catenative constructions with a raised subject and a non-finite complement (4a), allow impersonal constructions with subordinate that-clauses (4b), and appear in parenthetical constructions (4c):

(4) a. Raised subject construction, e.g. [SBJ EMRV to-INF]:
Peter turns out to be a pretty decent guy.

² For a comprehensive list of raising predicates, see Huddleston and Pullum (2002, 1227–28) or Davies and Dubinsky (2004, 11–12).
b. Impersonal construction [it EMRV that-c]:
   *It turns out that Peter is a pretty decent guy.*

c. Parentheticals, e.g. [as EMRV]:
   *As it turns out, Peter is a pretty decent guy.*

When used in the constructions listed in (4), these verbs usually express procedural (secondary, non-propositional) meanings related to evidentiality—the linguistic encoding of source of information (Aikhenvald 2004), e.g., inference or hearsay—and mirativity—the linguistic encoding of surprise (DeLancey 1997). The constructions outlined in (4) are productive constructional schemas for this verb class, which explains why new uses like the hapax legomena illustrated under (5) are possible.

(5) a. **As it ends up**, we’ve done a pretty good job taking care of that list. (NOW:US:2017)
b. **As it winds up**, enlisting a cadre of female singers to essentially pay tribute to yourself with a track-by-track (NOW:US:2015)

### 2.2 The emergence of EMRVs

The historical development of EMRVs and their PDE usage indicate that these verbs have progressively clustered together, which has affected both their semantics and their syntactic behavior. The LModE period appears to have been especially fruitful for the recruitment of EMRVs, as it was during this period that mirative *turn out* (Serrano-Losada 2017a), *end up* (Serrano-Losada 2018a) and *wind up* emerged and joined this incipient category, which already included well-established members such as mirative *appear*, attested from Early Modern English (EModE) (Visser 1963, §235), *happen*, attested from Middle English (ME) (OED s.v. *happen*, v., 1.a.), *prove*, attested from ME (OED s.v. *prove*, v., 3.d.) and, most conspicuously, evidential *seem*, attested from ME (Gisborne and Holmes 2007). As these verbs developed new evidential and mirative senses, they were recategorized as raising verbs and started to appear in the different constructional schemas outlined in (4).

Let us take *turn out* as a case in point. A highly polysemous verb, the Oxford English Dictionary (OED) lists as many as twenty different meanings for phrasal *turn out*. Example (6) illustrates one of the most common senses for
*turn out* during the EModE period, ‘to expel, to dismiss’. By contrast, (7) exemplifies the new senses and constructions that emerged from the 1740s, during the LModE period. (7a) is a semi-copulative use with an evaluative reading; (7b) corresponds to the first documentation of the raised subject construction in the *Corpus of Late Modern English Texts*, version 3.0 (CLMET); the same is true for the impersonal construction in (7c). Finally, (7d) corresponds to the first documented parenthetical instance of *turn out* in this corpus. Examples (7b–c) encode mirative nuances.

(6) How happy am I, to be **turned out** of door, with that sweet companion my innocence! (CLMET:1740)

(7) a. Rucellai does not **turn out** that simple, honest man you thought (CLMET:1742)
   b. I hope the best: but if this should **turn out** to be a plot, I fear nothing but a miracle can save me. (CLMET:1740)
   c. It **turns out** that the whole combined army […] does not amount to above thirty-six thousand fighting men! (CLMET:1744)
   d. I am […] not sorry, as **it turns out**, that our stay here has been lengthened. (CLMET:1796–1801)

In light of the chronological evidence, it is unlikely that mirative *turn out* emerged as a result of a grammaticalization process alone: the simultaneous incursion of the different mirative constructions is a challenge for the grammaticalization hypothesis. At best, this development can be defined as an abrupt change, brought about by semantic generalization and analogical modeling (Serrano-Losada 2017a). De Smet (2009, 1748) defines sudden categorial incursion as a “non-gradual”, analogy-driven mechanism in which a construction is recategorized as a member of a preexisting category. For this constructional attraction to occur, a certain degree of similarity is necessary (Petré 2012, 61). The abrupt emergence of mirative *turn out* was most likely facilitated through analogical modeling following preexisting members of the raising EMRV class which already appeared in the constructions illustrated in (4). The semantic generalization of *turn out*—exemplified by the evaluative reading in (7a)—affects the syntactic behavior of the verb, which starts taking predicative complementation. This sudden semantic change opens a window of opportunity for further change: given that *turn out* now resembles more frequent verbs like
seem, appear or prove, both semantically and syntactically, there is no reason why turn out should not be used in the same constructional patterns (7b–c).

This specific change can thus be understood as a case of paradigmatic analogy (see De Smet 2016a, 92): once language users have assumed the alternation between turn out and other semi-copulative verbs, they extend the alternation to contexts in which only one of the forms was allowed. Evidence for the emergence of mirative end up points in the same direction (Serrano-Losada 2018a). First documented in the late nineteenth century, end up seems to have emerged and developed through analogical pressure, as exerted by turn out and the paradigm of raising verbs. Even though end up usually takes ing-complements, non-canonical uses including to-infinitive complementation, impersonal constructions and parentheticals are increasingly more frequent (Serrano-Losada 2018a, 17), which supports the analogy hypothesis.

3. Analogy at work

Language change is of course multifaceted, and more times than not multiple factors converge for any given change to take place and become entrenched. The arguments summarized in §2.2 complicate the grammaticalization account and call for complementary explanations. In order to assess the paradigmatization of EMRVs, we need to abstract from the specific phenomena and take a broader view of the system. Analogy and analogical thinking are essential cognitive mechanisms (Hofstadter and Sander 2013). However, as powerful an explanatory mechanism as it is, exploring analogy is problematic, since it operates at a mental level and its innerworkings are rather difficult to demonstrate. This is especially so when we are dealing with historical data.

To make the case for the analogy hypothesis, I focus on as-parentheticals over the course of LModE, which are usually the first parenthetical instances of raising verbs to emerge. Such is the case of turn out parentheticals (7d) (Serrano-Losada 2017b, 173) and the much older seem parentheticals (López-Couso and Méndez-Naya 2014). Rather than delving into the historical source constructions of the parentheticals, I aim to abstract from the particularities of the different as-parentheticals to try and determine whether their emergence could have been analogically motivated. Thus, I intend to provide a holistic overview that can connect the emergence of as-parentheticals with the ongoing paradigmatization of EMRVs. Data for this concise analysis were drawn from
CLMET. I retrieved all instances of the search string “as/so it EMRV”, allowing a context window of up to five words before the EMRV. This allowed me to account for more complex instances of the parentheticals, like as it might have happened. However, this also drew in some noise. From the total 1138 occurrences, 599 were classified as parenthetical instances. Out of these parentheticals, 284 instances fit the [as/so it EMRV] construction proper (e.g., as it seemed) with no intervening material (e.g., as it commonly happens). In what follows, only these canonical forms are accounted for, to ensure comparability between the different parentheticals.

As claimed by De Smet (2016a, 82), “innovations are more likely to succeed and proceed more quickly if they resemble an established form, even if the similarity is only superficial”. As EMRVs undergo paradigmatization, they become increasingly homogeneous as regards their constructional behavior, and as new items are recruited, they extend their range of use to new (shared) constructional contexts. Figure 1 shows the normalized frequencies for as-parentheticals in CLMET. While the different lines show the frequency changes of the different parentheticals over time, the shadowed area shows the aggregated frequency for all the constructions combined.

Figure 1: As-parentheticals in CLMET (pmw)

---

3 CLMET comprises texts that span the years 1710–1920 (LModE period). This multi-genre corpus is divided in 3 sub-periods and contains over 34 million words.
4 Sentences featuring the string “as/so it EMRV” are fairly common, and these are not always used in parenthetical constructions, e.g., his style is not so much inferior to the former History as it seems (CLMET:1735).
Some very general, albeit relevant, remarks can be made based on the changing frequencies of the different parentheticals. In fact, frequencies alone may be revealing enough, and they are oftentimes used as a proxy to entrenchment (De Smet 2016b, 90). The *as*-parenthetical construction is documented as early as the ME period: that is the case of the most frequent one, *as it seems/ seemed* (López-Couso and Méndez-Naya 2014, 301). After *turn out* is recruited as a raising verb (c. 1740), it begins to be used in the *as*-parenthetical construction (c. 1790), following other verbs in this category. As this mirative parenthetical gains ground, other competing forms with a similar mirative meaning (e.g., *chance, prove*) lose momentum. This is especially conspicuous in the case of mirative *chance*, which has virtually disappeared as a raising verb in the present-day language. The most frequent raising verbs seem to set the tendency which the others follow. In this case, a newly recruited member of the category, mirative *turn out*, is pulled towards the constructional network and ends up being used in similar contexts, bearing witness to the further paradigmatization of EMRVs. As is the case with other constructional changes undergone by this verb, the emergence of *as it turns/turned out* does not seem to represent a canonical instance of diachronic development whereby a given construction undergoes a series of pragmatic, semantic or morphosyntactic changes. Thus, its genesis can be best described as the result of analogical modeling.

Figure 2 plots the changing frequencies of EMRVs in the raised subject construction with infinitival *to be* complements against the *as*-parenthetical constructions.

**Figure 2: As*-parentheticals and raised subject constructions in CLMET (pmw)**
As Figure 2 shows, the corpus data reveals an overall growth for both types of constructions; i.e., the frequency increase of as-parentheticals seems to correlate with the general increase in the use of EMRV constructions. However, in relative terms, as-parentheticals show a more dramatic increase in discourse frequency, despite being less frequent. This can be interpreted in terms of the growing entrenchment of parenthetical expressions in the language. Furthermore, this might point to a tendency whereby evidential and mirative meanings seem to be pushed towards the clause periphery—i.e., rather than moving along a cline towards auxiliarization, EMRVs tend to become encoded as parenthetical elements outside the clause (Serrano-Losada 2018b). This hypothesis, however, will have to remain a matter for future exploration.

4. CONCLUDING REMARKS

The development of EMRVs is an ongoing change in English. Their paradigmatization has been the result of complex processes, but analogical change seems to be pivotal to their development. To further explore this issue, I have taken as-parentheticals as a case in point. These parentheticals can be best described as formulaic tokens that (to some extent) may have undergone grammaticalization via a process of frequency-induced entrenchment. As seen in the case of turn out, analogical reasoning seems to be a plausible explanation for the emergence and entrenchment of these parentheticals. The analogical forces at play are enabled in the context of a broader constructional network; the emerging paradigm. However, analogy is just one side of the coin. Entrenchment or obsolescence of a given parenthetical can be directly related to the effects of competing forms (e.g., as it seems vs. seemingly, allegedly; as it chances vs. as it turns out). This, however, will be a question for further research. In the future, it would be worthwhile to zoom in on the individual parentheticals to trace their individual histories, which will require us to gather evidence from older historical stages of the language.

SOURCES

CLMET3.0 = Hendrik De Smet, Hans Jürgen Dillerand and Jukka Törkkö. The Corpus of Late Modern English Texts, version 3.0.
COCA = Mark Davies. 2008–. *The Corpus of Contemporary American English.*
NOW = Mark Davies. 2013–. *Corpus of News on the Web.*
OED = *Oxford English Dictionary Online.* Oxford UP.

**REFERENCES**

Hundt, Marianne, ed. 2014. *Late Modern English Syntax.* Cambridge: Cambridge UP.


Structural and System Complexity in Indian English, Singapore English and British English: The Case of Subject Pronoun Deletion

Iván Tamaredo
Universidade de Vigo
ivan.tamaredo.meira@uvigo.es

Abstract

The aim of the present paper is to compare the structural and system complexity of Indian English, Singapore English and British English with respect to one grammatical feature, subject pronoun deletion. Deleted subjects minimize the structural complexity of utterances by decreasing the number of forms they contain. Therefore, in a structurally simple language subject deletion would be frequent. Nevertheless, the alternation between overt and deleted subjects depends on several grammatical constraints, so in a systemically simple language a low number of constraints would determine the choice between the two variants. The results reveal that Singapore English is structurally simpler but systemically more complex than the other two varieties. On the other hand, Indian English, being a L2 variety, opts for a smaller set of grammatical rules at the cost of a larger number of heavier structures.

Keywords: subject pronoun deletion, varieties of English, structural complexity, system complexity.

1. Introduction

The beginning of the twenty-first century has seen a proliferation of metrics of language complexity (e.g., Miestamo et al. 2008). Since an exhaustive

---

1 Generous financial support from the following institutions is gratefully acknowledged: Regional Government of Galicia (grants ED431B 2017/12 and ED431D 2017/09), Spanish Ministry of Innovation, Science, and Universities (grants FFI2017-86884-P, FFI2014-52188-P and BES-2015-071233) and European Regional Development Fund.
description of complexity has not yet been achieved, most metrics postulated so far focus on specific grammatical domains or features from a particular perspective. However, there is one important distinction that has been largely ignored in the literature, that is, *structural* versus *system* complexity (Dahl 2004, 43–44): whereas system complexity pertains to the grammatical rules that generate the structures used by speakers, structural complexity focuses on the outputs of those rules. The aim of the present paper is to compare the structural and system complexity of Indian English (IndE), Singapore English (SgE) and British English (BrE) with a focus on the influence of contact on the complexity of these varieties. To this purpose, I concentrate on one grammatical feature, subject pronoun deletion:

(1) **philosophy** is good general background for all sorts of things. Ø

Doesn’t give one skill like many of the courses here. (ICE-GB:S1A-033#38–39:A)

The rest of the contribution is structured as follows. Section 2 introduces the concept of language complexity and the phenomenon of subject pronoun deletion. Section 3 deals with the data and the methodology of the study, followed, in Section 4, by a summary and discussion of the results. Finally, Section 5 presents some concluding remarks.

### 2. Language Complexity and Subject Pronoun Deletion

As a first approximation to language complexity, we can consider the following definition: “Complexity is first and foremost a matter of the number and variety of an item’s constituent elements and of the elaborateness of their interrelational structure, be it organizational or operational” (Rescher 1998, 1). This definition captures the intuition that a given object is more complex if it comprises many elements and different types of elements, and if a large number of rules are necessary to describe how these elements are structured and put into use. Recent research has demonstrated that complexity is a variable feature of languages and that an important source of complexity variance is language contact and the influence of L2 acquisition and use (e.g., Miestamo et al. 2008; Sampson et al. 2009). Put briefly, if a language, at some point in its history,
becomes used as a L2 by the majority of its speakers, in the process of learning and using this language, these speakers will dispense with the grammatical machinery that is difficult for them to acquire, thus resulting in a simplified system.

However, we cannot simply assume that contact will always result in simplification. Trudgill (2009, 2011) argues that there are three different contact scenarios that we need to consider. In the first type there is extensive short-term non-native acquisition by adult learners, which results in grammatical simplification “due to the relative inability of adult humans to learn new languages perfectly” (Trudgill 2009, 99). The second type of contact situations, on the other hand, which is characterized by long-term contact within the same territory involving childhood bilingualism, results in more complexity due to the appearance of new grammatical features as a result of additive borrowing (Trudgill 2011, 27) or contact-induced grammaticalization processes (Heine and Kuteva 2005, 7). Finally, low-contact situations not only preserve grammatical complexity but may even increase it.

Any discussion of grammatical complexity must necessarily be preceded by an explanation of how it is going to be measured, because there exists no agreement yet as to what the optimal way is to quantify the complexity of languages. Many different metrics and types of metrics have been put forward in the literature (e.g., Newmeyer and Preston 2014; Szmrecsanyi and Kortmann 2012), but there is one methodological distinction that has not received the attention it deserves, namely systemic versus structural complexity metrics (Dahl 2004, 42–44). Systemic metrics measure the complexity of the rules mapping meanings to forms, that is, the number of different structural options in a grammar and the rules that constrain the use of those options. Structural metrics, on the other hand, concentrate on the output of those rules, that is, on the actual linguistic structures that speakers produce.

How do these two types of metrics apply to subject pronoun deletion? From a structural perspective, structures become simpler due to the deletion of subject pronouns, since they contain fewer forms. For instance, by comparison with example (1), (2) contains an additional word, namely the pronoun it:

(2) **philosophy** is good general background for all sorts of things. **It** doesn’t give one skill like many of the courses here.
However, from a systemic perspective, the availability of deleted pronouns increases complexity. This is because (i) it implies a larger set of referential expressions, as there is an additional structural variant in comparison with a language in which subject pronouns are always overtly expressed, and (ii) the existence of this additional referential device entails a larger set of constraints regulating its use. Previous research (e.g., Torres Cacoullos and Travis 2014) has shown that the occurrence of deleted pronouns in English is systematic, since several factors play a role in the choice between the deleted and overt variants. A larger set of referential expressions and more rules to regulate their use complexify the system, which means that a language in which subject pronouns can be deleted is systemically more complex that one in which they are invariably overt.

3. Data and method

The present contribution addresses the following research question: how does language contact affect the structural and system complexity of varieties of English and, specifically, as a result of the availability of deleted pronouns? To this purpose, instances of deleted and overt subject pronouns were retrieved from the British, Indian, and Singaporean components of the International Corpus of English (ICE). Whereas the materials from BrE were included to act as a low-contact variety, IndE and SgE were chosen because they instantiate different types of contact situations. In terms of Trudgill’s typology (see Section 2), IndE is an example of a contact scenario characterized by widespread L2 acquisition: even though up to a hundred million Indians speak English, only approximately 250,000 are native speakers (Sharma 2012, 523). SgE, on the other hand, fits best in Trudgill’s second type of situations, that is, those involving intense contact and childhood bilingualism: while there are still Singaporeans who do not speak English as a native language, the number of speakers for whom English is their dominant language is on the increase (Leimgruber 2013, 9).

Due to the difficulty of retrieving all the relevant instances of deleted pronouns in ICE, only a relatively small subset of texts was used. As shown in Table 1, a balanced sample of forty texts and approximately 80,000 words from each national component was selected.
From this subset of ICE, deleted pronouns were manually retrieved, which resulted in 1,228 instances in the three varieties. Then, a random sample of 1,228 overt pronouns was automatically extracted. Finally, the dataset was annotated for several language-internal and language-external variables identified in previous research on pronoun deletion (e.g., Torres Cacoullos and Travis 2014). Table 2 displays the variables included in the present study.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Medium</th>
<th>Register</th>
<th>ICE Category</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Spoken (20)</td>
<td>Informal (10)</td>
<td>Face-to-face Conversations (8) Telephone Calls (2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Formal (10)</td>
<td>Classroom Lessons (1) Broadcast Discussions (1)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Broadcast Interviews (2) Parliamentary Debates (2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Legal Cross-examinations (2) Business Transactions (2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Written (20)</td>
<td>Informal (10)</td>
<td>Social Letters (10)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Formal (10)</td>
<td>Academic Writing (2) Popular Writing (2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Press News Reports (2) Instructional Writing (2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Press Editorials (2)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 1: Subset of ICE texts per national component (number of texts per category in brackets)
Table 2: Variables included in the analysis

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>Levels</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Language-internal</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(cont.)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pronoun</td>
<td>I vs. you (sing.) vs. she vs. he vs. it vs. we vs. you (pl.) vs. they</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Referent accessibility</td>
<td>High vs. Intermediate vs. Low</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Verb class</td>
<td>Lexical vs. Modal aux. vs. Non-modal aux.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The structural complexity of the varieties was measured in two ways. First, assuming that structures with deleted pronouns are simpler than their overt counterparts, a variety is structurally simpler than others if it exhibits a higher frequency of deleted subject pronouns. Second, a variety is structurally simpler if it favours pronoun deletion in contexts in which it is disfavoured in other varieties. For the first measure of structural complexity, the number of deleted pronouns in each variety was counted but, for the second measure, the data was analysed by means of a binary mixed-effects logistic regression (Baayen 2008, 195). Logistic regression estimates the probabilities of the levels of a binary dependent variable, here the occurrence of deleted versus overt pronouns, on the basis of a series of independent variables or predictors. The advantage of mixed-effects models is that they account for the influence of variables with non-repeatable levels, such as individual speakers or lexical items. In the present analysis, the variables in Table 2 were included as predictors, together with the interactions between Variety and the rest in order to account for possible differences between the varieties. Additionally, speaker and verb biases were controlled for.

System complexity was measured on the basis of per variety random forests (Levshina 2015, 192). Random forests provide a ranking of independent variables as to their relative importance as predictors of a dependent variable, that is, how useful each predictor is to distinguish, in this case, between deleted and overt pronouns. The results of random forests can be interpreted in terms of system complexity: the fewer the constraints in a variety that play a role in the choice between deleted and overt pronouns, the simpler its pronoun-deletion grammar is.
4. Results and Discussion

4.1 Structural complexity

Table 3 displays the distribution of deleted and overt pronouns in the three varieties. SgE exhibits the highest frequency of deleted pronouns, followed by IndE and then BrE. BrE and IndE behave similarly, as they display almost the same proportion of deleted pronouns.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variety</th>
<th>Deleted</th>
<th>Overt</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>BrE</td>
<td>45.04% (363)</td>
<td>54.96% (443)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IndE</td>
<td>46.17% (325)</td>
<td>53.83% (379)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SgE</td>
<td>57.08% (540)</td>
<td>42.92% (406)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 3: Percentage of deleted and overt subject pronouns in the three varieties

The results of the binary mixed-effects logistic regression include significant interactions between Variety and Text type, Coordination, and Clause position.

![Figure 1: Probability of subject pronoun deletion in four text types in BrE](image)
Figure 2: Probability of subject pronoun deletion in four text types in IndE

Figure 3: Probability of subject pronoun deletion in four text types in SgE
Figures 1, 2, and 3 display the interaction between Variety and Text type. In BrE (Figure 1), deleted pronouns are dispreferred in all text types, with values lower than 50% in all cases. IndE (Figure 2) seems to present a division of labour in terms of medium of production, with spoken texts favouring deletion as compared to written texts. Finally, in SgE (Figure 3), deleted pronouns are common in all text types but especially in written informal texts.

With respect to the interaction between Variety and Coordination, Figure 4 shows that, whereas deletion is overall favoured in coordinate contexts, differences between the varieties exist in non-coordinate contexts. SgE exhibits a higher probability of deleted pronouns in these contexts than BrE and IndE, which behave similarly in this respect.

![Figure 4: Interaction between Coordination and Variety](image)

A similar situation is found with regard to the interaction between Variety and Clause position, shown in Figure 5, although in this case BrE and IndE exhibit differences. Overall, deleted pronouns are preferred in initial clause position but, in non-initial positions, they are significantly more likely in IndE and SgE than in BrE.
The results of the binary mixed-effects logistic regression demonstrate that, even though the relative frequencies of deleted pronouns in IndE and BrE do not really differ, pronoun deletion is more widespread in SgE and IndE than in BrE. First, whereas deleted subject pronouns are common in all text types in SgE and in spoken language in IndE, they are generally disfavoured in BrE. Second, SgE favours subject pronoun deletion more strongly in non-coordinate contexts than IndE and BrE. And third, both SgE and IndE exhibit a higher probability of deletion than BrE in non-initial clause positions. Therefore, the two high-contact varieties favour pronoun deletion more strongly in contexts in which BrE, the native low-contact variety, does not. The results presented in this section can be summarized in the following cline of varieties as to their structural complexity, where ‘>’ stands for ‘more complex than’: BrE > IndE > SgE.

![Figure 5: Interaction between Clause position and Variety](image)

### 4.2 System complexity

The results of the per variety random forests are shown in Figures 6, 7, and 8. Dashed lines indicate the value at which variables are not useful to discriminate between deleted and overt subject pronouns: the further away a variable is from the dashed line, the more important it is. A visual inspection
of the figures reveals that in BrE (Figure 6) the first six variables have a significant relative importance, with the seventh predictor, Priming, playing a minor but significant role. In IndE (Figure 7), the first six predictors can be considered to discriminate between deleted and overt pronouns, while the final three

Figure 6: Variable importance in BrE

Figure 7: Variable importance in IndE
variables are not relevant. Finally, SgE (Figure 8) exhibits the largest number of important constraints: up to eight variables play some role in its pronoun-deletion grammar, and only Accessibility is superfluous. This means that speakers of SgE have to consider more language-internal and language-external constraints than speakers of BrE when choosing between a pronoun in deleted or overt form, and these, in turn, have to take into account more constraints than speakers of IndE. These results can be summarized in the following cline of varieties as to their system complexity: SgE > BrE > IndE.

![Figure 8: Variable importance in SgE](image)

5. Conclusions

The aim of the present contribution was to compare the structural and system complexity of three varieties of English, namely IndE, SgE, and BrE, so as to determine the influence of different contact situations on language complexity. To this purpose, the focus was on a particular grammatical feature, subject pronoun deletion, which allowed for a straightforward assessment of its contribution to the complexity of the varieties. Language complexity was approached from both structural and systemic perspectives. First, a variety was considered to be structurally simpler if it exhibited a higher frequency of delet-
ed subject pronouns and if it favoured pronoun deletion in contexts in which it was disfavoured in other varieties. Second, a variety was systemically simpler than others if fewer constraints played a role in the choice between deleted and overt pronouns.

Overall, BrE was the most complex variety, as it was the most structurally complex one and the second most complex in systemic terms. On the contrary, IndE was the simplest variety: it was the simplest systemically speaking and the second in the structural complexity cline. These results are in line with the well-established claim that language contact fosters simplification, with IndE, the only pure L2 variety of the set, being the simplest variety and BrE, the native low-contact variety, being the most complex one. The situation with respect to SgE was less straightforward, since it was the simplest variety in structural terms but the most complex one in systemic terms. This may be evidence of a trade-off between structural and system complexity in SgE, but further research is needed to clarify this issue.

**References**


Part III

Round Tables
The Romantic Tourist Novel and the Commodification of the Exotic

Paloma Fresno Calleja, Eva M. Pérez Rodríguez, Pilar Villar Argáiz and Miquel Pomar Amer
Universitat de les Illes Balears, Universitat de les Illes Balears, Universidad de Granada and Universitat de les Illes Balears
paloma.fresno@uib.es, eva.perez@uib.es, pvillar@ugr.es, miquel.pomar@uib.eu

Abstract

This round table focused on the intersections between popular romance fiction, neo-historical fiction, and the so called “tourist novel” (Huggan 2001), in the light of the rapid proliferation and immense success of popular fiction set in various exotic locations. Considering both the textual and paratextual dimension of the texts, we refer to this corpus as “romantic tourist novels” since they all employ a romantic framework and resort to exoticising strategies to represent their respective settings and historical periods.

Keywords: tourist novel, popular romance, neo-historical fiction, neocolonialism, exoticism.

1. Introduction

As Graham Huggan argues in The Postcolonial Exotic, the tourist novel “not only introduces the country or countries in which it is set to an unfamiliar readership, but also displays that country or countries as object(s) of metropolitan consumption” (2001, 275). We borrow and expand on Huggan’s definition of the “tourist novel”, which he applies to contemporary Australian novels set in Asia, to a corpus of romantic historical novels or contemporary

---

1 Research Project “The politics, aesthetics and marketing of literary formulae in popular women’s fiction: History, Exoticism and Romance” (FFI2016-75130-P), funded by the State Ministry of Economy, Industry and Competitiveness (MINECO), the Agencia Española de Investigación (AEI) and the European Regional Development Fund (ERDF).
popular romances set in various exotic locations (New Zealand, Crete, Oman, Ireland, and Mallorca). Despite their evident generic differences, and their various degrees of engagement with the representation of history or local culture, we choose to collectively define this corpus as “romantic tourist novels” since they both re/visit the past or re/present different geographical settings through a romantic framework which tends towards the idealization, simplification or commodification of their settings often imposing a neocolonial gaze on those cultures.

Our discussion is sustained by previous analyses of the commodification of the postcolonial in the global literary marketplace (Huggan 2001; Brouillette 2007; Ponzanesi 2014); the selected corpus demonstrates the “production, representation and exploitation of the cultural other” (Huggan 2001, 177) as specifically conveyed through the lenses of popular romance and historical fiction. The orientalist marketing strategies employed in the promotion of these novels (titles, blurbs, book cover designs, etc.) are designed to ensure that their (mostly female) readers will indulge in various acts of escapism to remote, exciting and romanticized times and locations. Beyond the experience of reading as a form of armchair travelling, we suggest that the novels might in fact participate of actual forms of tourist promotion, so that the purchase of the book—regardless of whether the country is actually visited or not—becomes only one of many forms of consumption associated with the tourist experience and, by extension, with the marketing and consumption of both history (De Groot 2008) and romance (Illouz 1997).

Furthermore, we argue that the novels’ specific generic and thematic conventions reveal the currency of orientalist tropes which already dominated 19th-century colonial adventure novels, travel narratives and imperial romances (Teo 2016). In this respect, we consider how the texts under analysis draw on those well-established conventions about the (romantic) encounter with “the other”, while adjusting those tropes to the more liberal-minded nature of their protagonists and the changing demands of contemporary readers. Nevertheless, we enquire whether these novels may be subject to more subversive or ambivalent readings that contradict their apparent primary function as escapist and neo-orientalist texts, and whether the romantic framework, the historical material and the exotic setting may actually be revealed as a useful medium to convey alternative postcolonial or feminist readings.
2. **Travel, Tourism and Romance in Exotic New Zealand**

Part of our selected corpus includes historical and contemporary romances set in New Zealand: Sarah Lark’s “Long White Cloud” historical saga and Rosalind James's contemporary “Escape to New Zealand” romances. Using evidence from the first book in each series—Sarah Lark’s *In the Land of the Long White Cloud* (2012) and Rosalind James's *Just This Once* (2012)—the discussion focused on how, despite their obvious differences, these works can be categorized as “romantic tourist novels” in terms of both plot development and marketing strategies. The novels perpetuate a neo-orientalist image of the country as a remote, exotic, beautiful and untouched land ready for western consumption, whether by 19th century settlers or contemporary tourists, and of course an ideal setting for romance. In both cases, promotional efforts explicitly evoke official tourist campaigns presenting New Zealand as a “clean and green” or “100% Pure” destination. In this sense, the novels illustrate Eva Illouz’s propositions that the romantic utopia is often constructed by promising the lovers (and by extension the readers) “transgression through the consumption of leisure and Nature” (1997, 10). This transgression not only becomes essential in the process of marketing the novels but also in how the romantic plot develops, for instance, by presenting the characters as consumers of various leisure activities in some of the country’s most beautiful and iconic beautiful settings (James) or by offering a sanitized “travel guide” version of New Zealand’s post/colonial history and its indigenous Māori culture (Lark).

3. **The Romance of the Exotic Land: Two British Wartime “Tourist Novels”**

The discussion then moved on to consider two romantic and neo-historical (Rousselot 2014) “tourist novels”: Katherine Webb’s *The English Girl* (2016) set in 1950s Oman, and Leah Fleming’s *The Girl under the Olive Tree* (2013), set in Crete. Despite both novels’ accordance with many of the features of the romantic genre, it was argued that their appeal lies in the combination of these formulaic elements with transgressive characterization devices or plot twists, and an evident stress on locale. In particular, *The English Girl* offers a revision of the sheik romance subgenre by proposing a love-triangle between the English woman of the title (based on the pioneer Gertrude Bell), her duplicitous
fiancé and an “Other” modelled largely on Lawrence of Arabia. The desert romance is, literally, with the terrain rather than an Arabian seducer, although there are glimpses of that too. The Girl under the Olive Tree similarly focuses on the splendour of Crete as the true sufferer of the injustice of war. The pull on the historical repercussions of both lines of action (both World Wars and their aftermath are inexhaustible literary referents) is compounded by the authors’ evident interest in presenting the settings in an appealing, “marketable” way (De Groot 2008, 181). Crete has been a favourite British tourist destination for decades, while the lush presentation of Oman strikes an evident chord with the reader. These readers will therefore not only reminisce nostalgically about territories with varying degrees of geopolitical attachment to the UK, but at the same time they will experience vicariously the touristic commercialization of those ethnic cultures, thereby contributing to the rich British tradition that spouses travel, tourism and literature (Teo 2012, 248).

4. Tourism, Exoticism and History in Popular Fiction Set in Ireland

Similar interconnections between tourism, exoticism and historical revision can be found in two “romantic tourist novels” set in Ireland. In particular, the discussion focused on a comparison between two novels which revisit, in different ways, the historical tragic event of the Great Famine in 19th century Ireland: Now and Then, by best-selling North American novelist Jacqueline Sheehan (2009) and Brigid, by Irish Australian author Jill Blee (1999). Now and Then and Brigid follow the clichés of the “tourist novels” analysed by Huggan (2001) in their portrayal of disillusioned female protagonists—the first North American and the second Australian—who travel over to Ireland in their hope to heal previous traumas or to achieve some form of spiritual enlightenment. Cultural difference and exoticism is commodified in these novels in various ways (i.e., the portrayal of exotic romance, the use of nostalgic tropes and the reference to pastoral, idyllic landscapes). As a result, the reader becomes a “reader-cum-explorer” (Rousselot 2014, 7), engaging in a similar “travel experience” as the female protagonists who tour around Ireland and learn about the Great Famine. By consuming this kind of neo-historical fiction, the reader also becomes a kind of “trauma tourist”, witnessing past atrocities and traumatic periods in history from a rather peaceful, accommodating perspective which “demands no responsibility” (Sturken 2007, 13).
5. TOURIST NOVELS, BEACH READS AND BROCHURE LITERATURE

Moving away from the exploitation of history as a form of tourism, the discussion then focused on contemporary “romantic tourist novels” set in Mallorca: *The Vacationers* (2014) by Emma Straub and *The Hen Party* (2017) by Emily Benet. In the protagonists’ appreciation of the landscape, local cuisine and cultural attractions lies an open invitation for the readers to visit the actual destination, potentially turning these novels into tools of touristic promotion. Departing from the classification of these novels as “beach reads”, this part of the session assessed the term to outline what expectations underlie this marketing cue and to what extent the dominant brochure discourse is articulated in the selected novels (Carrigan 2012). In this sense, cover design and reviews offer the first glimpse of this phenomenon and set in motion a repertoire of images associated to the Mediterranean that stress its exoticism and render it as a “paradise of sea, sand, sun and sex” (Mulvey 1996, 109). Yet, the range of characters with different interests and expectations displayed in these two novels allow for new possibilities of representation. Indeed, there is an explicit quest for authenticity which “serves a paradoxical purpose: it grants the tourist the illusion of meaningful contact with the culture while maintaining a careful distance between observer and observed” (Huggan 2001, 198). It is in the eventual suspension of this distance that local concerns are voiced, and the tensions associated to mass tourism emerge.

REFERENCES


James, Rosalind. 2012. *Just This Once*. Amazon Fulfilment.


African and African American Women Writers: Between Violence and Healing

Mar Gallego, Silvia Castro Borrego, María Platas Alonso, Roció Cobo Piñero and María Frías Rudolph

Universidad de Huelva, Universidad de Málaga, Universidad de Vigo, Universidad de Sevilla and Universidad de A Coruña
mar@dfing.uhu.es, scb@uma.es, mplatas@uvigo.es, rociocobo@us.es, maria.frias@udc.es

Abstract

Informed by feminist and intersectional perspectives, but also drawing from body and sexuality, postcolonial and diasporic studies, this round table addresses the recent developments in African and African American cultural production authored by women, who are carrying out a crucial project of self-definition and community-building in the face of severely adverse circumstances. Defying the current prevailing discourse of racial and gender hatred and violence that presides over contemporary US, these women writers articulate a politics of healing and regeneration that aims at re-signifying fundamental categories of humanity and interdependence. Therefore, this round table explores issues of identity formation, and its interaction with notions of trauma and healing.

Keywords: African diaspora, bodies, trauma, healing, intersectionality.

1. Contributions


My paper engages in black sexual politics in 19th century colonial America, specifically about the codes which dictated that mixed race women were

---

1 The authors wish to acknowledge the funding provided by the Spanish Ministry of Science, Innovation and Universities (Research Project “Bodies in Transit 2”, ref. FFI2017-84555-C2-1-P), the European Regional Development Fund, and the Spanish Research Agency for the writing of this essay.
slaves and prostitutes. By means of a textual analysis of Susan Straight’s novel A Million Nightingales (2006), I investigate the portrayal of the tragic mulatta figure by both white and black authors, offering different approaches to hybridity, and the challenge the mulatta poses to the ethics of slavery. It problematizes the idea that American and African American literature could be exclusively white or black in its subject matter, or historical experience, for as Barbara Johnson has argued, “cultures are not containable within boundaries.” Thus, the mulatta deflects from a conception of race that emphasizes the “either/or” approach, representing in someone who is “neither black nor white, yet both” (Sollors).

Straight can be classified within a group of white American women authors who write about the impact of the Black experience from a gender perspective. Among these writers are Sue Monk Kidd and Kathryn Stockett, whose respective novels The Secret Life of Bees (2002), and The Help (2009) have raised a lot of controversy as movies reaching a wider audience, perhaps because of their problematic revision of the “mammie” stereotype, or perhaps because as white women they have dared to “intrude” into the world of female blackness. Not as popular, Straight has gained much attention not only for the craftsmanship of her prose, but for the literary representation of the inner lives of her black female protagonists. Although black scholar H. L. Gates Jr. in his review of I Been in Sorrows Kitchen harshly criticized the Geechee protagonist, Marietta, for having too much dignity, the truth is that Straight constructs characters that defy historical considerations of black women’s sexualities and bodies as deviant, as victims, as disempowered objects, revealing an accurate knowledge of the history of race relations in the US.

1.2 “Free Angela and All Political Prisoners: The Biopic Documentary in Contemporary Black Feminist Reel-volution”, María Platas Alonso

Activist, writer and educator Angela Davis has always raised her voice in defence of the oppressed, especially the ones suffering from the subjugation exerted by the intersections of race, gender and class. She gained her popularity as an influential political author with books like Women, Race and Class (1981), Women Culture and Politics (1989), Are Prisons Obsolete? (2003), or the most recent, Freedom is a Constant Struggle (2016). Active militant of the US Communist Party, her interventions in several documentaries have crucially contributed to highlight her role as prominent Black liberation and prison ab-

The documentary, *Free Angela and All Political Prisoners* (2012), could be attached to the biopic genre as an empowering cinematic narrative tool, increasing in popularity in the 21st century African American feminist cinema. In this documentary, Black American filmmaker Shola Lynch focuses her attention on a particular chapter in Davis’ life: the Marin County courthouse incident in 1970, which ended up with four men dead and Davis put on trial in one of the most sensational court cases of its time. She had been accused of owning the weapons used in the incident. By bringing interviews with Angela Davis and other significant figures of the time together with archival material, Lynch emphasizes the socio-political relevance of a Black woman “whose story has often received short-shrift in comparison with some of her male comrades” (Neal). Thus, the documentary demonstrates that, within African American feminist film theory and criticism, the biopic genre functions as a counter-narrative tool where African American women “own the conventional mythologizing form that once would have been used to marginalize or stigmatize them” (Bingham 18).

1.3 “African Dreams of America: Gendered Diasporic Transits in Mbue, Bulawayo and Selasi”, Rocío Cobo Piñero

This proposal explores three African diasporic novels against the backdrop of gendered diasporic experiences, postcolonialism and racism in the US, as portrayed in the writings of Imbolo Mbue’s *Behold the Dreamers* (2016), NoViolet Bulawayo’s *We Need New Names* (2013) and Taiye Selasi’s *Ghana Must Go* (2013). The mythic narrative of the American Dream (wealth, status and assimilation into the dominant culture) is contested by each writer. Mbue depicts the inaccessibility of the Dream for African migrants, whose dreams are “deferred” (Hughes) or wholly cancelled; Bulawayo recounts the perils of undocumented migration to the US and the othering of a non-inclusive American Dream through a Zimbabwean girl, and Selasi addresses the tensions of how a family of Ghanaian and Nigerian descent cope with the consequences of
achieving the Dream: they realize that it was not created with black people in mind, and that it is gender biased.

This essay also studies the invocation of America in Africa and the processes of mystification. Simon Gikandi associates the constructed fantasy of the international experience while in Africa with Afropolitanism. Gikandi claims that there are two types of Afropolitans: the first can live outside of Africa in their imagination and picture themselves as Afropolitans; the second group is the elites, who have gone to schools in the West (Rask and Rahbek 2016, 49). What makes Bulawayo’s and Mbue’s narrations more complex is their representations of unprivileged Afropolitans, a designation coined by Selasi in 2005 that has been frequently associated with economic success abroad (Dabiri, Sterling). Nevertheless, Selasi’s novel complicates personal success, against the long-lasting effects of traumatic experiences related to race and belonging.

1.4. “The Trope of Rape and the [African American]’s Tale of Housemaids”, María Frías Rudolphi

Afropolitan writer Selasi complains about the recurrent questions “Where are you from”? or “Where are you a local?”—given her African family background (her father is from Ghana, while her mother is from Nigeria), her exclusive transatlantic higher education (Cambridge and Yale University), her healthy but equally expensive ways to keep a balance between body and mind (Yoga retreats in India or Sweden), her choice of fashion designers (whether French or Italian), or her love for European cities where she not only learns the language but chooses to live—albeit for a few years (Rome and Berlin). In her writing the duality/schizophrenia of being both Afropolitan and local seems to be also present in her enthusiastically received first short story “The Sex Lives of African Girls,” where she portrays a family saga where complex female characters abound, but also African men who exhibit their phallocentric power as they do with their flashy cars or golden watches.

What is striking is Selasi’s unapologetic characterization of the “housemaid”—usually the daughter or sister of a poor relative. Forced to move from a rural setting or the crowded outskirts of a big city, the innocent girl is supposed to be embraced by the new family who would provide her with a better home, a much needed education, and the possibility of marrying in style. However, both in fiction and in real life these young girls are used and abused to the
point of exhaustion, dehumanized and exploited not only physically but also sexually. Furthermore, the sophisticated and luminous house becomes hell for the “housemaid” who is victimized both by the licentious husband and by the jealous wife—thus, perpetuating the adulterous triangle of slavery times. The Man of the house is rarely questioned, while the housemaid’s sheer impotence and fear to disgrace her family back in the village forces her to keep quiet. The traumatized housemaid/relative/daughter’s psyche will take time to heal—if ever.

**REFERENCES**

‘Go West, Young Prof!’: Teaching the ‘American West’ in Spanish Universities Today

JUAN IGNACIO GUIJARRO GONZÁLEZ, AMAIA IBARRARAN BIGALONDO*, ÁNGEL CHAPARRO SAINZ* and MONIKA MADINABEITIA MEDRANO

Universidad de Sevilla, *Universidad del País Vasco/Heuskal Erriko Unibertsitatea and Universidad de Mondragón/HUHEZI

jiguijarro@us.es, amaia.ibarraran@ehu.eus, angel.chaparro@ehu.eus, mmadinabeitia@mondragon.edu

Abstract

Teaching is “the subject that dare not speak its name” in Spanish academia, even after the Bolonia process unexpectedly altered our work in the classroom. Regrettably, the field of English Studies is no exception, given that pedagogy remains largely undiscussed and undertheorized both in journals and conferences nationwide. As a recent addition to U.S. Studies in Spain, the field of the ‘American West’ can function as an adequate testing ground to share experiences about how to teach literary, cultural, and historical texts to students who are now fully immersed in audiovisual materials and social networks. The traditional concept of the ‘Old West’, popularized worldwide by western films, has been replaced by the more plural and hybrid ‘New West’, in which former categories of race, class, and gender have become more fluid and open to critical scrutiny by students and professors alike.

Keywords: ‘American West’, pedagogy, Spain, university, ‘New West’.

1. INTRODUCTION

The goal of this round table was to have three experts on the ‘American West’ share insights about experiences teaching it in Spain nowadays. They discussed what texts and/or authors best represent the west of the United States

1 The research carried out for this round table was completed under the auspices of the Research Group REWEST, funded by the Basque Government (IT 1026-16) and the University of the Basque Country, UPV/EHU.
today, and which pedagogical practices can best help our students grasp the complexity of this mythical space.

2. *Dead Man*, or Learning about anOTHER West

Amaia Ibarraran Bigalondo proposed a personal/academic reflection on her experience as a teacher of the fourth-year English Studies course “Other U.S. Literatures”, at the University of the Basque Country. The main aim of the course is to offer students an overview of the literature produced by writers of U.S. ethnic communities who have long been considered the “Other” within the social arrangement of the country and its literary/artistic canon. Among different issues, the class deals with a revision of concepts such as “the Conquest of the West” and the white-Native relationship, paying a special attention to the role of ethnic stereotyping in the construction of contemporary U.S. ethnic relationships. For this purpose, regardless of the fact that the class deals mostly with the analysis, discussion and debate of literary texts, the professor also uses movies, photographs and other types of artistic representations that serve her purpose.

As an example, and starting from the premise that the West and its “supposedly only” inhabitants (both whites and Natives) have been subject to abundant stereotyping and essentialization, mostly by the effect of the Western cinematographic genre, she proposes the analysis of Jim Jarmusch’s film *Dead Man* (1995), together with a selection of Native American literary texts and theoretical approaches to the concept of the “ethnic stereotype,” as a means of encouraging a critical debate among the students on this issue.

The film has a power “impossible to extrapolate from its commentary on history and society. One cannot overlook its acknowledgment of environmental degradation associated with progress, its depiction of an indigenous people’s ambivalence to whites and their encroachment, and its nuanced grasp of violence, particularly gun violence” (Campbell 2004). Therefore, *Dead Man* helps the professor guide students into a personal and academic reflection on the relevance of cinema in general, and the Western genre, in particular, for the creation of the ideology that was transmitted in the notions of “the Conquest of the West” and “Manifest Destiny.” This analysis intends to expose the way the students are guided towards the accomplishment of their own critical revi-
sion of the ‘American West’ in general, and of the cinematographic and literary representation of the Native American community, in particular.

3. **True (or) Grit: Teaching American Culture & History from a Western Perspective Context**

Ángel Chaparro Sainz presented a descriptive exploration of a lesson plan that employs Western themes for the understanding of American identity in the context of a course that aims at developing cultural competence for students in the Translation Studies program. The data and analysis is based on his professional expertise and experience as a teacher of that subject and also as a scholar interested in the ‘American West’, its history and its culture.

Chaparro began by clarifying that this lesson plan takes place in the context of the subject *Historia y Cultura de los Países de Habla B: Inglés* in the Translation Studies degree at the University of the Basque Country. Usually there are 50 students enrolled, with a good command of English but with a short background in Cultural Studies. The text explored in detail is Ethan & Joel Coen’s 2010 western film *True Grit*. Apart from screening it, the lesson plan includes a series of lectures, and activities that occur both before and afterwards.

Before watching the movie, the lesson plan starts with a lecture on the history of the U.S. that goes from the thirteen colonies to Jacksonian America and further, covering also the War of Independence and the Civil War, but focusing finally on the moving West. Issues such as borders and migration are addressed, but the main focus is on the tension between the mythic and romanticized vision of that westward movement and the real facts. Chaparro also provides students with an introductory view on the Western as a genre, both in literature and in films. The next section is the practical one, centered on the screening of the movie and its subsequent analysis, but including as well a former 1969 version by Henry Hathaway, an article on the historicity of some characters, the novel by Charles Portis, interviews, etc. This practical section is usually delivered with a variety of activities that includes writing and oral tasks, whether individually or in group.

Ángel Chaparro believes that the ‘American West’ (and its culture) can be used as the backbone to propose an exploration of the foundational values and specific characteristics forming what one could call the American identity.
The ‘American West’ functions as a perfect pedagogical scenario for such an ambitious exploration.

4. Teaching the Complexity of the Basque American Community in Western States

Monika Madinabeitia Medrano focuses on the historical fact that many Basques were forced to leave their homes and head for America for diverse reasons. Pull and push factors, as well as chain migration, were also common to the Basque experience. Many were obliged to leave their homeland until the death of the dictator Franco in 1975 and the improvement of salaries in the 1970s. Both events clearly influenced the decrease of Basque emigration into the U.S. The thousands of Basques that left their homeland conceive the current community of the Basque diaspora in the ‘American West’.

Many second-generation Basques never visited their parents’ homeland. Most Basques—or Basco, as often derisively called in the ‘American West’—chose to assimilate and blend themselves into the Anglo-Saxon mainstream. They were raised in a Basque environment but were Americanized into the mainstream. They were Basque at home and American outside of it (Bieter and Bieter 2000).

Robert Laxalt favoured the integration of Basques in the West since his Sweet Promised Land (1957) was written at a time when Basques were still not popular in the U.S. Sweet Promised Land was the impulse that Basques had longed for to publicly manifest their ethnic pride. Then came the celebration of the first Western Basque Festival, celebrated in Sparks (Nevada) in 1959, and many other public manifestations that have moulded and shaped the current Basque American identity/ies and their stories and unique biographies.

The experience of the Basque diaspora in the ‘American West’ is valid for the contemporary university students and the community in general to be able to grasp and embrace the contemporary Basque Country. Currently, the Basque Autonomous Community has a 9.4% of immigrant population (data for May 2018) and the trend seems to be increasing.

This diaspora of the ‘American West’ makes Basque students aware of their own history and biography and of what it means to become an immigrant and a member of a diaspora in a foreign country. Literature, music, dance, and
interviews are the core material to try to engage students in understanding migration phenomena. Going West is thus a means to come “home” and try to discover who we are and what we are in the world.

In conclusion, this round table aimed at discussing in public teaching practices, which remain largely invisible in Spanish higher education. Three major scholars in the field of the ‘American West’ shared and exchanged insights and experiences about their pedagogical strategies in the classroom.

REFERENCES


Up for Debate: English Tests in the Spanish University Entrance Exams

Alberto Lázaro Lafuente, Montserrat Martínez Vázquez, Ignacio Palacios Martínez and Marian Amengual Pizarro

Universidad de Alcalá, Universidad Pablo de Olavide, Universidade de Santiago de Compostela and Universitat de les Illes Balears
alberto.lazaro@uah.es, mmarvaz@upo.es, ignacio.palacios@usc.es, marian.amengual@uib.es

Abstract

The content of this contribution is the result of a round table that discussed the current characteristics of English tests in the Spanish University Entrance Exams which, despite the series of acts on education and university entrance regulations enacted in Spain over the last two decades, have not changed much since the 1980s. For instance, they have usually ignored the assessment of oral skills, focusing mainly on reading comprehension, grammar, vocabulary and writing. Paradoxically enough, the curricula for the Bachillerato level have traditionally included objectives for developing listening and speaking skills as the foundation of oral communication. Issues related to the qualities and weaknesses of these tests as well as the role of educational institutions in developing assessment criteria were discussed in this round table.

Keywords: University Entrance Exams, English language tests, oral skills, washback effect, test validity and reliability.

1. Introduction

Much research has been done on the qualities and weaknesses of English tests in the Spanish University Entrance Exams (UEE); however, with the recent Order ECD/1941/2016, which defines the characteristics and the

---

1 See, for instance, Sanz Sainz (1999); Amengual Pizarro (2009); Amengual Pizarro and Méndez García (2012); Fernández Álvarez (2007); Herrera Soler and García Laborda (2005).
contents of the current university entrance exams, this issue is becoming more and more topical. Therefore, some questions could be raised about the way English is being assessed in Spain: What are the main obstacles standing in the way of assessing our students’ level of English in the Spanish UEE? How can we improve their reliability and the consistency of the results obtained? What are the teachers’ and students’ views on the existing situation? To what extent is it possible to include oral skills in these English tests? What are the difficulties involved for teachers, universities or education administrations? How does the distribution of powers between the central state and the autonomous communities affect these English tests? What solutions can be feasibly implemented? These were some of the issues discussed in the round table and served as open questions to engage with the audience.

2. Montserrat Martínez Vázquez: English University Entrance Tests in Spain

Two issues must be addressed in relation to the intense debate over how the UEE should test foreign languages:

1. Do the English foreign language tests assess oral production and comprehension as the Order ECD/1941/2016 dictates?
2. Is it fair that students in Spain take different tests (designed by each autonomous community) when their final grade highly determines admission to university studies nationwide?

An analysis of the 17 English tests elaborated by the different autonomous communities in 2017 showed that most maintain a traditional design, with two common sections: a reading comprehension and a composition. The first ranges from passive true/false answers to much more creative responses (e.g., write a summary using your own words). The number of minimum words required for the composition is also different across communities, as is the weight given to each section. Most tests also assess vocabulary and grammar. Although oral production is not assessed, Galicia, the Balearic Islands and Castilla-La Mancha test pronunciation skills, and a listening comprehension task has been implemented in Catalonia and Galicia. Some communities have also made an
effort to design new sections following a communicative approach, as promoted in primary and secondary schools’ foreign language curricula. For example, students are asked to recreate real communicative situations in writing (e.g., role plays or complete a dialogue) in which they have to improvise specific speech act situations (e.g., apologize, advise, complain), very similar to what they are asked to do in oral exams.

Our initial hypothesis that some tests could be more difficult than others, particularly those demanding more creative responses, was not confirmed by the analysis of the scores obtained by students taking these tests, which were not significantly lower than the results of students taking more traditional tests. However, it was concluded that there are no reasons why English should be tested differently nationwide.

3. Ignacio Palacios Martínez:

Hearing the Teachers’ and Students’ Voices. How Can We Implement the Existing Test?

A questionnaire was administered to a group of 209 teachers and 143 students of Bachillerato (BAC), mostly in Galicia, Spain. Results show that the two groups tend to have similar views regarding the English test in the UEE. They generally believe that students will reach a B1 level at the end of BAC, and agree that only a small amount of time is devoted here to oral skills, to the extent that the methodology used at this level is highly conditioned by the UEE test itself, a finding which is in line with previous studies (Amengual Pizarro 2009). Respondents from both groups also contend that a lot of time is devoted to preparing students for the UEE test overall, and there is broad agreement that students are more concerned about this exam than about improving their English.

The inclusion of a listening component in the university entrance test has been seen positively by both teachers and learners, who also consider that the introduction of an oral part would be beneficial. However, some reservations were voiced in both groups regarding the format and content of the test. In this respect students believe that grammar and vocabulary should carry higher weight. They also note that textbooks are not a great help for preparing them for the test, and teachers on the whole point out that communication
between BAC teachers and university authorities responsible for this test needs to improve. Among the measures that could be taken to improve the existing situation, the following are suggested: establish smaller groups of students and introduce changes into the BAC curriculum; incorporate an oral section; reconsider the question on pronunciation that is currently part of some UEE tests; ensure that the sound quality of recordings in the listening part is of a sufficiently high quality; develop students’ oral skills from the start, that is, from Primary Education to BAC; and finally, provide more training for BAC teachers.

Overall, we can see that these findings are insightful and might usefully be considered for the improvement of current conditions, not least because they come from those actively involved in the teaching and learning process in BAC.

4. Marian Amengual Pizarro:
Promoting the Positive Washback Effect of the English University Entrance Test

Today, there is no denying that high-stakes language tests have an impact, usually referred to as “washback” in the language testing literature, on the teaching and learning that precedes them (Hughes 1989; Green 2013). This section aimed at briefly discussing two main topics of concern related to washback effects:

1. Would the addition of an oral component to the UEE have a positive influence on the promotion of students’ English oral skills?
2. Would the introduction of an oral component in the UEE lead to substantial learning outcomes?

Different research studies (Sanz 1999; Amengual Pizarro 2009) suggest that the English test in the Spanish UEE has a negative washback effect on most classroom tasks and activities since teachers tend to focus on the skills featured in the test, to the exclusion of those other aspects of the curriculum (i.e., speaking and listening skills) that are not tested in this high-stakes test. These test preparation practices are believed to negatively affect the promotion
of students’ oral skills and to discourage most teachers’ communicative approaches to the teaching of English. The addition of a speaking component to the English test is a long-awaited initiative to boost the practice of oral skills in L2 classrooms in order to get students fully prepared to succeed on the test. However, research has shown that washback is not deterministic (Green 2007) and, therefore, no beneficial washback effects can be expected by the simple manipulation of high-stakes tests. In order to effectively improve students’ performance in oral skills and achieve substantial learning outcomes, some efforts should be made to connect tests more closely to communicative teaching practices that truly encourage the development of the skills and abilities intended to be tested. That is, tests should promote the implementation of real communicative activities and the performance of group tasks that foster students’ participation so that L2 learners can gain confidence in using the language and are able to enhance their oral English proficiency. Additionally, further steps should be taken to ensure valid and reliable measurements of students’ performance by making use of detailed scoring criteria and by providing training for raters in order to increase rater reliability and to help to promote the positive washback effects of the English test.

REFERENCES


A Comprehensive Approach to Restoration Prose Fiction

Tomás Monterrey, Sonia Villegas-López and María José Coperías-Aguilar

Universidad de La Laguna, Universidad de Huelva and Universidad de Valencia
jmonterr@ull.es, villegas@uhu.es, Maria.J.Coperias@uv.es

Abstract

This round table presents work in progress, deriving from the Project “Early novel in English, 1660–1700: Database and Textual Editing” (ENEID),¹ in which the above participants are committed to fix and study the corpus of Restoration prose fiction by developing two different tasks: the selection and analysis of the corpus that will be added to a database, from which they expect to retrieve a comprehensive picture of the origins of the English novel, and the publication of updated editions of some selected works. In the belief that multiplicity and variety constitute two relevant traits of Restoration prose, they propose an overview of the fiction of the period from the related approaches of narrative technique, publishing and bookselling, and reading reception with a focus on women.

Keywords: Restoration, prose fiction, narrative technique, publishing and bookselling, women and readership.

As Chair, Sonia Villegas introduces the defining features of Restoration prose fiction, tackling its transnational nature and the constant flow of translation, the variety of authors involved, most of them non-canonical, and the diversity of genres concerned, ranging from heroic romances to picaresque novels, seduction stories, or travel narratives, to name just a few. These aspects,

¹ The participants are indebted to the Ministry of Economy, Industry and Competitiveness for the funding of the ENEID Project (Proyecto de Investigación de Excelencia, FFI2017-82728-P).
together with the random naming of the texts either as “history”, “romance” or “novel,” suggest that in the last decades of the seventeenth century, the novel was still a form in the making.

After this, Tomás Monterrey is concerned with the analysis of narrative enunciation in early Restoration fiction (1660–1670) in light of formalist, structuralist narratology. He refers to Gerd Bayer’s examination of the author-narrator relationship in Novel Horizons, where he argues that it took some time for writers to come to terms with the separate, distinct narrative voice, which characterises the mature realist novel, and that Restoration fictions “present narrating in a nascent stage” (2016, 154). Indeed, early Restoration authors worked within the limits of a particular genre or narrative model, but aspired to refine narrative verisimilitude, although depictions of reality are generally avoided except for roguish and criminal stories.

In this respect, homodiegetic narrators conveyed the highest degree of credibility. For example, in Neville’s Isle of Pines (1668), Pine’s memoirs are given authenticity by van Sloetten’s letter, whose claim is reinforced by the addition of Keek’s letters, devoid of any framing extradiegetic voice, except for the editor’s summary on the title page. The original readers of Head’s The English Rogue (1664) believed it was the author’s autobiography. The accounts of real criminals’ lives are told by unnamed intradiegetic-heterodiegetic voices who claim to know the truth, gather testimonies, possess evidences, and witness executions. In The Memoires of Monsieur Du Vall (1670), the narrator results as arresting as the criminal for his harsh criticism of Francophiles. The heterodiegetic narrators of English romances imitating the models of La Calprenède and Scudéry are not omniscient, but characterised by human-like limitations. They are usually superseded by characters—either protagonists or privileged witnesses—who remember the events more accurately, and who deliver their tales to other characters as intra-diegetic narratees. Only translated works such as The Princess of Monpensier (1666) or The Cimmerian Matron (1668) bear close resemblance to later modern novels related by heterodiegetic narrators.

Another aspect associated with techniques of narrative verisimilitude (and limited omniscience) is the pervasive external perspective: characters are seldom shown in their private realm and their minds are rarely introspected but rendered in actions, gestures, soliloquies, dialogues, and letters.

Adopting Bayer’s reading of the Derridean notion of the “archive” (2016, 50), Sonia Villegas proposes a comprehensive approach to the corpus of Resto-
ration fiction. She claims that the multiplicity of texts—of forms, of authors, and styles—represents the experimentation and eclecticism of Restoration prose fiction. The mixture of the high and the low characterizes the fiction of these four decades, but especially the works of the 1680s and 1690s. This combination of forms, in particular those of history and fiction, produced hybrid texts. Villegas argues that in this hybridity and in the type of action, lies the “modernity” of the new fiction.

A great deal of information about the period can be extracted from a look at the agents of literary publication: authors, printers and booksellers. One of the most popular booksellers of the period was Richard Bentley (1645–1697), called by John Dunton “novel Bentley”, because of his preference for novels. An associate of James Magnes, his wife and daughter, Bentley’s most prolific years were the 1680s. His audience was composed mainly of male and female readers of the leisure classes. For them, Bentley compiled in 1692 the unsold copies of most of the novels he had previously published, binding them together into twelve volumes, *Modern Novels*. In so doing, he was a pioneer in binding and selling in serial form. He collected forty-eight texts, and to some of the volumes he dedicated more care than to others. He did not seek uniformity, but variety, and interspersed novels that had sold well with other less known. Bentley looked for thematic unity, though the volumes differed in the generic nature of the stories, volume length, and in the coherence of their presentation. His readers were keen on consuming novels about love in sundry variations, scandalous stories, and fictional accounts of relevant historical characters. *Modern Novels* fits to perfection the image of the Restoration archive, which testifies to a great generic change. Its variety is didactic as well as informative of what the new form of the novel might represent for a tradition that still relied on foreign texts, but which added native specimens progressively.

Actually, as explored by María José Coperías by focusing on the role of readers—specifically women—as consumers but also as producers of texts, the increase in the number of all kind of documents written in English in the seventeenth century is the result of higher literacy rates in the vernacular language. So far, mostly men from the upper classes or going into religious life had been educated in Latin; however, from the late fifteenth century onwards new learning opportunities, now mainly in English, were open to a wider range of classes and also across genders (Altick 1997, 17). The fact that women were educated only in English influenced the production of books in that language, as well
as the development of some kind of female literature (Bell 2002, 444). In the second half of the sixteenth century, women were recognized as constituting a specific readership and, for instance, chivalric adventures were often replaced by love and courtship in romances addressed to women (Flint 1993, 22).

Even if women often acquired passive rather than active literacy, that is, the ability to read only (Stevenson 2012, 338), women writers were a relatively common feature on the seventeenth-century literary and cultural scene. Although some women might have suffered the publication stigma and thought that seeking an audience through print was inappropriate, many others found their own strategies to justify their writing. An extended alternative practice at the time was the circulation of women’s writing by means of manuscripts (Bell 2002, 432; Burke 2009, 54), which in turn contributed to what Ezell (1999) has defined as social authorship. Thus, a manuscript became a medium for social exchange and a way in which women could come together and be supportive of the literary activities of their peers.

Women also played an important part in book trade. Printing, binding and bookselling were domestic activities and, consequently, women were a constant presence since the trade premises were often also their homes (Bell 2002, 440). As seen above in the case of Magnes and his association with Bentley, the wives and daughters of many printers might become heavily involved in the bookselling and publishing trade. And although women were mostly responsible for shop keeping or the supervision of apprentices, some of them could also be found composing and printing, as well as editing.

REFERENCES


